1ST INTERNATIONAL CONFERENCE ON
SOCIAL SCIENCES
AND ARTS 2019
“Social transformations and Cultural Dialogues”

17TH – 18TH OCTOBER 2019
HOTEL TRANSIT, KUALA LUMPUR,
MALAYSIA

CONFERENCE PROCEEDINGS

socialscienceconferences.com
Conference Proceeding
International Conference on Social Sciences & Arts – 2019
(Social Conf 2019)
Disclaimer

The responsibility for opinions expressed, in articles, studies and other contributions in this publication rests solely with their authors, and this publication does not constitute an endorsement by the Social Conf or IAR Conferences of the opinions so expressed in them.

Official website of the conference

http://socialscienceconferences.com/

Conference Proceeding of the International Conference on Social Sciences and Arts – 2019

Edited by Rekheetha Pathiranage, Shanika De Silva and Others

ISSN 2613-8654

Copyright @ Institute of Academic Researchers
All rights are reserved according to the code of intellectual property act of Sri Lanka, 2003

Published by Institute of Academic Researchers (IAR Conferences)

Tel: +94(0) 11 4862623
Hosted By:
IAR Conferences

Organized by:
IAR Conferences

Academic partners:
Vietnam National University in HCMC, Vietnam
Tunku Abdul Rahman University College, Malaysia

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Conf 2019 Committee</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PROF. BEENA GIRIDHARAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Curtin University, Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROF. NGUYEN-THI HONG-XOAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The University of Social Sciences and Humanities, Vietnam National University in HCMC, Vietnam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROF. DR. ANANDA KUMAR PALANIAPPAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tunku Abdul Rahman University College, Malaysia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROF. NGUYEN-THI HONG-XOAN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vietnam National University in HCMC, Vietnam</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DR. BRITTANY BOUNDS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas A&amp;M University, Qatar</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DR. JOAN ELIZABETH WOOTTON</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pioneer School Worcester, Western Cape, South Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DR. FARID MOHAMMAD QAWASMEH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jadara University, Jordan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROF.(DR.) TAPAN KUMAR SHANDILYA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indian Economic Association, India</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Editorial Board – Social Conf - 2019

Editor in Chief
Prof. Beena Giridharan, Curtin University, Malaysia

Editorial Board
Mr. Rekheetha Pathiranage and Shanika De Silva, IAR Conferences, Sri Lanka

The Editorial Board is not responsible for the content of any abstract.

Scientific Committee – Social Conf - 2019

Dr. A. Nagarathna, National Law School of India, University Nagarbhavi, India
Dr. Adam Andani Mohammed, University Malaysia Sarawak, Malaysia
Asso. Prof. Dr. Ahi Sarok, Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, Malaysia
C. D. Sebastian, IIT Bombay, India
Dr. Deepti Taneja, Delhi College of Arts and Commerce, India
Dr. Mashitah Binti Hamidi, University of Malaya, Malaysia
Usman Khalid, University of Nottingham, Malaysia
Dr. Akiko Sugiyama, *University of Malaya, Malaysia*

Dr. Halimatun Sa’adiah Binti Abdul Manap, *Tunku Abdul Rahman University College, Malaysia*

Cik Radziah Binti Nasir, *Tunku Abdul Rahman University College, Malaysia*

Dr. Marzita Binti Mohamed Noor, *Tunku Abdul Rahman University College, Malaysia*

Dr. Lai Chooi Seong, *Tunku Abdul Rahman University College, Malaysia*

Dr. Elena Gregoria Chai Chin Fern, *Universiti Malaysia Sarawak, Malaysia*

Dr. Muhammad Febriansyah, *Universiti Sains Malaysia, Malaysia*

Dr. M.K. Ramesh, *National Law School of India, University Nagarbhavi, India*

Dr. Haslina Binti Muhamad, *University of Malaya, Malaysia*

Assoc. Prof. Stanley Bye Kadam Kiai, *University Malaysia Sarawak, Malaysia*

Dr. Ch’ng Kean Siang, *University Sains Malaysia, Malaysia*

Dr. Prabhat Kumar Saha, *Banaras Hindu University, India*

Dr. Montakarn Chuemchit, *Chulalongkorn University, Thailand*

Dr. Eser Selen, *Kadir Has University, Istanbul, Turkey*

Dr. Deepa Sirinivas, *University of Hyderabad, India*

Prof. Polly Vauquiline, *Gauhati University, India*

Dr. Nagendra Kumar, *Banaras Hindu University, India*

Dr. Jyoti Bawane, *Indian Institute of Education Pune, India*

Asst. Prof. Vighnarajah, *UCSI University, Malaysia*
# Table of Contents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Page No</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>01.</td>
<td>Green Practices of the Hotel Industry in Cagayan de Oro, Philippines: Proposed Implications to an Environmentally Appropriate Program</td>
<td>Raquel J. Dael, DM &amp; Raquel A. Saab, DM</td>
<td>1-10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>03.</td>
<td>A Shift-Share Analysis of the Manufacturing Employment at uMhlathuze Local Municipality</td>
<td>M. Ndovela, S. Zhou &amp; S. Nhlabathi</td>
<td>22-37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>05.</td>
<td>Evaluation of Food Labelling Awareness among Consumers and Framework Design: A Review</td>
<td>K. Perumal &amp; B.Balakrishnan</td>
<td>48-60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>06.</td>
<td>Women’s Journey through the Debris of Partition of India: Patriarchal Structure and Legal Challenges</td>
<td>V. S. Chhetri</td>
<td>61-68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>07.</td>
<td>Motivating Factors and Its Impact to the Students to Finish Industrial Engineering Program at Quezon City Polytechnic University</td>
<td>A. M. B. Novesteras &amp; N. C. Apusaga</td>
<td>69-80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>08.</td>
<td>Impact of Electronic Control (E-control) on Employees’ Performance in Jordanian Banks</td>
<td>F. M. Qawasmeh &amp; E. F. Qawasmeh</td>
<td>81-92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09.</td>
<td>The World Café in Creating a Culture of Marketing at a Private Institution of Higher Learning: A Case Study</td>
<td>Carol Sutcliffe</td>
<td>93-111</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
GREEN PRACTICES OF THE HOTEL INDUSTRY IN CAGAYAN DE ORO, PHILIPPINES: PROPOSED IMPLICATIONS TO AN ENVIRONMENTALLY APPROPRIATE PROGRAM

Raquel J. Dael, DM & Raquel A. Saab, DM

Lourdes College, raquel_0475@yahoo.com & saabraquel@yahoo.com

Abstract: This study explores the extent of awareness and participation on green practices among personnel of the hotel industry in a city in Mindanao. Green practices cover energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, air quality management, solid waste disposal management and noise control management. A total of 88 personnel from the eight DOT (Department of Tourism) accredited hotels in the city participated in the study. The research instrument was crafted based from various sources. Findings show that the participants’ awareness is on the “much aware” level only and their extent of participation is also on the “great extent” only which implies that there is still room for improvement in the green practices among such establishments. Among the variables, water and liquid and waste management, air quality management, and solid waste disposal and management got the highest mean rating. While noise pollution control got the lowest mean rating. This study further reveals that their awareness is significantly associated with their practice. Thus, the results of this study provide tourism sectors the need for an environmentally appropriate programs that will direct the hotel industry to a green hotel standard guidelines, furthermore it could also be a baseline data of the current status of the green practices among hotels, which may have future implications on the possibility of crafting environmentally appropriate programs on energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, air quality management, solid waste disposal management, and noise control management to strengthen the implementation of green practices in the hotel industry in the city.

Keywords: green practices, hotel industry

Introduction

The production of a huge amount of waste and other pollution in the environment has always been unbecoming. It is in this regard that the prevalence of environmental issues become the interest of many due to the deterioration of the natural physical environment. Piagran (2005) believes that tourism can certainly contribute to environmental degradation. Hence, it is important to ensure that tourism is well managed and performed through green practices.

Green practices, otherwise known as environmentally friendly practices, have become familiar to consumers. Cognizant of the increasing number of visitors in the city and the consumption of natural resources, environmental problems are also arising. As cited by Xie and Bren (2012) awareness of environmental issues such as global warming, carbon emissions, toxic substance usage and resource scarcity strengthened policy makers to support green practices, specifically, among the hospitality sector.

Around the world, the concept of green tourism has been adopted and has become a global phenomenon. However, in the Philippines, there is no strict standard yet being established to monitor and assess green activity in the hotel industry. Although there are few lodging establishments already recognized as Green hotels by international certification body such as that of the Association of Southeast Asian Nation (ASEAN) (DOT Recognizes RP's Asean Green Hotels, 2010); however, the implementation of the concept of greening in the Philippine setting has been sort of an internal organizational effort for purposes of branding and creating market positions to some (Edralin &
The greening of the hospitality industry provides many benefits that include: financial benefits, the consciousness on the sustainability of the environment, and the changing attitudes of tourists towards sustainable tourism. However, making a property green is not an easy undertaking. According to J. Rathore and D. Gawankor (2009), it involves a lot of teamwork, skills, dedication and initial investments by the hotel group. He stressed that although hotel chains have a basic idea about green practices, the need for a specific guideline to go green is indispensable.

Many issues concerning environmental impact, degradation, and sustainability have been confronting the hotel industry today, and the tourism sector cannot just ignore this trending global landscape on greening. Thus, given this context, the study seeks to examine the extent of awareness and the extent of participation on green practices of the hotel industry in the city of Cagayan de Oro. The findings of the study may have implications on the possibility of crafting environmentally appropriate programs for the players of the industry such as hotels, restaurants and tourism organizations in the city to undergird the green tourism advocacy.

This study acknowledged the efforts of the lodging establishments towards greening hotel operations in the city in their aim to provide guests with an eco-friendly environment.

Framework

The study assumes that hotel employees’ awareness of green practices in the hospitality industry determines the extent of their green practice.

This assumption is anchored on the theory of planned behavior by Ajzen (1991) which gives emphasis on the personal behaviors and knowledge of persons governed by social pressures and sense of control. The planned behavior theory espoused that the employees’ attitudes and behaviour is governed by the choices they make (Ajzen, 1985 & Ajzen, 1991 & Ajzen & Fishbein, 2005). Moreover, it argues that behavior is dependent on one’s intention to perform the behavior where the latter is determined by an individual’s attitude (beliefs and values about the outcome of the behavior) and subjective norms (beliefs about what other people think the person should do or general social pressure).

A study by M. Noor Abu Hassan, et al. (2015) on the exploration of the environmental behavior using the planned behavior theory indicated that the more favorable the attitude is, the stronger an individual’s intention to perform the behavior under consideration. Likewise, the importance of attitude, subjective norm and perceived behavioral control in the prediction of intention, is expected to vary across behaviors and situation.

The basic assumption of the study is presented in the schematic presentation of the interplay of variables. Figure 1 shows the interplay of the different variables on the study.
Objective of the Study

This study aims to find out the extent of awareness towards green practices and the extent of participation among hotels in the city. Specifically, it determined the following: (1) the participant’s extent of awareness towards green practices of the hospitality industry in terms of “Green” energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, air quality management, solid waste disposal and management and noise pollution control; (2) the extent of participation on the green practices in the hospitality industry; (3) the association between the level of awareness towards green practices of the hospitality industry with the extent of practice. Results of the study may be utilized as baseline data which may have implications to the possibility of crafting environmentally appropriate programs will have future implications for the crafting of environmentally appropriate programs customized to the hotel industry.

Methods

This research used the descriptive-correlational method designed to examine the relationship between two or more quantifiable variables without any attempt of manipulation. In this study, the relationship of the participants’ extent of awareness and participation on hotel green practices are, thus, identified.

There are eighty-eight (88) participants of the study who are supervisors and entry level employees of select DOT accredited hotels in Cagayan de Oro City. Survey questionnaire using the Likert scaling were given personally to participants understudy. The questionnaire was adapted from various sources such as the Green Practice survey of Sun-Hwa Kim (2005), Hotel sustainability survey instrument of Rathore et al. (2009) and from the research questionnaire on Adoption of green practices in hospitality and tourism industry of A.M.A. Fadhil (2015) and the survey questionnaire on green practices of the DOT. All of these instruments were restructured to examine the aspects of green practices in the hospitality industry.

To ensure the internal consistency of the items, the questionnaire was subjected to a pilot test given to 35 participants, and results revealed Cronbach alpha values from 0.90 to 0.93 in the items on the various components of green practices and the most acceptable range for the reliability measure is between 0.70 to 0.99. Thus the items were found to be internally consistent. After the administration of the instruments, the data were retrieved by the researchers and were organized and analyzed using appropriate statistical treatments.

Results and Discussion

The results of the study on green practices in the hotel industry are presented in the tables that follow.

One of the most significant areas of environmental management is energy saving because hotel operational areas in general consume electricity and fossil fuel. Thus, practices on energy efficiency in the hotel industry are examined.

Table 1 presents the participant’s extent of awareness and practice of the green energy consumption in the hotel industry. When the mean ratings among indicators were considered, the highest means were on the participants’ awareness of the setting of appropriate temperature in back of the house (3.32), and on their extent of practice on the use of environmentally friendly and biodegradable products (3.11). On the other hand, the lowest mean ratings were on their awareness of the use of local products such as food (3.0), and their practice on the use of automatic sensor lighting on property (2.67)
Table 1. Frequency, Percentage and Mean Distribution of Participants’ Extent of Awareness and Practice towards Green Practices (Energy Consumption)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Extent of Awareness</th>
<th>Extent of Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Interpretation</td>
<td>F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.51-4.00</td>
<td>Very Much Aware</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.51-3.50</td>
<td>Much Aware</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.51-2.50</td>
<td>Moderately Aware</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.00-1.50</td>
<td>Not Aware</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Overall Mean: Extent of Awareness = 3.12, Extent of Practice = 2.86

SD: Extent of Awareness = 0.53, Extent of Practice = 0.84

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Extent of Awareness</th>
<th>Extent of Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Conduct of awareness programs/activities on environmental protection for the staff</td>
<td>M=3.19, Int=0.81, SD=2.75</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Provision of a policy or a regulation on:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1. Encouraging the use of local products such as food (minimum purchase of 20%) and 30% across all organic suppliers within the region; and</td>
<td>M=3.00, Int=0.90, SD=2.78</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2. Use of environmentally friendly and biodegradable products;</td>
<td>M=3.07, Int=1.01, SD=3.11</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. The use of green seal certified sustainable cleaning products, materials and equipment such as laundry products, micro fiber cloths and dual motor vacuum cleaners</td>
<td>M=3.16, Int=0.87, SD=3.01</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Regularity of cleaning air conditioning units for twice a year to prevent growth of bacteria</td>
<td>M=3.10, Int=1.03, SD=2.92</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Use of electronic key card in guestrooms</td>
<td>M=3.11, Int=0.95, SD=2.91</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. The use of automatic sensor lighting on property</td>
<td>M=3.00, Int=1.03, SD=2.67</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. The use of energy star rated equipment such as: refrigerator, copier, etc.</td>
<td>M=3.14, Int=0.79, SD=2.89</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Provision of access to natural light and views of outdoors in regularly occupied spaces including offices, conference rooms, functions rooms, laundry areas, and kitchen.</td>
<td>M=3.08, Int=0.83, SD=2.90</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9. Setting of appropriate temperature in back of the house (office, kitchen, etc.)</td>
<td>M=3.32, Int=0.77, SD=3.0</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.05</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10. Provision of energy-saving friendly reminders in strategic places such as: guest rooms and advertisement boards to encourage clients to save energy</td>
<td>M=3.14, Int=0.85, SD=2.91</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11. The use of Compact Fluorescent Lamp</td>
<td>M=3.05, Int=0.90, SD=2.78</td>
<td>M=Great extent, Int=1.06</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
On the whole, results show that participants are “much aware” (3.12) of the green energy consumption practices and to a “great extent” (2.86) have implemented them in the hotel industry. It is evident that hotels in the city are observing green energy saving practices considering that this is one of the most significant areas of environmental management. However, results further suggest that there is a mean difference between extent of awareness and practice, with “awareness” being the highest. The underlying reason for this difference may be due to the fact that exploring sustainability in the industry is not an easy task. According to a study of J. Rathore and D. Gawankor (2009), transforming a property green involves teamwork, skills, dedication, and a lot of initial investments by the hotel. They further argue that while hotel chains have a basic idea about green practices, they need specific guidelines to go green in a comprehensible manner. Thus, findings of this study have implications for hotels to establish mechanisms to ensure that green energy consumption practices are effectively implemented.

Hotels, depending on its standard, type of facility and services, may have high consumption of water, which must be managed well. Hence, this study has examined green practices on water efficiency and conservation among hotels in the city. Table 2 shows the extent of awareness and extent of participation on green practices considering water and liquid waste management. The overall mean ratings showed that participants rated slightly higher their awareness (3.04) than their participation (2.91) in the water and liquid waste management practices. Although this result show evidence of the participants’ observance of green practices in the area of water conservation; however, the overall mean difference between awareness and practice may have implications for hotels to review and intensify the implementation of existing water conservation practices. As noted by A. Kasim (2013) hotels consume large amounts of water and should therefore be managed and controlled well, for if not, this will likely lead to water shortages and may lead to another impact of water contamination.

Table 2: Frequency, Percentage and Mean Distribution of Participants’ Extent of Awareness and Practice towards Green Practices (Water and Liquid Waste Management)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.51-4.0</td>
<td>Very Much Aware</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>26.14</td>
<td>Very Great Extent</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>25.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.51-3.5</td>
<td>Much Aware</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>47.73</td>
<td>Great Extent</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>48.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.51-2.5</td>
<td>Moderately Aware</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>26.14</td>
<td>Some Extent</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>23.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.00-1.5</td>
<td>Not Aware</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>No Extent</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>88</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td>88</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.04</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.91</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Interpretation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Much Aware</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Great Extent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2 shows the extent of awareness towards green practices on water and liquid waste management. The overall mean is 3.042 which is interpreted as much aware. Of the 88 participants, 23 or 26.14% is very much aware of the green practices on water and liquid waste management, 42 or 47.73% is much aware, 23 or 26.14 is moderately aware and 0% is not aware. Among the items, no. 11 was rated as the highest mean of 3.41 rating implying that the participants are aware of the conduct of annual cleaning of potable water tanks and testing of water quality. However, among the items, item no. 2 with a mean rating of 2.80 indicating that the use of native plants for landscaping may minimize water consumption has the lowest rate. This would reinforce the study of Yusof et al. (2013) where the use of rain water to minimize water consumption is rarely applied.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Extent of Awareness</th>
<th>Extent of Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of the towel and linen reuse program in guestrooms</td>
<td>3.16</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of minimal water usage for the laundry machines</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Utilization of rain water for reuse</td>
<td>3.03</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The use of native plants for landscaping to minimize water consumption</td>
<td>2.80</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Installation of “low-flow” (controlled flow) indoor plumbing fixtures in bathrooms (toilets and shower heads) and kitchens (sinks) to reduce water use</td>
<td>2.92</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision for recycling of waste water</td>
<td>2.84</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of “Save Water” signs in kitchen and back office areas for awareness</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Installation of grease trap system in the kitchen, restaurant and grease contaminated area</td>
<td>2.95</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provision of waste water treatment system suitable for the size and activities of the hotel</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of the maintenance plan of sanitary ware / water saving equipment, including the checking of leak water area</td>
<td>3.33</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conduct of annual cleaning of potable water tanks and monthly testing of water quality to prevent water contamination and reduction of waste water generation through automatic sensor faucets, automatic sensor flush</td>
<td>3.41</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Furthermore, when the extent of awareness and practice on specific indicators were considered, results show highest mean ratings on the participants’ awareness on the conduct of annual cleaning of potable water tanks and testing of water quality (3.41), and their practice on the installation of grease trap system in the kitchen, restaurant and grease contaminated area (3.13). It can also be noticed that the use of native plants for landscaping to minimize water consumption were found to have the lowest mean ratings in the extent of awareness (2.80) and practice (2.60). These low mean ratings may be attributed to the fact that such practice may not be so widely known to hotels in the city as good water conservation practice.

Table 3 on the next page, presents the frequency, percentage and mean distribution of the participant’s extent of awareness and practice of the air quality management in the hotel industry. As revealed in this study, participants are “much aware” (3.63) of the no-smoking policy throughout the property, which they also practiced to a “great extent” (3.06). The high rating in this area may be due to the participants’ heightened awareness and the country’s strict implementation of the Republic Act on no smoking policy. This result reinforces the study of I. Rahman (2012) stating that legitimization or compliance with the environmental regulation is one of the reasons that forces the lodging industry to exercise green practices in their operation.

It can be elicited further that the use of low-emitting carpets and adhesives to minimize harmful toxins in its indoor air (2.93) received the lowest mean rating in terms of awareness, while keeping of relative humidity at certain level to prevent the growth of mold (2.68) received the lowest mean rating in terms of extent of practice. Generally, results indicate that

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 3: Frequency, Percentage and Mean Distribution of Participants’ Extent of Awareness and Practice towards Green Practices (Air Quality Management)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Indicators</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Implementation of No-Smoking policy throughout the property for indoor air quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Placement of green live plants on property for the quality of indoor air</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keeping of relative humidity at certain level to prevent the growth of mold (e.g. 35-60% in FL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Establishment of measures to</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Interpretation: Much Aware, Great Extent
- SD: Standard Deviation
reduce carbon emissions from air conditioning units, exhaust fans, refrigerators, cooking equipment and the like

5 The use of low-emitting carpets and adhesives to minimize harmful toxins in its indoor air
5 2.93 Much aware 0.98 2.99 Great extent 0.99

6 The use of biodegradable cleaning products
6 3.02 Much aware 1.12 2.92 Great extent 1.15

7 Installation of air purifiers in guest rooms, banquet halls and restaurants to ensure guests and staff are exposed to clean air
7 3.25 Much aware 0.65 2.89 Great extent 1.03

8 Provision of building design that allows passage of natural air and ventilation
8 3.26 Much aware 0.58 2.95 Great extent 0.98

9 Regular monitoring and maintenance of equipment and hotel facilities such as: generators and air conditioning systems, to ensure air quality
9 3.50 Much aware 0.69 3.05 Great extent 1.11

0 Conduct of daily dusting and vacuuming of all soft furnishings
0 3.28 Much aware 0.91 2.95 Great extent 1.08

participants were “much aware” (3.22) of the air quality management approaches and to a “great extent” (2.92) practiced them in the industry. Very noticeable is the overall mean difference between extent of awareness and extent of practice. The low mean rating in the overall extent of practice may be attributed to the impact of sustaining air quality on the hotels’ operational costs. In the study conducted by Z. Yusofab and M. Jamaludinb (2013) on “green approaches of Malaysian Hotels” indicated that among the green practices, it is air quality management which has the least participation among hotels because of its impact on cost of operations.

Considering the results of this study, the hotel industry is thus challenged to review its existing operations to effectively incorporate sustainable air quality practices, as the quality of indoor environment has impact on guest comfort as well as on work productivity.

Table 4 shows the frequency, percentage and mean distribution of the participant’s extent of awareness and practice of the solid waste disposal and management practices. Among the indicators, the highest mean ratings were on the participants’ awareness on the implementation of reduced food waste through proper food storage (3.41), and the extent of practice on the training of staff in the principles of safety and hygiene particularly on correct food storage (3.03) and the implementation of reducing food waste through proper food storage (3.03). To consider that most of the hotels under study provide food service apart from lodging services, more emphasis has been placed on the practice of ensuring proper food storage. Data further show that the lowest mean ratings were on the participants’ awareness on the recycling of solid waste materials (2.94) and their extent of practice on the use of eco-friendly alternatives to packaging (2.69). However, the findings reveal that generally participants were “much aware” (3.21) of the solid waste disposal and management approaches and to a “great extent” (2.92) practiced them in the hotel industry. As noted by A. Kasim (2003) the accumulation of waste is one of the most visible effects on the environment. He argued that wastes generated by hotels do not only increase operational costs but contribute to resource depletion. Thus, this imply that hotels should intensify implementation of sustainable waste management practices so as to help lessen its impact to the environment.
Table 4: Frequency, Percentage and Mean Distribution of Participants’ Extent of Awareness & Practice towards Green Practices

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Extent of Awareness</th>
<th>Extent of Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Encouragement for the involvement of hotel staff in waste reduction, reuse, recycling, waste segregation and composting program</td>
<td>3.16 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>1.02 2.94 Great extent 1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Communication through public announcement or in-house activities to encourage hotel guests in the reuse, recycling, and waste segregation program</td>
<td>3.05 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.90 2.84 Great extent 0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Recycling of toiletries such as: soaps, shampoos, conditioners, and toilet papers, if not reused</td>
<td>3.07 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.98 2.85 Great extent 1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Segregation of wastes before they are recycled</td>
<td>3.26 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.85 2.99 Great extent 1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Provision of adequate recycle bins for waste recycling</td>
<td>3.22 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.78 2.94 Great extent 1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Utilization of reusable cloth napkins, glass cups, and ceramic dishes, rather than disposable ones</td>
<td>3.11 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.90 2.84 Great extent 1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Recycling of solid waste materials like aluminum cans, card boards, plastics, paper, metals and glass bottles</td>
<td>2.94 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>1.01 2.91 Great extent 1.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 Implementation of paperless policy including use of electronic software or system such as: Ecopy, email, etc.</td>
<td>3.18 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.85 2.84 Great extent 1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 The use of eco-friendly alternatives to packaging</td>
<td>3.07 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.93 2.69 Great extent 1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10 Training of staff in the principles of food safety and hygiene hand such as:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.1 Hand washing</td>
<td>3.26 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.86 3.01 Great extent 1.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.2 Correct food storage</td>
<td>3.40 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.78 3.03 Great extent 1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.3 Food handling</td>
<td>3.35 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.77 2.94 Great extent 1.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.4 Service of food items</td>
<td>3.28 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.83 2.97 Great extent 1.11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11 Implementation of the ff. to reduce food waste:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.1 Proper food storage</td>
<td>3.41 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.78 3.03 Great extent 1.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.2 Food handling</td>
<td>3.31 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.82 2.92 Great extent 1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.3 Service of food</td>
<td>3.32 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.82 2.97 Great extent 1.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 Implementation of ecologically based pest control practices to identify and eliminate pests</td>
<td>3.20 Mean Much aware</td>
<td>0.90 2.91 Great extent 1.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 5 shows the frequency, percentage and mean distribution of the participants’ extent of awareness on the green practices on noise pollution control. Of the indicators, participants were found to have the highest mean ratings on the set-up of maximum sound levels for music systems and TVs in public areas both in terms of awareness (3.14) and practice (2.94). Result suggests that hotels in the city are aware of the importance of controlling the noise pollution so as to ensure customer satisfaction. As pointed out by Jerrie Hsieh, (2010), noise pollution is one of the major complaints of hotel guests and therefore has to be reduced for the benefit of one’s personal well-being. This study further revealed lowest mean ratings on the participants’ extent of awareness on the installation of sound absorbing barriers underneath bath taps (2.82), and their extent of practice on the replacement of toilet flush valve with quiet flush tanks (2.65). The low rating of these practices may stem from the fact that these have cost implications in the operations.

Table 5: Frequency, Percentage and Mean Distribution of Participants’ Extent of Awareness and Participation towards Green Practices (Noise Pollution Control)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Range</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>%</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
<th>F</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.51-4.00</td>
<td>Very Much Aware</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>35.23</td>
<td>Very Great Extent</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>30.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.51-3.50</td>
<td>Much Aware</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>53.41</td>
<td>Great Extent</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>46.59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.51-2.50</td>
<td>Moderately Aware</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>10.23</td>
<td>Some Extent</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9.09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.00-1.50</td>
<td>Not Aware</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>No Extent</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13.64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>88</td>
<td>100</td>
<td></td>
<td>88</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall Mean</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.92</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td></td>
<td>0.62</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Frequency, Percentage and Mean Distribution of Participants’ Extent of Awareness and Participation towards Green Practices (Noise Pollution Control)
On a general note, data show that participants are “much aware” (2.94) of the noise pollution control practices, and to a “great extent” practiced these approaches in the lodging industry. However, the “much aware” and “great extent” ratings do not speak well of effective implementation of green practices; thus, hotels may re-examine their surrounding environment to consider the noise pollution control practices for the benefit and well-being of both guests and employees (Erkan Kalipci, Serkan Sahnkaya, 2011).

Table 6 shows the summary of the participant’s extent of awareness and participation on the green practices on water and liquid waste, green energy consumption, air quality management, solid waste disposal and noise pollution control. Of all the variables, air quality management was rated highest in terms of “extent of awareness” (3.22), indicating that participants are highly aware of its practices compared to the rest of the variables. In terms of the participants’ “extent of participation”, mean ratings were found to be highest in both air quality (2.92) and solid waste management (2.92). The high ratings in these areas may be attributed to the strict implementation of the Philippine Clean Air Act of 1999 (Republic Act 8749), Executive order No. 26 on Smoke-free environment and waste management program in the city, which have heightened the awareness and participation in the air quality and solid waste management practices among hotels in the city. Since the hotel industry is a key element in the tourism industry, it therefore has the crucial position in protecting and preserving the environment (Edrogon and Boris (2007). Thus, the challenge for hotels is to make positive contributions to the environment by taking measures to strengthen green awareness programs and intensify efforts in implementing green hotel practices.

**Table 6: Summary Table of Participants’ Extent of Awareness and Participation on the Green Practices in the Hospitality Industry**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Public Areas with Music Entertainment Using Acoustic Walls, Ceiling, and Carpets</th>
<th>Aware</th>
<th>Extent</th>
<th>Practice</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6 Installation of sound limiters in the music amplification system</td>
<td>3.02</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 Installation of gaskets, drop seals and automatic door closers on entrance doors to guest rooms and conference rooms</td>
<td>2.89</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 The use of phones other than alarm clocks to wake up guests</td>
<td>2.97</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
<td>1.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9 The setup of maximum sound levels for telephones, TVs, and music systems in guest rooms</td>
<td>3.01</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
<td>0.84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 The setup of maximum sound levels for music systems and TVs in public areas</td>
<td>3.14</td>
<td>Much aware</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Among the green practices variables, noise pollution control has the lowest means in both extent of awareness (2.94) and practice (2.74), indicating that the participant’s awareness and participation in the noise pollution control is limited. The low rating may be because regulations or national policy relative to this practice may not have been well implemented to combat noise pollution. Since noise pollution is one of the major complaints of guests in hotels, some control mechanisms have been adopted; however, these are not effectively implemented yet based on the result of the study. Thus, hotels are challenged to undertake steps in assessing its surrounding environment and strengthen its noise pollution control programs to be able to reduce hotel noise for the well-being of both guests and employees.

Table 7 represents the result of the Test of Relationship between the Participants’ Awareness and their Extent of Participation of the Green Practices in Hospitality Industry. Evidently, the data support the positive correlation between participants’ extent of awareness and participation of the green hotel practices. As established in the earlier assumption of the study, participants generally have high regard of the hotel green practices in terms of their awareness and their practice. It is likely to follow that if they are “much aware” of the green practices considering: water and liquid waste, green energy consumption, air quality management, solid waste disposal and noise pollution control, the more likely their tendency to bear “great extent” regard of their participation in these practices.

When relationships of awareness and practice among variables were considered, data show “strong” or “high” correlation in such variables as green energy consumption, water and liquid waste management and air quality management in the corresponding areas and “moderately correlated” with the ratings on the areas other than itself.

Table 7: Result of the Test of Relationship between the Participants’ Awareness and their Extent of Participation of the Green Practices in Hospitality Industry

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Awareness</th>
<th>Measures</th>
<th>Extent of Practice</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>Solid Waste Disposal and Management</th>
<th>Noise Pollution Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Green Energy Consumption</td>
<td>Correlation Coefficient</td>
<td>.771**</td>
<td>.576**</td>
<td>.524**</td>
<td>.472**</td>
<td>.491**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water and Liquid Waste</td>
<td>Correlation Coefficient</td>
<td>.598**</td>
<td>.726**</td>
<td>.524**</td>
<td>.549**</td>
<td>.505**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Air Quality Management</td>
<td>Correlation Coefficient</td>
<td>.737**</td>
<td>.655**</td>
<td>.787**</td>
<td>.672**</td>
<td>.553**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solid Waste Disposal and</td>
<td>Correlation Coefficient</td>
<td>.515**</td>
<td>.484**</td>
<td>.507**</td>
<td>.692**</td>
<td>.489**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Noise Pollution Control</td>
<td>Correlation Coefficient</td>
<td>.461**</td>
<td>.430**</td>
<td>.370**</td>
<td>.474**</td>
<td>.640**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. (2-tailed)</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

0-0.2 Very weak; 0.2-0.4 Weak, low correlation; 0.4-0.7 Moderate correlation;
0.7-0.9 Strong, high correlation; 0.9-1.0 Very Strong Correlation

This finding suggests that the higher the awareness of the participants on green energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, and air quality, the higher would also be their extent of participation in green practices in these areas. Very striking is the strong correlation between awareness of air quality management with the practice of green energy consumption. This imply that participants who are “much aware” of the air quality management practices are likely to participate to a “great extent” in the green energy consumption practices. This result is reinforced by the Theory of Planned Behavior of Azjen (1985) whereby the intentions are assumed to capture motivational factors that influence the behavior. This imply that the stronger the intention would be to engage in the behavior, the more likely would also be to perform such behavior. In this case, the participants’ extent of awareness on the implementation of the green hotel practices is manifested on the extent of their participation.

Data further show that there is a tendency that the participants’ level of awareness is “moderately strong” on the same areas but “weakly” correlated on the other areas. As indicated in the table, the awareness of participants on noise pollution control are moderately correlated with the extent of participation in the green energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, solid waste management and noise pollution control but “weakly correlated” on the extent of participation in the air quality practices. This simply means that awareness on noise pollution control can determine to a moderate extent their participation in the green practices considering green energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, solid waste management and noise pollution control. However, the awareness on the noise pollution control has little bearing on the participants’ extent of participation on the air quality management noting the “weak” correlation in this area.

Conclusion and Recommendation

One significant issue that the hospitality industry must not ignore in today’s time is the effective implementation of the Green Practices considering its impact on the environment and its cost saving implications on the operations. Although in the Philippines, no strict standards are yet being established to monitor the green activity of the industry, it is noteworthy that hotels in the city are much aware of the green practices and to a great extent observe these practices in the areas of: green energy consumption, water and liquid waste management, air quality management, solid waste disposal management, and noise pollution control as evidenced by the results of the study. The extent of awareness and participation on the green practices were found to be highest in the air quality management and solid waste management which may be influenced by the strict compliance of hotels to government regulations pertaining to these areas; and lowest in the noise pollution control, where regulations or policies may not yet be well in place. This study may have established that the extent of the participants’ awareness on the green practices is significantly correlated with their extent of participation in the implementation of these green activities; however, results also showed that their awareness bears highest mean rating over their extent of practice. Thus, results of this study may have implications on the need for hotels, particularly in CDO, to embark on a more aggressive program for green practices to help in the environmental sustainability as part of their social responsibility.

Considering that all the hotels included in the study are DOT accredited establishments, data generated from this study may become basis for the DOT in Cagayan de Oro City to craft environmentally appropriate programs to strengthen the implementation of the green practices among its accredited hotels. As part of its continuous improvement, DOT may incorporate criteria or standards for accreditation to ensure that green practices will be embedded in hotel operations. And finally, “Green Practices” may be integrated in the curriculum of the hospitality and tourism management programs of the college.
References

Abdalla M.A. Fadhil, 2015, Adoption of green practices in hospitality and tourism industry in lamu county Kenya.


Icek Azjen, 2006, Theory of planned behaviour.

J. Rathore, D. Gawankar, 2009, Exploring sustainability practices in the hotel industry, University of New Haven

Jennifer Eggeling, 2010, Sustainable tourism practices in the hospitality sector: a case study of scandic

M. Hamid and S. Isa, 2015, The theory of planned behaviour on sustainable tourism, Faculty of hotel and tourism management

M. Hassan, F. Pozi, et al., 2015, Exploring environmental behaviour at green office building using theory of planned behaviour, College of graduate studies, 3rd national graduate conference.


Sun-Hwa Kim, 2005, An investigation into hotel employees’ perception of green practices, University of Central Florida

Yuchin (Jerrie) Hsieh, 2010, Hotel Companies’ Environmental Awareness & Commitment

COUNT THEM IN! INCLUSION OF PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES IN A DIVERSIFIED WORKFORCE: A TRANSFORMATIVE MIXED-METHOD STUDY

E. Y. Sampana & A. De la cruz

Centro Escolar University, Manila, Philippines, sampana1615105@ceu.edu.ph
Centro Escolar University, Manila, Philippines, od_09consultant@yahoo.com

Abstract: Employment is considered a critical element of independent living most especially for Persons with Disabilities (PWDs). In the context of work, it is a gateway to further showcase their talents, skills and other capabilities as part of nation building and catalyst of significant change. This study aimed to gather significant inputs from organizations in the context of hiring, retention, practical and policy strategy towards the formulation of hiring and retention action plans for PWDs. Research design used is a mixed-method sequential transformative. Data were gathered through surveys, interviews, and focused group discussions by using validated tool and questionnaire. Purposive sampling method was utilized. Participants are in Central Luzon, Region III, Philippines who have first-hand engagement in the employment of PWDs. Ninety eight (98) organizations were consulted being represented by HR Officers and Managers with 161 employed PWDs. The study utilized SPSS in generating descriptive and correlational statistics. Qualitative data undergone data analysis. Results are being divided into the degree of expressing agreement in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities, and the degree of expressing rating on practical and policy strategies in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities. The results rejected the null hypothesis set in this study that there is no significant relationship of the type of disabilities of employed PWDs and organizations with PWDs’ inclusivity per province, nature of work environment and job titles of employed PWDs due to all type of disabilities have significant association with the organization employing PWDs; nature of work environment, and job titles but limited to visual; auditorial; orthopedic, and psychosocial disabilities for white collar category; visual; orthopedic, and psychosocial disabilities for blue collar; and visual; auditorial; orthopedic, and psychosocial disabilities for pink collar category. Barriers identified were, lack of awareness, incompetency amongst PWDs, costly, lack of institutional inclusivity policy and loss of productivity. Solutions are financial support and subsidies, capability building, institutional inclusivity policy, partnership between industry & government, and improvement of the existing non-discrimination law especially on inclusivity.

Keywords: workplace diversity, inclusion and accommodation, persons with disabilities, hiring, retention, practical and policy strategies

Introduction

Workplace diversity refers to the variety of differences between individuals in an organization. It does not only include how individuals identify themselves but also how others perceive them. It encompasses race, gender, ethnic groups, age, religious affiliation, sexual orientation, citizenship status, military service and mental and physical conditions, as well as other distinct differences among people (Dyson, 2017). Indeed, it seems that managing a diversified workforce is a big challenge nowadays for organizations. Challenges may appear, but it is inevitable. For the upcoming years,
industries paying much more concern in managing a diversified workforce will serve a competitive advantage and an avenue towards a multifaceted platforms for further growth and development. This study will hope to provide significant insights to better acknowledge the participation of PWDs in nation building, especially within the context of revolutionizing the economy as catalysts of change and significant manpower contributors in building a strong organizational foundations and success towards profitability and growth. Persons with disabilities refer to individuals who suffer long-term physical, mental, intellectual or sensory impairments, which upon interaction with various barriers, may hinder their full and effective participation in the society on an equal basis with others (WHO, 2011). Working with PWDs creates magnitude of benefits for industries such as improve job morale and corporate culture. It can also increase consumer market revenue; can help reduce employee turnover, and have a positive influence on those enduring lesser conflict (Perriello, 2015). Organizational platforms must now be open to all, most especially for those who are often neglected and abandoned like PWDs due to stereotyping resulting to discrimination. The principle of inclusion then for PWDs in the workplace will be a good start to break the said mantle of discrimination. Inclusion is the achievement of a work environment in which all individuals are treated fairly and respectfully. They should have equal access to opportunities and resources so they can contribute fully to the organization’s success (Society for Human Resource Management). Inclusivity of PWDs in the workplace is always an issue even up to this point in time due to the fact that industries nowadays are still occupied with many fears such as fear that PWDs lack necessary skills, abilities and other significant characteristics; fear of litigation associated with terminating PWDs; fear that it will lower productivity and entail higher costs, and others (Unger, 2002). In addition, people with disabilities have lower employment rates than persons without disabilities in developing countries (Mizuno and Mitra, 2012), like for instance, here in the Philippines, based from the column of Imperial (2017) in VERA Files cover issue, among the 1.4 million Filipino PWDs, 85% of them remains uneven in the context of work (Census of Population, 2010). Definitely, there are still a lot of things to weigh and consider in order for the aforementioned fears and gaps to be solved pertaining to the inclusion of PWDs in the workplace. Continued research is needed to better understand how each of these factors contributes to heightened employment equity and opportunity for individuals with disabilities (Bruyere, 2003). Schools, industries, government and non-government sectors and PWDs themselves must work together towards the formulation of policies and programs that in the end all will benefit most especially the vulnerable ones, PWDs.

Statement of the Problem

This study aimed to understand the dynamics and perspectives of organizations regarding inclusion or accommodation of persons with disabilities in the workplace towards the formulation of hiring and retention action plans, specifically, it sought to answer the following questions:

1. How may the profile of organizations as participants be described in terms of:
   1.1 Nature of work environment
   1.2 Type of disabilities of presently employed persons with disabilities (PWDs)
   1.3 Job titles of presently employed persons with disabilities (PWDs)?
2. Is there a significant relationship between the type of disabilities of employed PWDs and number of organizations with inclusion and accommodation of PWDs per province, nature of work environment and job titles of employed PWDs?
3. What are the first three (3) reasons of the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing agreement in relation to:
   3.1 Reasons of employers in not hiring persons with disabilities, and
   3.2 Reasons of employers in not retaining persons with disabilities.
4. What are the first three (3) strategies of the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing rating in relation to:
   4.1 Practical strategies in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities, and
   4.2 Policy strategies in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities?
5. What are the collective subject of responses and perspectives of the participants pertaining to hiring, retention, practical and policy strategies for PWDs?
6. How may the results of the study be interpreted once analyzed and merged in terms of:
   6.1 Barriers in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities, and
   6.2 Solutions in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities?

Null Hypothesis (Ho)
The researcher hypothesized the following with .05 level of significance:
There is no significant relationship between the type of disabilities of employed PWDs amongst the considered organizations and:
   a. Number of organizations employing PWDs per province,
   b. Nature of work environment, and
   c. Job titles of employed PWDs.

Review of Literature and Studies
This study analyzed and weighed different literatures and studies towards a much developed and improved sets of ideas from varied areas of interests set forth by respective authors regarding diversity and inclusion of PWDs in the context of work.

The Impact of Workplace Diversity in Organizations by Dike (2013), explored and studied companies managing a diversified workforce together with the consequences attached to the company’s existence, as well as examining the challenges that comes with employees from diverse cultural backgrounds. Five companies in Finland and Ghana have been studied. The result shows that workplace diversity plays an important and effective role in some companies; however, results of the study found that if there will be inadequate mentoring and guidance will result to poor productivity. In addition, the researcher also noted that workplace diversity will result to a revolutionize production if fair and just treatment will be observed in the implementation of its processes towards further organizational success and development. Comparison between big and small companies also resulted from the said study wherein big companies seem to be more passionate in dealing with workplace diversity while small companies do have difficulty in effectively managing the issue of a diversified workforce within their organizational soil. Saxena (2014), on her study entitled, “Workforce Diversity: Key to Improve Productivity,” critically analyzed and assessed workforce diversity and its impact on productivity in an organization. By examining different literatures and studies, the researcher found that workforce diversity is considered a strength in an organization; but due to challenges attached to it that people do consider in terms of their views, and the issue of diversity in the workplace is still a problem. The researcher also added that even though diversity in the workplace is sometimes prone to challenges. There are still many individuals inside the organization who are positive regarding workforce diversity, and if managed properly it can definitely revolutionize productivity. Levosada (2017) pertaining to the employment of PWDs reiterated that as provided in the law in the Philippines, equal employment opportunity shall be given to PWDs in the selection process based on qualification standards for an appointment to a position in government and requirements set by employers in private corporations. They shall also be subject to the same terms and conditions of employment, compensation, privileges, benefits, incentives, or allowances as an able-bodied person. In addition, accommodation of PWDs should not impose undue or disproportionate burden, but must ensure the exercise of equal opportunity for PWDs in all fundamental rights. In relation to the inclusion and recognition of PWDs in the workplace, a study was made by Sellevol (2016), from where he investigated the experiences of disabled people in the job search process using the social model of disability. The study sample consists of seven people with disabilities and one employer within the framework of a social model of disability from where the social understanding of disability focuses on the person's environment and how these surroundings might be disabling from where disabled people seek jobs in an environment where there is little room to be disabled, and that they might be limited in what jobs they pursue due to experiences in the past. It was also noted from the study by the researcher that disabled people desire to be seen as ordinary
workers without any needs for special adaptations in order to pursue a position where there is a greater chance of succeeding in finding and gaining employment. Kaye, Jans and Jones (2011) surveyed human resource professionals and supervisors working for employers known or reputed to be resistant to complying with the American Disability Affair’s employment provisions. Attendees of employer-requested ADA training sessions were asked to assess various possible reasons that employers in general might not hire, retain, or accommodate workers with disabilities and to rate strategies and policy changes that might make it more likely for employers to do so. Results as cited by respondents, the principal barriers to employing workers with disabilities are lack of awareness of disability and accommodation issues; concern over costs, and fear of legal liability. With regard to strategies, employers might use to increase hiring and retention; respondents identified increased training and centralized disability, and accommodation expertise and mechanisms. Public policy approaches preferred by respondents include no-cost external problem-solving, subsidized accommodations, tax breaks, and mediation in lieu of formal complaints or lawsuits. Tacadao and Narido (2016) on their working paper studied the employment profile of Persons with Disabilities (PWDs) in selected regions in the Philippines. The 150 respondents emanated from a quota sampling were selected and surveyed on their profile such as employment, sources of income, trainings acquired and job search experiences. The key findings are: (a) the leading occupation among PWDs are within the sectors of health professionals and elementary occupations, as well as in clerical works; (b) education and training are critical factors in getting a satisfactory job; (c) PWDs rely to their friends and family in job search; (d) there are companies that mainstream the employment of PWDs; (e) that government organizations plays an important role in ensuring the inclusion of PWDs in the workplace, and (f) there is a notable need to strictly implement laws and policies together with raising awareness on PWD inclusion and employment. Indeed, managing a diversified workforce seems a challenge but for as long as there will be an open modification to systems and policies, it can eventually create a magnitude of significant benefits for organizations. Inclusion of PWDs in the workplace is a good start to further meet the challenges of an inevitable diversity in the workplace. Sad to say, there are just a minimal percentage for those who get hired and landed on a comfortable working platform for this group of minority. PWDs in the workplace are not yet been fully embraced and practiced. Other organizations still see them as liabilities than precious manpower. In line with these, an in-depth understanding about them-PWDs could be further attained through consultation with organizations having direct engagement with PWDs pertaining to inclusivity and providing reasonable employment accommodations. In this way, the provisions and development of further programs and policy for this group of minority will be given emphasis and importance as what then this study aimed for, the formulation of a hiring and retention plans for PWDs. Based from the studies and literatures reviewed and considered, there is indeed a need to formulate a multi-sectoral approach in the inclusion and accommodation of PWDs in the workplace. Working as one in the development of strategic policies and programs must be prioritized. Furthermore, as what this study also aimed for, consultation from different organizations must be done towards better understanding on inclusion and accommodation issues of PWDs in the workplace, and later on to formulate strategies and policies that will empower and acknowledge the skills of PWDs in the field of work.

Methodology

This study is a mixed-method sequential transformative research from where collection of data are done either way around and then integrated during interpretation (Terrell, 2012); which further allows the researchers to give voice to diverse perspectives; better advocates for participants, and to better understand a phenomenon or process (Creswell, 2003). Data were gathered through surveys, focused group discussions and interviews focusing on the subject matter. The researchers made use of research documents from different literatures, foreign and local in the conceptualization of this study. Validated research instruments are also utilized to gain verifiable and credible information. Consultations were made as to the application of industry mapping and profiling of those organizations who have direct engagement to persons with disabilities’ inclusivity and accommodation in the context of work. This study involved organizations whether private or public who have engagement for PWDs’ inclusivity and provisions of reasonable accommodations in the
context of work within the provinces of Aurora, Bataan, Bulacan, Nueva Ecija, Pampanga, Tarlac and Zambales, Central Luzon, Region 3. PWDs accommodated are classified as qualified persons with disabilities in which with reasonable accommodations can perform the essential functions of employment position that such individual holds or desires (RA 10524). Through an in-depth mapping and series of consultation, 98 organizations were identified and consulted being represented by 82 Human Resource Officers and 16 Managers. Total number of employed persons with disabilities from the consulted 98 organizations is 161. Purposive sampling was utilized in this study. The researchers examined and considered a population with units of interest, having some kind of characteristics that are not common (Lund Research, 2012). In this case, organizations who have direct engagement on inclusivity and with reasonable accommodations in the workplace for persons with disabilities were sought. Research instruments used were validated interview questionnaires and the Pacific ADA Center Employer Training Questionnaire from where proper coordination and exchange of communication was sought towards approval. The study utilized Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 20 software in generating descriptive and correlational statistics. Demographic profiles were presented using frequencies and percentages. Interview statements properly validated, undergone data analysis, analyzing the existence and frequency of data through the application and guidance of the following data analysis processes; formulating research questions; operationalizing variables; and creating a coding scheme and quantifying the codes towards the formulation of themes. Coding was made through descriptive and in vivo pertaining to the relationships, similarities, differences and frequency of data being provided by the participants.

Findings

1. Profile of the participants in terms of nature of work environment, type of disabilities and job titles of employed PWDs

Noticeable huge percentages on the nature of work environment for organizations served as participants employing PWDs are in manufacturing with 17 or 17.3%, followed by local government with 14 or 14.3%, distribution and selling with 12 or 12.2%, BPOs with 7 or 7.1% and manpower services with 7 or 7.1%. Remaining 42% are in banking, production, hospital, school, foundation, hotel and casinos, contractor businesses, logistics, health and wellness, consultancy, food services, security, theme and recreation, transportation and lending. Type of disabilities of employed PWDs coming from the respective organizations considered are orthopedic with 64 or 40%, followed by deaf-mutes with 43 or 26.5% and visually impaired with 29 or 17.9%, the rest of the disabilities are speech, psychosocial, cross-eyed, muscular disability, congenital bone deformity, polio, dwarfism, hearing disability, inborn fingerless and chronic illness with 15.6% in totality. Huge percentages of job titles on the other hand for employed PWDs are office staff with 32 or 19.9%, massage therapists with 24 or 14.9%, admin clerks with 24 or 14.9%, customer service representatives with 21 or 13%, manufacturing personnel with 14 or 8.7% and production operators with 10 or 6.2%. The remaining 22.4% are utility personnel, secretary, assembly staff, machine operators, instructors, cleaner, recruitment staff, dishwasher, service crew, internal security, accounting staff, messenger, maintenance staff, cashier, branch manager and project officer. There are organizations that mainstream the employment of PWDs (Tacadao & Narido, 2016), good to see that somehow PWDs in Central Luzon are being provided employment opportunities or are given with reasonable accommodations in the context of work as what is being reflected above most especially in the field of manufacturing, in government offices which is expected (RA 7277), distribution and selling, manpower services and business process outsourcing (BPOs). But the data, considering the population of PWDs seeking for work is considered to be small portion of those who want to land on regular jobs, Colella and Bruyère (2011) even mentioned that in terms of employment and participation on the labor market, persons with disabilities are still considered underemployed group of workforce and even viewed as disadvantaged (OECD, 2010). Getting to a much decent and traditional jobs for PWDs is still a struggle considering certain limitations or medical conditions, some are still depending on the support of families and assistance from the government (Quilalang, 2019). There are still things to be done. Most organizations should realize that PWDs do also have potentials and could also be an asset.
and become a productive member of the working sector. Organizations must ensure to exercise equal employment opportunity for PWDs in all its fundamental rights (Levosada, 2019), PWDs’ talents, capacity and experience can also lead them to become excellent employees benefitting in the end; the growth and productivity of the organization. There is indeed a call to work as one in coming up with programs and policies intended for PWDs’ inclusivity in the workplace, may the challenge be accepted by all towards embracing diversity and acknowledging everyone’s part in nation building and development.

2. Correlation of the type of disabilities of employed PWDs and organizations with PWDs’ inclusivity per province, nature of work environment and job titles of employed PWDs

Table 1 shows the correlation of the type of disabilities of employed PWDs and organizations with PWDs’ inclusivity per province, nature of work environment and job titles of employed PWDs. Chi-square test further reveals that there is a significant relationship of the type of disabilities amongst the employed PWDs and organizations with PWDs’ inclusivity at \( r(98) = 98.000, p < 0.01 \); nature of work environment at \( r(98) = 94.519, p < 0.01 \), and job titles of employed PWDs at \( r(98) = 445.957, p < 0.01 \). The results rejected the null hypothesis set in this study that there is no significant relationship of the type of disabilities of employed PWDs and organizations with PWDs’ inclusivity per province, nature of work environment and job titles of employed PWDs due to all type of disabilities have significant association with the organization employing PWDs; nature of work environment, and job titles but limited to visual; auditorial; orthopedic, and psychosocial disabilities for white collar category; visual; orthopedic, and psychosocial disabilities for blue collar; and visual; auditorial; orthopedic, and psychosocial disabilities for pink collar category. The results shows that the type of disabilities amongst employed PWDs, organizations employing or with reasonable accommodations for PWDs as well as the nature of work and job titles of presently employed PWDs are interrelated with one another. In order for organizations to provide accommodations to PWDs, location plays a pivotal role. Those organizations whose economic power is seen or the place revolutionized business growth and development have the capacity to provide employment largely including those in the minority sectors like the PWDs. Although the region of residence in the study of Boman et al. (2013) had a small impact on the employment rate of people with disabilities, it is undoubtedly be accepted the reality that with higher output and positive economic growth, firms tend to employ more workers creating more employment and effectively uplifting public services as well as facilitating higher living standards (Pettinger, 2017). Generations of more job and livelihood opportunities are expected if the place is a hub for economic opportunity and growth which means that more investors come leading to more jobs and more development, increasing confidence and tends to encourage firms to take risk and innovate. If there will be no growth and development, no additional jobs and livelihood opportunities are produced. Once employment opportunities are observed and guaranteed, jobs for all are attainable including for PWDs. PWDs applying for work then must be given significant considerations as to what kind of position, task and even role they will play inside the organization based on a certain criteria and requirements being set by the hiring agency, suiting PWDs’ skills and abilities in order to produce quality of work. The results supported the study of Boman et al. (2013) that different disabilities were considered potential important or essential factors that affects employment whether in terms of opportunities and provision of status or position. It was also noted from the study that the barriers towards entering labor market for people with disabilities vary depending on the type of disability (Clausen et. al, 2004). Effective placement in employment of job seekers with disabilities must be done making the best possible match between their qualifications, interests and expectations and the requirements of enterprises, as indicated in the job descriptions and job specifications for particular vacancies. Almost all jobs can be performed by someone with a disability, if given the right environment, most people with disabilities can be productive, but as documented by several studies, both in developed and developing countries, working age persons with disabilities experience significantly lower employment rates and much higher unemployment rates than persons without disabilities (Houtenville et al., 2009). Heron (2005) pointed out that organizations must religiously conduct job matching process, requiring good quality information about job seekers with disabilities to determine experience, skills, interests and general
capacity. The process also requires good quality information about jobs, including the specific tasks to be performed, the standards of performance required, the conditions under which the work is performed and the organizational setting in which the work takes place.

Table 1 Correlation of Type of Disability and Organizations Per Province, Nature of Work & Job titles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of disabilities amongst employed PWDs and its relationship to:</th>
<th>Chi-Square</th>
<th>Cramer’s V</th>
<th>Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed)</th>
<th>Decision</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Organizations employing PWDs per province</td>
<td>98.000a</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>.000**</td>
<td>Reject Ho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nature of work environment</td>
<td>94.519a</td>
<td>0.982</td>
<td>.000**</td>
<td>Reject Ho</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Job titles of employed PWDs</td>
<td>445.957a</td>
<td>0.48</td>
<td>.000**</td>
<td>Reject Ho</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

n = 98 ; *p<0.05 ; **p<0.01

3. Reasons of the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing agreement in terms of employer’s hiring and retention of workers with disabilities

Table 2 shows the results of the generated first three (3) reasons why employers do not hire persons with disabilities. First three (3) reasons ranked by the proportion of expressing agreement why employers do not hire persons with disabilities based from the weighted mean value together with the variation or dispersion of the data in a set or the standard deviation (SD) were, they rarely see people with disabilities applying for jobs at 3.05 mean score and with SD of .817, followed by, they are concerned about the extra time that supervisors or co-workers will need to spend to assist workers with disabilities at 2.59 mean score with SD of .872 and they can’t ask about a job applicant’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can do the job at 2.57 mean score with SD of .786. The results of the generated first three reasons for why employer do not hire persons with disabilities with specific verbal description or interpretation are as follows: they rarely see people with disabilities applying for jobs as “Agree”; they are concerned about the extra time that supervisors or co-workers will need to spend to assist workers with disabilities as “Disagree”, and they can’t ask about a job applicant’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can do the job as “Disagree.” The findings shows that the participants are in agreement that in spite that they do accommodate PWDs in the context of work, they still rarely see PWDs applying for jobs. Many people with disabilities were skilled, capable and keen to work, but these things are tested sometimes due to other factors leading PWDs towards loss of self-esteem, feeling of inferiority, and lack of interest and motivation in looking for jobs. Ohikuare (2018) even mentioned on her newsletter entitled, “How to Navigate Common Concerns When Job Hunting With Disability” that common challenges are being experienced by PWDs in job seeking, top ones noted are the ability to apply for jobs, mobility issues, and due to potential prejudice by the hiring companies. In addition, Loprest and Maag (2001) also pointed out that the difficulties in looking for work are widespread and encountered by persons with disabilities, and that the most frequently cited reasons for being discouraged from looking for work are lack of appropriate jobs available in line with disability, no ease in job seeking like transportation matters, and persons with disabilities who have the most difficulty looking for jobs are those who have less education or who are lacking recent work experiences. The disagreement of the participants whether they are concerned about the extra time that supervisors or co-workers will need to spend to assist workers with disabilities and they can’t ask about a job applicant’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can do the job are expected due to the fact that the organizations served participants on this study do have first-hand engagement in the inclusion and accommodation of persons with disability, which means that the participants have credible and confident stand on the inclusivity of PWDs in the context of work because of active participation, experience, and involvement.


Table 2: Hiring Reasons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hiring Reasons</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Verbal Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>They rarely see people with disabilities applying for jobs.</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>0.817</td>
<td>Agree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are concerned about the extra time that supervisors or co-workers will need to spend to assist workers with disabilities.</td>
<td>2.59</td>
<td>0.872</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They can’t ask about a job applicant’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can do the job.</td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>0.786</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 shows the generated first three (3) reasons why employers do not retain workers with disabilities. First three reasons (3) ranked by the proportion of expressing agreement why employers do not retain workers with disabilities through weighted mean value together with the variation or dispersion of the data in a set or the standard deviation (SD) were, they are concerned about attitudes of co-workers toward the worker with a disability at 2.43 mean score and with SD of .837, followed by, they can’t ask about a worker’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can still do the job at 2.27 mean score and with SD of .819, and they are worried about the cost of providing “reasonable accommodations” so that workers with disabilities can do their jobs at 2.27 weighted mean with SD of .903. The generated three reasons of the participants why employer do not retain workers with disabilities stated as: they are concerned about attitudes of co-workers toward the worker with a disability; they can’t ask about a worker’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can still do the job, and they are worried about the cost of providing “reasonable accommodations” so that workers with disabilities can do their jobs falls within the category description as “Disagree” meaning, the participants are not in agreement or have reservation with the mentioned reasons. The justification of the participants is expected because they have first-hand engagement in PWDs inclusivity and experience in hiring and retention of workers with disability is embedded in organizational policy and program. It is justifiable to see that organizations who are not open for inclusion and accommodation viewed PWDs in the workplace as costly or expensive as supported by Kaye, Jans and Jones (2011) in their study, the cost of accommodations served a critical element that needs to be resolved and addressed, not to mention the facilities and additional benefits needed. That is why it is important that multi-level stakeholders must work together most especially through the help of the government (Bruyere, 2003) to address barriers in the employment for people with disabilities.

Table 3 Retention Reasons

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Retention Reasons</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Verbal Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>They are concerned about attitudes of co-workers toward the worker with a disability.</td>
<td>2.43</td>
<td>0.837</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They can’t ask about a worker’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can still do the job.</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.819</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>They are worried about the cost of providing “reasonable accommodations” so that workers with disabilities can do their jobs.</td>
<td>2.27</td>
<td>0.903</td>
<td>Disagree</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4. Strategies of the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing rating in relation to practical and policy strategies

Table 4 shows the first three (3) practical strategies of the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing rating in hiring and retention of workers with disability. First three practical strategies (3) generated through weighted mean together with the variation or dispersion of the data in a set or the standard deviation (SD) were written guidelines for dealing with workers with disability at 3.7 mean score and SD of .578, more or better training on disability issues for supervisors and managers at 3.65 mean score and SD of .611 and a written company policy of non-discrimination that includes disability at 3.61 mean score and SD of .741. The generated practical strategies by the participants concerning the hiring and retention of workers with disabilities stated as: written guidelines for dealing with workers with disability; more or better training on disability issues for supervisors and managers, and a written company policy of non-discrimination that includes disability falls within the category description as “Somewhat helpful” meaning, the said strategies ranked by the proportion of expressing rating by the participants are necessary in hiring and retention of workers with disabilities. Written company policy on non-discrimination will serve as a guiding tool that establishes a foundation of mutual respect that can also eliminate potential liability concerning employment practices (Mayhew, 2019). Through a written guidelines for dealing with workers with disability, employees are provided standards in uplifting right conduct and harmonious relationship that later on promote acceptance and understanding on employee diversity. Aside from company policy and written guidelines regarding non-discrimination, more trainings on disability issues for supervisors, and managers must also be looked into. By having capability training as what Baker and Moon (2008) suggested in their study, for managers and supervisors on disability, acceptance, commitment, support, and enhancement of communication skills are expected to revolutionize awareness and eradicate discrimination. Company policy and guidelines, capability training, as well as organization-wide consultations are important strategies to consider proving later on management’s commitment to disability (Clark, 2013). These will further result in improving and developing an overall progressive and inclusive work environment that assures an appreciation of employee diversity (Bruyere, 2003). By working as one together with multi-sectoral approaches (Dike, 2013), workplace accommodations or inclusions will be better understood, valued and hoped to dismantle employment discrimination and stereotypes regardless of what challenges may come.

**Table 4: Practical Strategies**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Practical Strategies</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Verbal Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written guidelines for dealing with workers with disability.</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>0.578</td>
<td>Somewhat helpful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>More or better training on disability issues for supervisors and managers.</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>0.611</td>
<td>Somewhat helpful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A written company policy of non-discrimination that includes disability.</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.741</td>
<td>Somewhat helpful</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 shows the first three (3) policy strategies of the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing rating in relation to hiring and retention of workers with disabilities. First three (3) policy strategies generated through weighted mean together with the variation or dispersion of the data in a set or the standard deviation (SD) were a trial initial employment period for workers with disabilities at 3.4 mean score and SD of .756, a government program to pay for or subsidize reasonable accommodations for workers with disabilities, including equipment and any needed help with job-related tasks at 3.39 mean score and SD of .869 and salary subsidies for workers with disabilities at 3.35 mean score and SD of .839. The generated three policy strategies by the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing rating stated as: a trial initial employment period for workers with disabilities; a government program to pay for or subsidize reasonable accommodations for workers with disabilities; and salary subsidies for workers with disabilities.
with disabilities, including equipment and any needed help with job-related tasks, and salary subsidies for workers with disabilities fall within the category description of “Somewhat helpful” meaning, these policies will be beneficial in the welfare of persons with disability most especially in the context of employment hiring and retention. Indeed, there must be a multilevel approach in accommodating employees with disabilities (Bruyere, 2003 & Dike, 2013). The government for example as one of the stakeholders plays a very important role in providing policy strategies from where all are expected to adhere to support and help workers with disabilities most especially in the context of workplace inclusivity. Salary subsidies, external mediation services and individual experts to assist and hopefully solve disability issues or any job related concerns without cost to the employer are beneficial to hiring organizations; solving somehow the issue of high maintenance and risk factor issues in the accommodations of workers with disabilities. Trial employment period for workers with disabilities is also a good strategy to consider, by having a trial employment period for workers with disabilities, it will gives employees the opportunity to see if they are fit for the role and culture they are in as well as to lower hiring risks for organizations (Stringfellow, 2019). Multi-stakeholder approach in workplace inclusivity amongst PWDs on the mentioned strategies above is definitely needed, most especially in designing and formulating an effective strategies concerning any financial and employment assistance concerns among PWDs. All stakeholders must work hand in hand as what Dike (2013) suggested to consult different sectors like industries, schools, government and non-governmental sectors on the skills and qualifications needed or expected from PWDs as well as the necessary programs to be considered that will further uplift or improve the quality of life most especially for persons with disability. May such effort to formulate programs and policies for PWDs be extended to all involved and build a massive approach in inclusivity building eradicating discrimination and just embracing diversity.

Table 5: Policy Strategies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Policy Strategies</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D.</th>
<th>Verbal Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A trial initial employment period for workers with disabilities.</td>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>0.756</td>
<td>Somewhat helpful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A government program to pay for or subsidize reasonable accommodations for workers with disabilities, including equipment and any needed help with job-related tasks.</td>
<td>3.39</td>
<td>0.869</td>
<td>Somewhat helpful</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Salary subsidies for workers with disabilities.</td>
<td>3.35</td>
<td>0.839</td>
<td>Somewhat helpful</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

5. Collective subject of responses and perspectives of the participants emanated from the conducted interview pertaining to hiring, retention, practical, and policy strategies

Collective other reasons emanated from the interview results for why employer do not hire persons with disabilities were, lack of necessary skills and abilities amongst PWDs; it lessens productivity and affects quality of work; employers and employees are not well equipped in dealing with the needs of PWDs; there is a direct discrimination due to disability; additional liabilities for the company and hiring of PWDs is costly; entails high risk factors and maintenance in terms of safety and health; poor awareness advocacy on inclusivity and accommodation of PWDs in the workplace; no further employment opportunities & rarely see PWDs applying for job, and standards or rules of organizations are not inclusivity-friendly. Collective other reasons why employer do not retain workers with disabilities on the other hand were, inability or failure to deal with the needs of PWDs; standards and policies inside organizations are not inclusivity bound for PWDs; lack of necessary skills and abilities to meet the demands of work; it is costly; high risk factors and maintenance concerning safety and health of PWDs; loss of quality of work resulting to poor productivity; direct discrimination due to disability; loss of trust and confidence for PWDs due to employer’s
dissatisfaction; PWDs’ behavioral and attitudinal concern, and due to some employer’s personal considerations. Furthermore, collective other practical strategies suggested by the participants from the conducted series of interviews were capacity building for PWDs in the context of training; education and series of enhancement programs; formulation of guidelines and policy regarding inclusivity inside the organization; capability training and education for employers and employees concerning inclusivity; enhancement of inclusivity awareness program across organizations whether or not there is accommodation for PWDs; establish support groups or inclusivity advocacy offices inside organizations; partnership between government and organizations to formulate motivational programs regarding inclusivity of PWDs in the context of work through the help of diversity specialist whether to include industry citations or recognitions, and provide additional tax breaks and creation of more job opportunities. Lastly, collective other policy strategies suggested by participants were the following: 1) Ratification of existing discrimination law most especially in the context of inclusivity of PWDs in the workplace; 2) Mandatory inclusion and accommodation of PWDs in the workplace; 3) Partnership or collaboration of government and industry to formulate an effective hiring and retention programs for PWDs; 4) Government subsidies or financial assistance; 5) Free education and training for PWDs; 6) Thorough implementation of inclusivity awareness programs nationwide; 7) Mandatory compliance of organizations to undergo inclusivity education, orientation and establishment of support offices for further licenses and permit approval or issuance; 8) Creation of more job and livelihood opportunities for PWDs, and 9) Additional tax breaks or benefits for employers embracing inclusivity and accommodation of PWDs.

6. Interpretation of results once analyzed and merged

Data resulted from the validated adapted questionnaire and interview guide were analyzed and merged. The said data undergone series of stages during analysis and interpretation. Through the principle of merging in mixed-method, significant themes resulted to barriers and solutions in the inclusion of PWDs in the workplace. Barriers identified then were, lack of awareness, incompetency amongst PWDs, costly, lack of institutional inclusivity policy, and loss of productivity. Solutions are financial support and subsidies, capability building, institutional inclusivity policy, partnership between industry & government, and improvement of the existing non-discrimination law especially on inclusivity.

Conclusion

Noticeable huge percentages on the nature of work served as participants are in manufacturing, followed by local government, distribution and selling, BPOs and manpower services. Chi-square test further reveals that there is a significant relationship of the type of disabilities amongst the employed PWDs and organizations with PWDs’ inclusivity; nature of work environment, and job titles of employed PWDs. First three (3) reasons ranked by the proportion of expressing agreement why employers do not hire persons with disabilities were, they rarely see people with disabilities applying for jobs (Agree), followed by, they are concerned about the extra time that supervisors or co-workers will need to spend to assist workers with disabilities (Disagree), and they can’t ask about a job applicant’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can do the job (Disagree). First three reasons (3) ranked by the proportion of expressing agreement why employers do not retain workers with disabilities were, they are concerned about attitudes of co-workers toward the worker with a disability (Disagree), followed by, they can’t ask about a worker’s disability, making it hard to assess whether the person can still do the job (Disagree), and they are worried about the cost of providing “reasonable accommodations” so that workers with disabilities can do their jobs (Disagree). First three practical strategies (3) generated as “somewhat helpful” were, written guidelines for dealing with workers with disability, more or better training on disability issues for supervisors and managers and a written company policy of non-discrimination that includes disability. Furthermore, the generated three policy strategies by the participants ranked by the proportion of expressing rating as “somewhat helpful” are: a trial initial employment period for workers with disabilities; a government program to pay for or subsidize reasonable accommodations for workers with disabilities,
including equipment and any needed help with job-related tasks, and salary subsidies for workers with disabilities. Collective other reasons why employer do not hire persons with disabilities were, lack of necessary skills and abilities amongst PWDs; it lessen productivity and affects quality of work; employers and employees are not well equip in dealing with the needs of PWDs; there is a direct discrimination due to disability; additional liabilities for the company and hiring of PWDs is costly; entails high risk factors and maintenance in terms of safety and health; poor awareness advocacy on inclusivity and accommodation of PWDs in the workplace; no further employment opportunities & rarely see PWDs applying for job, and standards or rules of organizations are not inclusivity-friendly. Collective other reasons why employer do not retain workers with disabilities on the other were, inability or failure to deal with the needs of PWDs; standards and policies inside organizations are not inclusivity bound for PWDs; lack of necessary skills and abilities to meet the demands of work; it is costly; high risk factors and maintenance concerning safety and health of PWDs; loss of quality of work resulting to poor productivity; direct discrimination due to disability; loss of trust and confidence for PWDs due to employer's dissatisfaction; PWDs' behavioral and attitudinal concern, and due to some employer's personal considerations. Furthermore, collective other practical strategies suggested by the participants were, capacity building for PWDs in the context of training, education and series of enhancement programs; formulation of guidelines and policy regarding inclusivity inside the organization; capability training and education for employers and employees concerning inclusivity; enhancement of inclusivity awareness program across organizations whether or not there is accommodation for PWDs; establish support groups or inclusivity advocacy offices inside organizations; partnership between government and organizations to formulate motivational programs regarding inclusivity of PWDs in the context of work through the help of diversity specialist whether to include industry citations or recognitions, and provide additional tax breaks and creation of more job opportunities. Lastly, collective other policy strategies suggested by participants were, ratification of existing discrimination law most especially in the context of inclusivity of PWDs in the workplace; mandatory inclusion and accommodation of PWDs in the workplace; partnership or collaboration of government and industry to formulate an effective hiring and retention programs for PWDs; government subsidies or financial assistance; free education and training for PWDs; thorough implementation of inclusivity awareness programs nationwide; mandatory compliance of organizations to undergo inclusivity education, orientation and establishment of support offices for further licenses and permit approval or issuance; creation of more job and livelihood opportunities for PWDs, and additional tax breaks or benefits for employers embracing inclusivity and accommodation of PWDs. Barriers identified were, lack of awareness, incompetency amongst PWDs, costly, lack of institutional inclusivity policy, and loss of productivity. Solutions are financial support and subsidies, capability building, institutional inclusivity policy, partnership between industry & government, and improvement of the existing non-discrimination law especially on inclusivity.

Recommendation

In view of the summary of findings and conclusion, the following are recommended:

1. There must be a multilevel approach in dealing with hiring and retention of workers with disabilities meaning, schools, private sectors, government and non-government organizations and persons with disabilities themselves must work as one in designing programs and policies for PWDs’ inclusivity in the workplace towards dismantling discrimination and stereotypes.
2. Parties involved may also adapt and consider the Hiring and Retention Action Plans for persons with disabilities made by the researcher anchored on the results of this study.
3. There must be an in-tact profiling of employed persons with disabilities as well as industry mapping providing inclusion and accommodation of PWDs in the workplace in the considered region through the assistance of different stakeholders (Schools, private, government and non-government sectors).
4. Furthermore, future researchers may replicate this study by considering a wider scope of participants, doing comparative, and more correlative and longitudinal analysis from different stakeholders or even applied in different minority groups such as elderly, convicted with crimes and indigenous individuals.
Acknowledgment

The researchers wish to convey their deepest gratitude to God as source of strength and wisdom as well as sincere appreciation to all individuals, government offices, and private institutions who indeed helped a lot in the completion of this study.

References


Clausen, J. et al. (2004). Disability and employment- an obstacle course?


International Labour Organization-Conditions of Work Equality Department (Work Quality); Bureau for Employer’s Activities (ACT/EMP),(2014). Business as Unusual: Making Workplaces Inclusive for People with Disabilities.


Loprest, P. & Maag, E. (2001). Barriers to and Supports for Work among Adults with Disabilities: Results from the NHIS-D. The Urban Institute 2100 M Street, NW Washington,DC.


Sellevol, K. S. (2016). Disability and work Barriers to employment:
A qualitative study on disability and experiences entering the labor market.


A Shift-Share Analysis of the Manufacturing Employment at uMhlathuze Local Municipality

M. Ndovela, S. Zhou & S. Nhlabathi

ABSTRACT

This paper uses Shift-Share Analysis (SSA) to measure the performance of uMhlathuze manufacturing industry in terms of employment in light of the government emphasis on stimulating the growth of manufacturing sector in an attempt to create jobs. The paper set out two objectives, firstly, to establish if uMhlathuze manufacturing employment is growing or declining, and secondly, to identify uMhlathuze manufacturing divisions that are specialising in employment. The study sampled manufacturing employment data from 2010 to 2017 and performed an analysis using SSA components, those are, the industrial mix effect (IME), regional competitive effect (RCE) and allocation effect (AE). The results showed that the municipality performed poorly in terms of employment since it recorded negative IME and AE. This suggested that uMhlathuze manufacturing experiences slow employment growth when compared to other economic sectors. The results also suggested that during the period of analysis, uMhlathuze municipality did not rely on the manufacturing sector for employment. With these results, we learn that the emphasis of government strategy on job creation through manufacturing growth is not justified since the manufacturing sector is shrinking in employment. Therefore, we recommended a clear strategy that focuses on protection of labour-intensive manufacturing firms and its supply chain.

Keywords: allocation effect, esteban-marquillas model, manufacturing employment, industrial mix effect, shift-share analysis

1. Introduction

The National Development Plan (NDP) (2014) and the KwaZulu-Natal Provincial Growth and Development Plan (KZN PGDP) (2016) emphasise the importance of stimulating manufacturing productivity with an aim of creating jobs for locals. Furthermore, the NDP and KZN PGDP also recognises the manufacturing sector as an important role player in delivering significant job creation (NDP, 2014; KZN PGDP, 2016). Conversely, global and domestic trends suggest a continuous decline in manufacturing employment (Rodrik, 2016; Buckley and Majumdar, 2018). Also, the scholarship has shown evidence of...
considerable decline in labour intensity within the South African manufacturing sector. For example: in 1970, every R1 million invested in manufacturing sector meant that 12 people were employed, however, an investment of R1 million employs 1 person at present (Black, Craig, Dunne, 2017). The significant decline of labour intensity challenges the emphasised necessity to focus on stimulating the growth of manufacturing sector with a hope to create jobs. While the backbone of this paper is founded on the disconnect between government strategies on manufacturing sector and the actual performance of manufacturing employment, there is a belief that an industry growth/decline in one area may not be evident in another area since economic performances vary from region to region. (Leigh and Blakely, 2016). It is for this reason that this paper became relevant as it interrogates the performance of uMhlathuze Local municipality manufacturing employment. This paper has two objectives: firstly, to identify the manufacturing divisions that are growing/declining in terms of employment, and secondly, to identify uMhlathuze manufacturing divisions that are specialising in employment. To achieve these objectives, this paper uses Shift-Share Analysis (SSA) to measure uMhlathuze manufacturing performance in terms of Industrial Mix Effect and Allocation Effect.

Traditionally, SSA is used as a technique to calculate and describe the patterns of the local economy, however, SSA could also be used to analyse the following with regards to a local manufacturing area: how competitive it is; the level of industrial or sectoral growth; how an area performs with regards to employment and its economy (Wilson, Su Chem, Ping and Robinson, 2005; Goschin, 2014; Dogru and Sirakaya, 2017). Predominantly, the SSA involves three effects, those are, national growth effect, industrial mix effect, and competitive share effect (Grossi and Mussini, 2018). The national growth effect aims to show the influence of the national economy on the local economy (Leigh and Blakely, 2016). It is understood that regardless of what industry it is, the national industry growth or decline impacts on the local area whether the impact is positive or negative. Therefore, the local area may benefit or suffer from the changes in the national industry performance (Leigh and Blakely, 2016). On the other hand, the industrial mix effect is the change attributable to differences in the industry make-up of the local area versus that of the nation (Mayor, Lopez, and Perez, 2007). Furthermore, the competitive share effect is what most regional planners base their focus on when they use shift-share analysis (Goschin, 2014; Leigh and Blakely, 2016). The competitive share effect shows the portion of the growth in a region that is attributable to the strengths or weakness of local firms relative to the firms within the same industry elsewhere (nation or province) (Oyewole, 2016).

Since its formalisation, SSA has been subjected to a variety of modifications in an attempt to strengthen the technique’s relevance to various studies and also to address criticism. For example, Wilson et al. (2005) criticised SSA for its inability take economic changes into account as its primary focus is on the beginning and most recent year. In response to this, it is indicated that separating the period of analysis into more than one period and comparing them against on another would enable scholars to draw more accurate trends (Kleynhans and Sekhobela, 2011). Dogru and Sirakaya (2017) argued that even though...
the SSA is an analytic tool, it is unable to illustrate whether there are considerable changes in the decline or growth of the industry performance. Thus, others have proposal to incorporate SSA with regression analysis in an attempt to address the above mentioned SSA limitation (Patterson 1991; Dogru and Sirakaya, 2017).

Besides the identified limitations and modifications, SSA remains one of the widely used tools in the regional economic development and, is popular amongst regional planners and communities (Le Gallo and Kamarianakis, 2011; Grossi and Mussini, 2018). For instance, in the US, ESRI has incorporated a SSA calculator in their mapping website application and it can be used by the communities and regional planners at no charge (ESRI, 2018). Also, scholars such as Kleynhans and Claassen (2012) used SSA as a predictive technique when investigating the potential of manufacturing subindustries. Oyewole (2016) used SSA to analyse the competitiveness of regional services in the international market, and Grossi and Mussini (2018) have used SSA in analysing the changes in electricity consumption. The wide use of SSA is a result of its simplicity underpinned by the use of uncomplicated data that could be easily understood not only by economists, but also the general public without a theoretical and statistical expertise (Kleynhans and Sekhobela, 2011; Dogru and Sirakaya, 2017). In addition, SSA has understood to reduce the necessity to collect primary data (for example, surveys or interviews), which is considered to be an expensive and time-consuming process, instead, using this SSA saves costs and time (Dogru and Sirakaya, 2017). Based on the aforementioned advantages, the SSA was appropriate for the purposes of this paper.

The structure of this paper is as follows: the above section is an introduction in nature, and it unpacks the background of the South African manufacturing employment, the purpose this paper and the concept of SSA. The following section will discuss the methods/model in detail, specifically, the selection of the study area, data sampling and collection instruments, and the chosen model. The paper proceeds to discuss the results and findings in terms of Industrial Mix Effect and Allocation Effect. The last section concludes the paper and provides recommendations.

2. Methods

2.1 The Selection of the Study Area

McMillan and Schumacher (2001) stressed the importance of choosing a research site that would be suitable and accessible. The present study was conducted at the uMhlathuze Local Municipality in the KwaZulu-Natal (KZN) province on the basis of the municipality’s manufacturing performance and potential. UMhlathuze manufacturing sector is the largest economic sector at uMhlathuze Local Municipality, contributing 30.5% in the GDP of the study area (uMhlathuze, 2017). The 30.5% contribution of the manufacturing sector is said to be partly attributed to the presence of firms such as South32, Tongaat Hullet, Bell Equipment and Mondi. Furthermore, the uMhlathuze Local Municipality
inhabits one of seven areas identified as special economic zones in South Africa, that is, the Richards Bay Industrial Development Zone (RBIDZ) (Vallie, 2017). In addition, the Trade and Investment of KwaZulu-Natal (TIKZN) (2014) reported a total of 42 investment opportunities in KZN, and 19 of those opportunities were focused on manufacturing sector. Furthermore, the 9 of the 19 investment opportunities were found in the manufacturing sector of uMhlathuze Local Municipality (TIKZN, 2014). It is also noted that the RBIDZ has received manufacturing oriented investments estimated to be just above R7 billion which was equivalent to $512 million in 2016 (RBIDZ, 2016). These investments include a R4.5 billion ($330m) of titanium plant, R1.5 billion ($110m) Technopark, R500m ($36m) for chemical plant; another R500m ($36m) plant for the manufacture of energy storage with micro grid system; and R200m ($13M) cement manufacturing factory (RBIDZ, 2016). These reports (RBIDZ and TIKZN) reflect a manufacturing sector potential at uMhlathuze Local Municipality. Based on the above evidence, the manufacturing sector plays and will play a significant role in the near future of uMhlathuze economy. Whilst not disputing the role and the contribution of manufacturing sector at uMhlathuze, the study understood that global and domestic trends of manufacturing employment remain in a downward trajectory and if uMhlathuze manufacturing employment faces a similar trajectory, the manufacturing sector contribution would be less meaningful to locals since sufficient jobs are not created and instead, there is an employment rate decline within the sector (Rodrik, 2016; Black et al. 2017). Therefore, the study was convinced that an investigation with regards to uMhlathuze manufacturing sector using SSA components is justified.

2.2 Data Collection Instrument, Sample and Sampling Technique

The study used a desktop data collection to retrieve uMhlathuze manufacturing employment data from Quantec Economic Trends Database (QETD). The University of Zululand subscribes to Quantec Databases and this enabled the researcher to use his university credentials to access the QETD. In this study, one of the advantages of using desktop data collection instrument is that the data is already stored and can be remotely retrieved from databases (Dogru and Sirakaya-Turk, 2017). In terms of sample size, the study sampled ten manufacturing divisions that make up uMhlathuze manufacturing sector from the Quantec Economic Trends Database (QETD). These manufacturing divisions are food, beverages and tobacco; secondly, textiles, clothing, leather and footwear; thirdly, wood, wood products, paper, publishing and printing; fourth, other non-metal mineral products; fifth, coke, petroleum, chemical products, rubber and plastic; sixth, metals, metal products, machinery and equipment; seventh, electrical machinery and apparatus; eighth, transport equipment; ninth, radio, TV, instruments, watches and clocks; and, finally, furniture, other manufacturing and recycling.

The study employed a time-series sampling in which the manufacturing data (which is industry employment) is from 2010 – 2017. Time-series is used to sample large data with a purpose to discover reliable trends and logical relationship between variables of interest (Uma Devi, Sundar and Alli, 2013).
The study was convinced that this period (2010-2017) was adequate to understand the employment trends of the uMhlathuze manufacturing sector. Similar to SSA studies, the literature shows that desktop data collection and time-series sampling are widely used within the field. Evidently, scholarship (Mayor et al. 2007; Goschin, 2014; Oyewole, 2016; Dogru and Sirakaya-Turk, 2017; Grossi and Mussini, 2018) has used numerous databases to obtain quantitative data and have also used time-series sampling when using SSA.

2.3 Shift-Share Analysis: The Esteban-Marquillas Model

The SSA of Esteban-Marquillas model (ES model) is partially informed by Dunn’s (1960) traditional model (Dunn, 1960; Esteban-Marquillas, 1972). Furthermore, both the traditional model and Esteban-Marquillas model are able consider economic changes during the period of analysis (Dunn, 1960; Esteban-Marquillas, 1972; Fuchs et al. 2000). In the Esteban-Marquillas model, the industry average growth rates play a central role in factoring in economic changes (could be employment growth/decline). For instance, if the period of analysis was year 2000 – 2010, the model would establish an industry average employment growth rate (factoring in year on year industry performance) and subsequently using it where applicable when calculating the IME, RCSE and AE. Aside from the above, the contribution of Esteban-Marquillas in SSA is primarily focused on distinguishing the industrial mix from the regional competitive share effect. This is because Esteban-Marquillas was convinced that the regional competitive share effect is unable to calculate what it pretends to calculate since it is influenced and linked to industrial mix effect (Esteban-Marquillas, 1972). The understanding was that this link between the industrial mix and competitive share effect presents a major limitation in the traditional model since the SSA aims to show if the performance of an regional industry is unique to that of a province/nation (Esteban-Marquillas, 1972). In addressing the limitation of the traditional, the Esteban-Marquillas rearranged the traditional model by decomposing regional competitive share effect into two components, those were, a new regional competitive share effect that is not correlated with industrial mix and introduces an allocation effect (Esteban-Marquillas, 1972). The introduction of allocation effect makes the ES model to have four effects, those are, National Growth Effect (NGE), Industrial Mix Effect (IME); Regional Competitive Share Effect (RCSE) and Allocation Effect (AE). Therefore, the Esteban-Marquillas model follows this expression:

\[ E_{ir} = NG_i + IM_i + RCS_i + AL_i \] (1)

Let \( E_{ir} \) = employment growth in an industry of a region; \( NG_i \) = national growth effect; \( IM_i \) = industrial mix effect, \( RCS_i \) = regional competitive share effect and \( AL_i \) = allocative effect.

Notwithstanding the above expression (1), this paper focused on the two effects (those are, Industrial Mix Effect and Allocation Effect) with Regional Competitive Share Effect as an additional effect. The nature of the objectives of this paper warranted the withdrawal of national growth effect (NGE) in
 favour of the Industrial Mix Effect (IME); Regional Competitive Share Effect (RCSE) and Allocation Effect (AE). Therefore; the model of this paper follows this expression:

\[ E_{ir} = IM_i + CS_i + AL_i \] (2)

Where:

\[ IM_i = b_{ir} \left( e_{i0} - e_{00} \right) \] (3)

\[ CS_i = H_{ir} \left( E_{ir} - B_{i0} \right) \] (4)

\[ AL_i = \left( b_{ir} - H_{ir} \right) \left( E_{ir} - B_{i0} \right) \] (5)

\[ H_{ir} = Y_i \left( \frac{Y_i}{Y} \right) \] (6)

Let \( b_{ir} \) = employment in an industry of a region; \( e_{00} \) = average employment growth; \( e_{i0} \) = average employment growth rate of an industry; \( B_{i0} \) = provincial average employment growth rate of an industry; \( H_{ir} \) = homothetic industry employment in the region; \( Y_i \) = provincial employment in the industry; \( Y \) = total provincial employment, and \( y_i \) = total employment in a region.

In the above expression (2), the industrial mix component continues to play the same role to that it played in the traditional model (Dunn, 1960; Esteban-Marquillas, 1972). Traditionally, the IME is meant to show how fast or slow the manufacturing divisions would grow if uMhlathuze manufacturing income and employment average growth rates were equal to the provincial income and employment average growth rates (Leigh & Blakely, 2016; Grossi and Mussini, 2018). The study denounced the traditional IME as a result of the conviction that had it followed the above-mentioned IME, it would not provide the actual IME of the region since it is based on the hypothetical premise that “how local manufacturing sector would grow if its structure was equal to the employment”. Therefore, calculating IME using regional average growth rates would provide a more accurate understanding of how uMhlathuze manufacturing sector is performing when compared against the economy it operates within. Furthermore, the expectation is that IME will be greater than zero (0>) if a specific manufacturing division of interest is growing than the local total employment growth rate of uMhlathuze economy. However, if the local manufacturing division is declining when compared against the employment growth rate of uMhlathuze economy, the IME is expected to be is lesser than zero (<0). Additionally, the Esteban-Marquillas model introduced a homothetic variable (6) which mainly represents the employment that an industry of a region would have if the employment of a region is the same as that of the province (Fuchs et al. 2000). The homothetic variable is a theoretical value in the industry that assumes that the industrial mix of a province is equal to that of a region (Fuchs et al. 2000).

The regional competitive share effect of the Esteban-Marquillas model give rise to another effect called the allocation effect to separate the assumed correlation between regional share component and the
regional industrial mix found in the traditional model (Esteban-Marquillas, 1972; Fuchs et al. 2000). In this regard, the regional competitive share effect \((4)\) indicates if a local manufacturing division has competitive advantages, whereas, the allocation effect \((5)\) shows whether a local manufacturing division specialises in terms of employment. This could also be interpreted as an indicator that shows if a manufacturing division holds a significant value in a local economy (Fuchs et al. 2000). Furthermore, the allocation effect will be greater than zero \((0+)\) if a region is specialised in that industry, and if a region is not specialised in that industry, the allocation effect will be less than zero \((<0)\) (Esteban-Marquillas, 1972; Fuchs et al. 2000). Through the industrial mix effect, regional competitive share effect and the allocative effect, the study would be able to find out manufacturing divisions whose employment declining faster and also identify manufacturing division that uMhlathuze manufacturing sector specialises in. This enables the study to detect manufacturing divisions whose contribution at uMhlathuze manufacturing employment is negative and also identify manufacturing divisions that enjoy competitive advantages offered by the uMhlathuze manufacturing environment.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1 Changes in Manufacturing Employment of uMhlathuze Local Municipality and KwaZulu-Natal

The general picture illustrated by raw data indicates that both manufacturing employment of uMhlathuze Local Municipality and KwaZulu-Natal province has declined during the period from 2010 to 2017. This is because uMhlathuze manufacturing employment of Local Municipality declined from 14,012 in 2010 to 13,199. During the same period (2010 – 2017), KwaZulu-Natal manufacturing employment declined from 294,436 in 2010 to 285,444 in 2017. In addition, Petroleum products, chemicals, rubber and plastic manufacturing showed the most positive growth with a job increase of 246 at uMhlathuze manufacturing sector and the food, beverages and tobacco manufacturing had the largest job growth (+4231) within the KwaZulu-Natal manufacturing sector.

Figure 1a: Manufacturing Employment of uMhlathuze Municipality

Source: Quantec Database, 2018 (Figures from raw data).
Figure 1a demonstrates that almost every manufacturing division recorded a positive growth except for wood, wood products, paper, publishing and printing; and metals, metal products, machinery and equipment. Furthermore, the Metals, metal products, machinery and equipment manufacturing recorded the worst job loss (-1594) than any other manufacturing division at uMhlathuze Local Municipality. Conversely, the petroleum products, chemicals, rubber and plastic manufacturing division recorded the largest job growth of 246. Overall, the local manufacturing performance showed that in manufacturing divisions where there is growth, it is not significant as in instances where there is decline.

The figure above shows that the total manufacturing employment of KwaZulu-Natal has declined by 8992 during the period of analysis and three of the four divisions that recorded a decline had a job loss that is greater than 2000 each. Furthermore, the textile division recorded the largest job loss of 9406 where it lost 1344 annually between 2010 and 2017. Conversely, the food and beverages division had the largest job growth which was 4231 and it was growing by 604 annually between 2010 and 2017. In addition, as shown in the above graph that the majority of division grew in employment, however, divisions who decline in employment underwent severe job loss. For example, the job growth of division who grew in employment, grew by 10 965 and the divisions who decline in employment had a job loss of 19 957, therefore, totalling a provincial job loss of 8992.

3.2 A Shift-Share Analysis of uMhlathuze Manufacturing Sector

The following presentation of results and discussion is categorised in terms of the SSA components, namely, Industrial Mix Effect, Regional Competitive Share Effect and Allocation Effect.

3.2.1 Industrial Mix Effect (IME)

The IME is calculated by subtracting the uMhlathuze average employment growth rate from the uMhlathuze average employment growth in an industry, multiplied by the employment of the most
recent year of uMhlathuze manufacturing division. The IME ($IM_i$) is calculated using the following expression:

$$IM_i = B_{ir} \left( \frac{e_{i0}}{100} \right) - \left( \frac{e_{00}}{100} \right)$$ (7)

$B_{ir}$= most recent year employment in an industry of a region; $e_{i0}$ = uMhlathuze employment average growth rate of an industry; $e_{00}$ = uMhlathuze employment average growth rate.

Table 1: shows the employment IME of uMhlathuze manufacturing sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>uMhlathuze Manufacturing Divisions</th>
<th>uMhlathuze Employment</th>
<th>Average Growth Rate</th>
<th>IME</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food, beverages and tobacco (FBT)</td>
<td>2219</td>
<td>1.27%</td>
<td>-11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textiles, clothing and leather goods (TCLG)</td>
<td>868</td>
<td>0.77%</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood and paper; publishing and printing (WPPP)</td>
<td>1666</td>
<td>-0.17%</td>
<td>-32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum products, chemicals, rubber and plastic (PPCRP)</td>
<td>1554</td>
<td>2.55%</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other non-metal mineral products (ONMMP)</td>
<td>710</td>
<td>2.49%</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metals, metal products, machinery and equipment (MMPME)</td>
<td>4258</td>
<td>-4.39%</td>
<td>-261</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical machinery and apparatus (EMP)</td>
<td>214</td>
<td>2.02%</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio, TV, instruments, watches and clocks (RTIWC)</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>1.46%</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport equipment (TE)</td>
<td>985</td>
<td>2.71%</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture; other manufacturing (FOR)</td>
<td>608</td>
<td>0.66%</td>
<td>-7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>13 199</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>-293</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Quantec Database, 2018 (Figures derived from raw data). Figures are rounded off to the nearest whole number (except growth rate and average growth rates).

Table 1 above reads that uMhlathuze manufacturing employment is growing slower than that of the overall employment of uMhlathuze municipality since it recorded a negative employment IME of -293. Furthermore, six of the ten divisions recorded a negative employment IME (those were, FBT; TCLG; WPPP; MMPME; RTIWC; FOR). Four divisions recorded a positive employment IME (PPCRP; ONMMP; EMP; TE). In addition, MMPME recorded the largest negative employment IME (-261) and was followed by the WPPP (-32), whereas, PPCRP recorded the largest employment IME of +13 AND was followed by the TE which recorded +9 employment IME.
The above results illustrate that uMhlathuze manufacturing sector is growing slower in terms of employment. The negative IME also suggests that uMhlathuze economy relied on other industries (this could be agriculture, finance, mining or tourism) and not manufacturing sector for employment growth during the period of analysis.

### 3.2.2 Regional Competitive Share Effect

In the Esteban-Marquillas model, the RCSE is calculated by subtracting the provincial average employment/income growth rate of an industry from the employment/income growth rate in an industry of a region multiplied by the homothetic employment/income. The RCSE (CS\(_i\)) for the employment of uMhlathuze manufacturing sector is expressed by:

\[
CS_i = H_{ir} (e_{ir} - B_{i0}) \quad (8)
\]

\(H_{ir}\) = homothetic industry employment in the region [which is calculated by: \(Y_i \left( \frac{Y_i}{Y} \right)\)]; \(Y_i\) = provincial employment in the industry; \(Y\) = total provincial employment, and \(y_i\) = total employment in a region. \(e_{ir}\) = industry employment growth rate in the region; \(B_{i0}\) = provincial average employment growth rate of an industry.

**Table 2: depicts RCSE employment of uMhlathuze manufacturing sector**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>uMhlathuze Manufacturing Divisions</th>
<th>Homothetic Employment</th>
<th>Growth Rate</th>
<th>Average Growth Rates</th>
<th>RCSE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food, beverages and tobacco (FBT)</td>
<td>2447</td>
<td>1.22%</td>
<td>1.13%</td>
<td>221</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textiles, clothing and leather goods (TCLG)</td>
<td>1490</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
<td>-3.20%</td>
<td>5825</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood and paper; publishing and printing (WPPP)</td>
<td>1769</td>
<td>-0.23%</td>
<td>0.41%</td>
<td>-1129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Petroleum products, chemicals, rubber and plastic (PPCRP)</td>
<td>1615</td>
<td>2.49%</td>
<td>1.12%</td>
<td>2217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other non-metal mineral products (ONMMP)</td>
<td>349</td>
<td>2.46%</td>
<td>-0.25%</td>
<td>947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Metals, metal products, machinery and equipment (MMPME)</td>
<td>2030</td>
<td>-4.45%</td>
<td>-2.01%</td>
<td>-4945</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electrical machinery and apparatus (EMP)</td>
<td>239</td>
<td>1.79%</td>
<td>0.32%</td>
<td>352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio, TV, instruments, watches and clocks (RTIWC)</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>1.42%</td>
<td>0.92%</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport equipment (TE)</td>
<td>1024</td>
<td>2.69%</td>
<td>1.54%</td>
<td>1183</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Furniture; other manufacturing (FOR)</td>
<td>725</td>
<td>0.63%</td>
<td>-2.01%</td>
<td>1914</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>11 808</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>6644</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Source: Quantec Database, 2018 (Figures derived from raw data). Figures are rounded off to the nearest whole number (except growth rate and average growth rates).

Table 2 illustrates that uMhlathuze has a total homothetic employment of 11 808 which reflects the employment that uMhlathuze manufacturing sector would have if its employment structure was equal to that of KwaZulu-Natal province. uMhlathuze manufacturing sector recorded a total of +6644 in terms of RCSE employment. This positive RCSE indicates that uMhlathuze manufacturing sector possesses competitive advantages since eight local manufacturing divisions growth rate is higher than that of the provincial average growth rate of manufacturing divisions. TCLG division was found to have the largest competitive advantages in terms of employment (+5825) within manufacturing sector primarily because the manufacturing division had the poorest average growth rate in the KwaZulu-Natal province (-3.20%). In contrast, the MMPME division had the largest negative RCSE despite having a second largest homothetic employment. The poor RCSE in the MMPME division on the local manufacturing sector is caused by the poor growth rate (-4.45%) at uMhlathuze Local Municipality.

The above discussion has presented the results of the study of the RCSE on manufacturing employment of the uMhlathuze Municipality, the discussion proceeds to present the study findings of uMhlathuze Allocation Effect (AE) in terms of income and employment.

3.2.3 Allocation Effect (AE)

The AE is calculated by subtracting homothetic employment from the regional employment of an industry multiplied by results of subtracting the provincial average employment growth rate of an industry from the industry employment growth rate in the region. The calculation of employment AE (AL) follows this expression:

\[
AL_i = (B_{ir} - H_{ir}) (e_{ir} - B_{i0}) \quad (6)
\]

\(B_{ir}\) = employment in an industry of a region;
\(H_{ir}\) = homothetic industry employment in the region;
\(e_{ir}\) = industry employment growth rate in the region;
\(B_{i0}\) = provincial average employment growth rate of an industry.

Table 3: shows the AE employment of uMhlathuze manufacturing sector

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>uMhlathuze Manufacturing Divisions</th>
<th>uMhlathuze 2017 employment</th>
<th>(H_{ir})</th>
<th>Growth Rates</th>
<th>Average Growth Rates</th>
<th>AE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Food, beverages and tobacco (FBT)</td>
<td>2219</td>
<td>2447</td>
<td>1.22%</td>
<td>1.13%</td>
<td>-21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Textiles, clothing and leather goods (TCLG)</td>
<td>868</td>
<td>1490</td>
<td>0.71%</td>
<td>-3.20%</td>
<td>-2433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wood and paper; publishing and printing (WPPP)</td>
<td>1666</td>
<td>1769</td>
<td>-0.23%</td>
<td>0.41%</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 3 above shows that uMhlathuze manufacturing sector recorded a negative employment AE (-7314) where the MMPME division had the largest negative employment AE (-5427) and the ONMMP division had the largest positive employment AE (+979). On the basis of the -7314 employment AE, uMhlathuze Local Municipality does not specialise in terms of manufacturing employment. Specifically, uMhlathuze Local Municipality was found not to specialise in eight manufacturing divisions, those were, FBT, TCLG, PPCRP, MMPME, EMP, RTIWC, TE and FOR. The negative employment AE of seven manufacturing divisions (FBT, TCLG, PPCRP, EMP, RTIWC, TE and FOR) was caused by a homothetic employment that is larger than most recent year employment which negated the advantage of having a regional industry growth rate that is larger than the provincial industry average growth rate. In contrast to the above, the MMPME division recorded a negative AE as a result of a negative regional industry growth rate (-4.45%) and despite having a considerably larger most recent year employment than the homothetic employment. A positive employment AE was recorded by two manufacturing divisions, which are, WPPP division (+66) and ONMMP division (+979), meaning that uMhlathuze Local Municipality specialises in these divisions. While ONMMP division had a considerably larger most recent year employment (710) and a larger regional industry growth rate (2.46%), surprisingly the WPPP division recorded a positive employment AE despite having most recent year employment that was smaller than homothetic employment and the regional industry growth rate that was also smaller than the provincial industry average growth rate.

3.3 Discussion of results

The IME results found that the employment of divisions such as FBT; TCLG; WPPP; MMPME; RTIWC; and FOR were found to be declining faster than the total employment average growth rate of uMhlathuze municipality. Furthermore, the IME results are supported by the raw data which suggest a
decline in manufacturing employment for both uMhlahuze Municipality and KwaZulu-Natal province. In terms of AE and RCSE, the study found that the overall employment AE was negative with only two exceptions (that is, Wood and paper; publishing and printing; and Other non-metal mineral products) that recorded a positive AE, meaning that uMhlathuze manufacturing sector holds less contribution towards uMhlathuze employment. Against the slow growth and lack of specialisation in terms manufacturing employment, uMhlathuze manufacturing sector enjoys a considerable positive RCSE in terms of employment with an exception of two manufacturing divisions (those are, Wood and paper; publishing and printing and Metals, metal products, machinery and equipment) that recorded a negative RCSE. This is surprising because a positive RCSE suggests that uMhlathuze manufacturing employment possesses competitive advantages, yet the manufacturing employment records a very slow growth and the also the local municipality does not specialise in this economic sector.

4. Conclusion

The study learnt that the strategies that steer the direction of the country’s economic development emphasised the stimulation of manufacturing sector in an attempt to create jobs (NDP, 2014; KZN PGDP, 2016). This occurred concurrently with the backdrop that the global and domestic manufacturing jobs are declining significantly. Therefore, the paper focused on finding out whether uMhlathuze manufacturing employment is following the decline trajectory shown by global and domestic manufacturing employment trends. Specifically, the study used SSA to understand the performance of manufacturing employment wherein the combined results showed that uMhlathuze manufacturing employment is declining and it does not rely on manufacturing sector for job creation. The SSA findings provided a clear picture that uMhlathuze manufacturing employment is unable to resist the global and domestic manufacturing employment trends. Therefore, the study concluded that the emphasis to further the development of manufacturing sector in an attempt to create jobs is not justified by the present manufacturing employment performance. Aside from the above, the study recommended a clear identification of labour-intensive divisions. It is unclear which manufacturing divisions are capital intensive and labour intensive and this blurs the potential to attract focus and investment on manufacturing divisions that would help create jobs. Therefore, identifying capital and intensive manufacturing divisions would offer an opportunity to choose investments in manufacturing divisions that would be aligned to the mission or objectives of stimulating job creation.

The SSA Esteban-Marquillas model is limited to providing descriptive findings and cannot explain the underlying factors that are characterising the decline of manufacturing employment. Therefore, this limitation opens an area for further research that scholars can explore by conducting a study that would seek to identify and explain the internal/external factors and microeconomic/macroeconomic factors that influenced the downward trajectory of manufacturing employment.
Acknowledgements: The authors acknowledge the financial contribution of the National Research Foundation (NRF) and the Moses Kotane Institute (MKI) towards the Masters dissertation in which this manuscript emanated from. The authors extend gratitude to the University of Zululand for financially subsidising the authors participation to the 1st International Conference on Social Science and Arts 2019.

Conflict of Interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

References


“A DANCE NOTATION OF ATA-MANOBO DANCES IN TALAINGOD, DAVAO DEL NORTE, PHILIPPINES”


University of the Philippines Mindanao, Philippines

jmabarca@up.edu.ph, mrsalazar2@up.edu.ph, afrtramos@gmail.com & arsalazar@up.edu.ph

Abstract: This study aimed to document the indigenous dances of the Ata-Manobo in Talaingod, Davao del Norte, Philippines since most of the dances among ethnolinguistic groups remain undocumented and usually passed on through the word of mouth. However, the Labanotation or Kinetography Laban Method was utilized to illustrate human motion. Likewise, the specific movement of each dances were described and analyzed. In this regard, the researchers immersed in the community of the Ata-Manobo in Talaingod, Davao del Norte. In this regard, there were eight identified dances, namely: Aabaka, Natarin, Bangkakow, Tagudturan, Inamungan, Kulutawi, Pungko and Kalasag. These dances were notated by way of Kinetography Laban by following these steps: (a) record each dances by using a digital video camera to be able to capture the significant movements of the body; (b) translate the record dance video into a descriptive dance translation, and; (c) find the appropriate labanotation symbol for each dance steps. Overall, the Ata-Manobo Talaingod dances according to the elders of the group were unstructured which means that the dance choreography is indefinite and does not follow a certain measure. Furthermore, dance choreography largely depends on the state of thinking and feelings of the dancer as he/she performs the dance.

Keywords: Kinetography Laban; indigenous dances; Ata-Manobo

Introduction

According to sociologist, in this present day, one of the challenges of ethnolinguistic group is cultural revolutionary change. Most of the groups were exposed with other culture in different aspects of their social life which somehow led them to leave their own culture. Thus, this type of condition and situation by some means has an effect to the overall cultural and traditional system of a particular ethnolinguistic group.

Nonetheless, the intention of this study is to document the indigenous dances of the Ata-Manobo in Talaingod, Davao del Norte, Philippines through the method of Labanotation or Kinetography Laban. The latter was utilized to accurately and specifically notate the eight identified dances of the Ata-Manobo. The body movements and body parts were analyzed appropriately according to the cultural character of the dance.

Moreover, this initiation of dance documentation is very relevant and significant most especially in...
this present time since according to Sobrepena (2010) indigenous peoples in the Philippines face a lot of challenges and one of these is cultural preservation. In addition, Sobrepena (2010) and De Luna (2006), stated that cultural traditions in the Philippines are commonly passed on from generation to generation through the word of mouth and still remain undocumented. Thus, Sobrepena (2010), suggested that the first step towards preservation and protection is through documenting remaining cultural diversity.

Hence, the researchers’ method of documenting the dances is by way of notation system through the “Labanotation method”, wherein dance analyses of body movement and body parts were described and established. Thus, the gathered data were notated the following these steps: (a) record the dances accentuating the significant body movement and body angles through a digital video coverage; (b) translate the captured data into descriptive analysis and; (c) analyze each body movement and find the corresponding notation.

However, there were eight identified Ata-Manobo Talaingod dances namely Aabaka, Bangkakow, Inamungan, Kalasag, Tagudturan, Pungko, Natarin, Kulutawi and Pungko. Out of these eight dances, three reflect human activity in the community as harvesting, planting and manual rice grinding (Aabaka, Bangkakow and Inamungan), two dances are for social events such as Kalasag (war dance) and Tagudturan (tribal hip-hop dance), one dance for ceremonial/ritual like Pungko. Expression of mourning and sadness (Natarin), and Kulutawi a courtship dance. In this connection, for this particular study, three dances were recognized since the methods and analyses work need sufficient time specifically for the dance experts’ and Tribal Council dance validation.

Moreover, Ata-Manobo Talaingod dances according to the elders of the group are unstructured which means that choreography is indefinite. In this regard, their dances do not follow certain measure likewise the length of the dance is unidentified. In addition, the dance do not have ingress and egress and body language of the dancer/chanter in particular is dependent on the state of thinking/mind and feelings/emotions of the dancer/chanter as he/she performs the dance. Hence, these cultural characteristics made them inimitable and incomparable from the other ethnolinguistic groups.

In this regard, Labanotation or Kinetography Laban dance notation is processed based on the actual performance of the Ata-Manobo Talaingod dancers during the community immersion. The following presentations somehow provide details of dance description, body movement analysis, basic dance steps and other dance step variations.

Overall, this initiation of documenting cultural and traditional knowledge such as dance would help sustain the cultural identity and historical continuity of a particular group (Yamut, 2009). Also, this serves as the common language between ethnolinguistic groups and the general public to fully understand and appreciate one’s culture.

“The Ata-Manobo Dances: Labanotation or Kinetography Laban”

**Aabaka**

Aabaka is danced when reaping Abaca fibers. The act of pulling the abaca trunk is being portrayed in the dance.
**The female dancer with the “Saluroy” instrument**

1. Bend the knees (“kuddol”) and sway the hips (“banloy”) gracefully with fine stamping steps while turning obliquely forward right and left.  

   ![Diagram](image1)

**The male dancer with the “Kudlong” instrument**

1. Bend the body (“popoko”) and knees (“kuddol”) with fine stamping steps while moving forward to partner and away from partner.  

   ![Diagram](image2)

2. Bend the body (“popoko”) and knees (“kuddol”) with fine stamping steps while moving obliquely forward, as if pulling the Abaca trunk.  

   ![Diagram](image3)

3. Bend the body (“popoko”) and knees (“kuddol”) with fine stamping steps while moving closer to the female dancer and making a full clockwise turn.  

   ![Diagram](image4)

4. Bend the body (“popoko”) and knees (“kuddol”) with fine stamping steps while moving forward and backward; to and from the position of the female dancer.  

   ![Diagram](image5)
5. Bend the body (“popoko”) and knees (“kuddol”) with fine stamping steps while moving closer to the female dancer and making a full clockwise turn.

Natarin

The dance is performed by a Chanter (either male or female). It is executed when someone from the group passed away or when losing something. The theme of the dance is an expression of mourning and sadness.

The female dancer with the “Saluroy” instrument

1. Straighten the body (“kotong”) while swaying the hips and stamping the feet in tune with the beat of the “chanter - male dancer”.

2. Step right (R) foot sideward; close left (L) to right (R); Step left (L) foot sideward; close right (R) to left (L).

3. Step right (R) foot forward followed with left (L) foot (“sikal”) while knees are bending (“kuddol”) and straighten the body (“kotong”) with head tilting downward while doing small running steps, counterclockwise and taking small steps backward in between. This is repeated clockwise.

4. Step right (R) foot forward followed with left (L) foot (“sikal”) while knees are bending (“kuddol”) and straighten the body (“kotong”) with head tilting downward then quarter turn, counterclockwise movement with backward steps.
5. Staying on post while swaying the body side by side, and stamping the feet.

The male dancer with the “Kudlong” instrument

1. Staying on post while swaying the body side by side, and stamping the feet as the dancer performs the chant (“Sadiow”).

2. Step right (R) foot forward followed with left (L) foot (“sikal”) while knees are bending (“kuddol”) and straighten the body (“kotong”) with head tilting downward while doing small running steps, counterclockwise and taking small steps backward in between while following the girl. This is repeated clockwise.

3. Still following the girl, the dancer executes a pivot right (R) and left (L) and continue with “Sadiow”.

4. Staying on post and moving the right (R) foot on side while performing full turn in counter-clockwise then clockwise.

5. Staying on post while swaying the body on both sides with stamping of feet.

Tagudturan
Also known as the groups’ “hip-hop dance”. It is performed in a fast beat with one male dancer and one female dancer.

**The female dancer with the “Saluroy” instrument**

1. Staying on post while swaying the body in both sides and stamping the feet (“sadiow”).
   
   ![Diagram](image1)

   8cts

2. Fine jumping movements to the right (R).
   
   ![Diagram](image2)

   8cts

3. Staying on post while swaying the body in both sides and stamping the feet (“sadiow”).
   
   ![Diagram](image3)

   40cts

**The male dancer with the “Kudlong” instrument**

1. Bending the knees (“kuddol”) and body (“popoko”) and tilting the head (“muduko”) while stamping the feet moving forward and backward; to and from the position of the female dancer.
   
   ![Diagram](image4)

   16cts

2. Bending the knees (“kuddol”) and body (“popoko”) and tilting the head (“muduko”) while performing around the partner.
   
   ![Diagram](image5)

   32cts

3. Bending the knees (“kuddol”) and body (“popoko”) and tilting the head (“muduko”) while stamping the feet moving forward and step close with slight stamp on the 1st ct.
   
   ![Diagram](image6)

   10cts
References


EVALUATION OF FOOD LABELLING AWARENESS AMONG CONSUMERS AND FRAMEWORK DESIGN: A REVIEW

K. Perumal & B. Balakrishnan

Faculty of Art, Computing and Creative Industry, University Pendidikan Sultan Idris, 35900 Tanjong Malim, Perak Darul Ridzuan, Malaysia
kasturi@tarc.edu.my & balab@fskik.upsi.edu

Abstract: Food consumption is every human being's daily behaviour. Decreases in the awareness and knowledge about food production could lead to an increase in the level of consumer uncertainty about food risks. Its well-known factor that unhealthy dietary intake or knowledge is one of the leading factors of disease worldwide. Food labelling plays an essential role in facilitating information exchange between users and the food industry or system about the food product. The information in the food labels assists the consumers in having a better understanding of the food based on the ingredient information to make a healthy food choice. Thus, it is necessary to re-design the food labels which emphasised on effective communication of information delivery. In order to achieve effective communication, the selection and application of design elements must be wisely executed. Moreover, it is also necessary to understand how the design elements of food ingredients information influence the perception of the consumer on food selection. Therefore, this review is intended to evaluate the importance of food label information awareness to consumers. We conducted peer-reviewed literature on food labelling and included articles by electronic searches in Google Scholar, Web of Science, PubMed/Medline, and Cochrane databases.

Keywords: food labelling; nutrient; ingredient; policy

Introduction

Food labelling is vital for consumers as it assists them in making informed and healthier choices when shopping for food. World Health Organization (WHO) defines food labelling as any written, printed, or graphic display on the food packaging to sell or promote the foodstuff (Organization, 2003). The main concern of the food industry is the health of consumers. The information given in the food labels allows consumers to choose what to purchase carefully. The food labels should report the composition of products, ingredients, quality, origin, processing, and preservation (Ababio et al., 2012, Vidar, 2010, Wingfield, 2016). The food industry must provide consumers with simple, clear, and consistent food labels and health claims which will provide the consumers with some basic knowledge of nutrition to consciously choose what to purchase (Verbeke, 2005, Peterman and Žontar, 2014). The food manufacturing industry is responsible for formulating products with reduced salts, sugar, and fat and provide proper labelling information to the customers. Food labelling should be helpful to all type of consumers, especially illiterate groups and people with colour and vision deficiency as it may reduce obesity and chronic diseases due to negative eating habits. However, food labelling can be complicated and confusing, which contributing to the situation where not all consumers use this
information (Mohr et al., 2012).

It should be noted that Europe, North America, Australia, New Zealand, and Latin America have a reliable food labelling regulations (Steele et al., 2016, Woolfe, 2012). The US Food and Drug regulations proposed several updates to the 1992 guidelines on nutrition facts labelling in 2014 (Fransvea et al., 2014, Su et al., 2015). The regulation improved the legibility information including minimum font size for mandatory information, clear and harmonised information on allergens, and also origin information of fresh meats from pig, sheep, goats, and poultry. The act is consist of labelling, presentation, advertising, and nutrition labelling for foodstuffs to attain high consumer’s protection levels. The main objectives of food legislation are to emphasise food safety and protect the health of the consumer. The information such as ingredients listings, nutrition, and the allergens and nutrition helps consumers to make an informed decision before buying the foodstuff. Besides the packaging design, including colour, font size, and the layout are also playing a significant impact on attracting the customers to read and understand the label in the foodstuff (Hieke and Taylor, 2012). Therefore, to fix poor diet, reliable and easy to understand food labeling is important.

Consumer awareness and understanding of food labelling is essential, since food labelling is an crucial element to guarantee food safety,. The study conducted by (Ababio et al., 2012) to evaluate the awareness of food labelling among consumers in Ghana shows that the participants were reasonably knowledgeable and understand the importance of food label information. In contrast, according to the study conducted by Liu and others (2015), 70% of the participants indicated that they never used nutrition labels while shopping for food (Liu et al., 2015). Nevertheless, there are no conclusive statistics to date to prove the degree of consumer awareness of food labeling, although reports show that the perceptions of consumers towards the nutritional element of foods are rapidly increasing. The purpose of this review is therefore to evaluate consumer awareness and importance of food label information.

Methodology

The present review examined consumer behaviour related to food labels on prepackaged foods, published in journals or research reports which are in English. Research that explores food label, use of nutrition labels, use of ingredients, consumer knowledge, understanding of food labels has been included in this review. Articles that reported the relationship between usage of food labels or legislation were also included. This review only focuses on the food labelling at the time of purchase. We conducted peer-reviewed literature on food labelling and included articles by electronic searches in Google Scholar, Web of Science, PubMed/Medline, and Cochrane databases.

Factors Affect the Use of Food Labelling

Consumers overestimate or underestimate the risks poses by unhealthy food choice often. One of the reasons diet-related disease is increasing in past decades is due to decrease in the consumption of natural foods. Since, in the past years consumers have increasingly paid more attention to the relationship between diet, nutrition, and disease, they are searching for comprehensive, accurate, and reliable information about the foods they eat. It is therefore important to read and understand the food labels as they provide all the information required. The factors that affect the use of food labelling can
be categorised into individual characteristics, situation, attitude, behaviour, nutrition knowledge, motivation, and others (Drichoutis et al., 2006, Petrovici et al., 2012, Papafotikas et al., 2014).

Demographic factors, including age, gender, and education, play a significant role in food labelling usage. Among others, age is one of the most critical factors that affect the use of food labels. Macon and others (2004) investigated the usage of food label by older Americans (Macon et al., 2004). Information from the USDA Survey on Food intakes by individual, Diet and Health Awareness were used in this research. The study found that increased heart-related health problems among elderly people can be caused by poor understanding and use of food labels. In addition, in order to reduce the risk of chronic diseases, it is important to educate the older age group on the use and understanding of food labels when buying food. This proved that food label helps improving dietary factors among older age group to prevent chronic diseases.

The study conducted by Miller and others (2017) also reported that older adults were paying lesser attention to the food serving size information compared to younger consumers (Miller et al., 2017). The authors have concluded that serving size information is rarely used by older adults. However, in order to identify what factors is mainly contributing to the difficulty in the older people to understand the serving size information, they have conducted a study which involved adults aged between 20 and 80 years. The study compared the effects of basic literacy and age differences on the food label use for serving size information. First, the participants were asked to compare two brands of the same products and to choose the healthier product if they were asked to eat all. Then after two weeks, the participants were given the same product and asked to identify the more healthful based on sodium or saturated fat. Participants were also asked to answer questionnaires consisting of demographic information, food labels use, basic literacy, and nutrition knowledge. The result shows that young people who are educated and knowledgeable about food use food labels higher than others.

However, the findings of past studies found that the effect of age has been somehow controversial. The study conducted by Satia and others (2005) reported that younger respondents who were between 20 to 39 years old, compared to the older group of people read the nutrition labels significantly high. So this shows the results obtained from the previous study the not been uniform. Liu and others (2015) reported that younger consumers have a better understanding of nutrition labels in their study (Liu et al., 2015).

In conclusion, the nutrition label reading can be very challenging even in younger consumers due to the inconsistency of per-serving and per-package information. Moreover, poor numeracy can make the serving size information reading much tricky regardless of age, and poor attention. It is essential to give specific guidance, especially to older adult on the nutrient to create awareness and influence the consumers to read serving size information to choose healthier foodstuff. This because older adults need to manage diet-related chronic conditions compared to young consumers.

Besides, gender also one of the significant determinants of food labels use among consumers. Petrovici and others (2012) reported age, gender, and education affect the consumers on food label usage (Petrovici et al., 2012). Past studies show that nutritional labels use expected to be higher among females compared to males and individuals with higher levels of education. Satia and others (2005) conducted study to identify food label use among African Americans. They studied the use of food labels and their relationship to socioeconomic, behavioral, psychological and social and dietary
conditions (Satia et al., 2005). The result obtained shows that the use of the nutrition label among women, older people and overweight consumers was significantly higher. Additionally, consumers with education level beyond high school read the food labels more carefully and utilise it thoroughly compared to participants with lower education level.

Additionally, Roberto and Khandpur (2014) also reported that food labelling is used mostly by well-educated, female, and young adults, although it was intended to use by all the population (Roberto and Khandpur, 2014). The lower level of awareness of nutrition may be related to people's under-utilization of food labels that cause increased chronic disease including high blood pressure, diabetes, and heart problems. Ollberding and others (2011) found higher-educated women were more likely to use the food label than men or lower-educated people. The survey conducted by Tierney and others (2017) on the consumer knowledge and understanding of added sugars shows that females use food label higher than males. However, almost one-fifth of respondents indicated they rarely look for macronutrients on the label. This indicates that participant is not prioritising the nutrition table much like looking at the total sugar, calories, total fat, salt, and saturated fat content in the foodstuff they consume (Tierney et al., 2017). In addition, this study also found low awareness of the WHO guidelines, even among highly educated consumers, and those who know about nutrition.

Su and others (2015) used a population-based survey to examine the relationship between nutrition label use and health and assess its correlation with gender (Su et al., 2015). The study has concluded that a close relationship befell between health and nutritional label use among the participant and its more noticeable among men than among women. The question to study the use of nutrition labels were based on five variables, including health status, demographics, socioeconomic, behaviour, and health care access. Men reported using nutrition labels less compared to women, which is about 40.7% and 54.3%, respectively. Study shows that male participants with chronic conditions such as high blood pressure, heart disease, diabetes have been shown to be more likely to use the nutrition label than female participants. However, this association is not significant among females, as reported in this study. The association between chronic illness and nutrition label use among men put forward to educate them on nutrition values through clinical setting.

According to Liu and others, education and diet status have been found to be negatively linked to nutrition labels (Liu et al., 2015). Highly educated people may be less likely to believe that nutrition labels contribute to healthy food choices, as Nayga (1999) (Nayga, 1999). These results suggest that knowledge of nutrition has no effect on the food label use that confirms the weak link between knowledge and use of the label (Nayga, 2000). Nonetheless, the research of Drichoutis and others (2005) (Drichoutis et al., 2005) indicated that knowledge of nutrition has a significant effect on the use of fat, ingredients and content of vitamins / minerals on the label.

Besides, consumers may use a food label for different motives, such as to help in consuming healthier food and for disease prevention. The past has shown that a greater awareness of nutrition labels helps to make good food choices among people with different health needs. The study conducted by Ollberding and others (2011), reported that food label usage associated with improved dietary factor among (Ollberding et al., 2011). The study shows that 61.5% of adults using the Nutrition Facts panel, and 51.6% used the ingredient list while purchasing the food. Users of food labels take less
total fat, saturated fat, cholesterol, sodium, dietary fiber, and sugar compared to users of non-food labels.

**What do Customers Look for on Food Labels?**

The Nutrition labels and the ingredient list are the two pots where most consumers look for information about food healthfulness. According to the food labelling research conducted on 2019, information that consumers look for to determine a food product’s healthfulness is nutrient content claims on the package statements, absence of certain ingredients, the price, calorie content, sugar content, fat content, sodium content, freshness, label as well as organic. Besides, participants are also looking into the brand or company name, front-of-package nutrition content icons, company website, and corporate social responsibility statement. Highly educated consumers with high incomes pay attention to brands or company names when determining healthfulness compared to individual with lower education level.

**Nutritional Labels**

The Nutrition label should be placed on the required packaged foods and beverages as specified by the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) (Jackson and Viehoff, 2016). Nutrition labels on the food typically contain information on serving size, calories, vitamins, fats, carbohydrate, and calcium. Some customers turn to nutrition labels to find about the cholesterol content, whereas diabetic patients usually look for the sugar content. The nutrition information on the food packs is aimed to assist the customers in identifying healthy food quickly at the time of shopping and consumption to make better decisions based on their diet. Therefore, nutrition information on the front of the food packaging should provide a clear description of the product. In recent years, consumers started to pay more attention to nutritional issues, and it is believed to be driven by several factors, including dietary lifestyle, ageing, and safety concern. Few factors that may influence the purchase decisions such as population growth, age, modern society, and household size.

Most of the customers pay attention to nutritional labels only when they purchase the food product (Satia et al., 2005). However, it seems the nutritional labels are hard to understand and misinterpreted. It is essential to know how to read a nutrition label, especially for someone with chronic diseases, and need a special diet. Nutrition label helps to plan a healthy and balanced diet. Therefore, the FDA intended to make changes in the existing regulation to help the customers to make more informed choices and expected to adopt the change by 2021. The changes including making the calories and serving more prominent using larger font size, added sugar information, adding information about vitamin D and potassium, serving size and calories and nutrients for a single serving and of the whole package as well. An individual needs to consume an equal number of calories to achieve or maintain a healthy weight. The calorie need varies according to individual age, sex, height, weight, and physical activity. For example, 100 calories per saving are considered a moderate amount. However, 400 calories for an individual food is considered high. Besides, serving size is essential to compare calories and nutrient in different food and make the right choice. The total sugar added while processing the food such as table sugar, syrups, honey and sugars from fruit or vegetable juices also added in the modified nutrient label, and this is important to educate an individual on amount of sugars they are consuming daily.
Recently many studies have been conducted to identify the consumer involvement and perception on nutrient labels. A study was conducted by Karakaya (2018) to investigate customer involvement with nutrition labels in USA. Two hundred people reading food labels and 100 people not reading food labels were randomly selected for this study. The internet survey included questions about the use of food labels and the importance of food serving size for few foods. The result shows that consumers under the age of 25 and over 70 have the lowest level of nutritional reading, and educated people seem to read more nutrition labels than others. The study also showed that the food serving size data on food packages was misleading to 50% of respondents. Customers are paying more critical to the content of sugar and sodium information, followed by fat, cholesterol, protein, calorie, and carbohydrate. The finding also indicates that customers who read nutrition labels are concerned about the intake of nutrients and the risk associated with the size of the food served. In general, it can be presumed that consumers find it difficult to understand details about serving size, and this influences their selection and compares the dietary value of different foods.

The study conducted by Chan and others (2017) (Chan et al., 2017) also shows not standardised nutrition labels able to mislead the consumers. This research aimed to determine whether the food products that disclose smaller serving sizes have a higher calorie density than the larger serving size. The result suggests that the unregulated serving sizes in Canada have led the food manufacturers to provide smaller serving sizes for higher-calorie foods, which can be misleading to consumers.

Blitstein and Evans (2006) studied the use of nutrition labels by adults making a decision to purchase household food (Blitstein and Evans, 2006). They reported that nutrient knowledge is important for maintaining healthy body weight. This study involved 390 adults with one or more children while purchasing food to define sociodemographic variables and beliefs. They found that 53% of participants used food labels regularly to make food purchase decisions. Higher-educated female participants were more likely to use nutrition labels than men.

Ingredients Listings

The ingredient is mandatory in many countries for food labelling, besides nutrition labelling (Kypri et al., 2007). The food manufacturers need to list down all the ingredients used on the food label. The ingredients should be organized in order of predominance, where the ingredients used in the largest quantity should first be preceded by smaller quantities. The label also must list any FDA-certified colour additives. However, it also can be listed = collectively as "flavours," "spices," "artificial flavouring," or, "artificial colours", without naming each one separately. Besides, declaration of allergens should be included in the ingredient list. The terms commonly used in the listing of ingredients and the labeling of nutrients differ from market to market. This means that the list of ingredients on the same type of bread would be different for different brands. That's why reading the list of ingredients before buying any food is important.

While many studies have investigated awareness of consumers on nutrition labelling, only a few limited studies were conducted on ingredient listings for food. Grunert and others (2018) studied the extent to which consumers want and use alcoholic drinks ingredients and nutritional information (Grunert et al., 2018). In addition to how the selection is affected by the involvement of the product, health interest and prior knowledge about the ingredients and nutritional characteristics of alcoholic beverages were also studied. In addition to how the selection is affected by the involvement of the
product, health interest and prior knowledge about the ingredients and nutritional characteristics of alcoholic beverages were also studied. Results show that the use of information on food labels is mainly affected by consumer interest and, to a lesser extent, by concern in health.

A qualitative study was used by Pabst and others (2019) to explore the feedback of wine consumers on ingredient and nutrition labelling (Pabst et al., 2019). They researched how it influences their perception of wine as a natural product and whether it affects wine consumption. The study shows that many consumers overestimate the wine's caloric quality, so nutritional information was not considered useful. In fact, consumers feel helpless and confused about ingredient information for the first time reading.

**Front-Of-Package Labels**

Front-of-package (FOP) are icons, symbols and logos shown on the back or side of packaging that help consumers pick, buy and consume healthier goods. FOP labels are a simplified version of a packaged product's nutrient content (Khandpur et al., 2019). Since, the overloaded information on the food packaging can interfere the decision-making of customers, the presence of FOP help the customer to easily interpret to identify unhealthful food products (Kleef and Dagevos, 2015).

The government of Canada committed to implement the FOP systems to inform consumers and encourage the reformulation of prepackaged foods (SAGE, March 2017). The new Chilean warning system using symbol including triangles, circles, and a magnifying glass to highlight saturated fat, sodium, and sugar with high level. Besides, manufacturers around the world are using the traffic light method which includes information per serving on calories, saturated fat, sugars and sodium content (Hawley et al., 2013). The utmost aim of FOPS is to encourage food manufacturers to continually reformulate and introduce more healthy products (Kanter et al., 2018). To help the customers to make healthy choices and facilitate them to understand different FOP labelling system has been developed worldwide (Machín et al., Antúnez et al., Hawley et al., 2013). The study conducted by Visschers and others (2010) claim that when they have a specific health target, FOP labels have a greater impact on customer food choices. They conducted a study to determine if people with a health motivation focus more on nutritional information about food products than people with a taste desire (Visschers et al., 2010). The result showed that nutrition information was perceived by participants with health motivation broader and more often than participants with taste desire. The motivation of an individual and also the product’s design is identified as two factors that influence the usage of FOP.

Machin and others (2018) assessed the influence of two types of FOP nutrition labeling with a specific health target on packaged food purchases. For comparison purposes, a modified version of the traffic light system and the Chilean warning system were used (Machín et al., 2018). The result showed that information on FOP nutrition could improve the food choices of participants. Arrúa and others (2017) recently reported that the traffic light system offers advantages over the Daily Amounts Guideline (DAG) in terms of goal-oriented eating habits and correct identification of unhealthy products (Arrúa et al., 2017). Also perceived as less healthy were food products with high saturated fat, sugar, and sodium content warnings on the label. The result of this study suggested that both warnings and the traffic-light system able to identify the most healthful product. Additionally, Becker and others (2015) also reported that the participants attended the Front-of-Pack (FOP) nutrition labels more often and earlier than the Nutrition Facts Panel (NFP). The front package placement and the
design characteristics found to be the two main reason it is often looked at by the participants. The colour used attracted the participant more, and there is no evidence on the influence of coding information (Becker et al., 2015).

In conclusion, the Front of Pack labels that contain simplified information has attracted more and easily noticeable than the traditional labelling, however, research on the performance of this FOP scheme is yet scarce and more study is required to find out the effectiveness in educating the customers to choose the health-giving foods.

**Issues with Food Labelling**

Today there has been a great deal on investigating the food labelling. A valid label can attract even an individual who has no specific health goal of assessing the nutritional value of a product. It is essential to evaluate the effects of food labels to increase the habit of healthful choice of food. The comprehension, elaboration, and integration of information in the food labels is importance. Although consumers increasingly look at labels, their understanding of nutrition and ingredients information is still a major issue. Based on the past reports it appears that consumers are often confused by technical terms and mistakenly assume the nutrient intake (Silayoi, 2007).

The main reason consumers did not use food labeling, according to previous studies, was the inability to understand the terms used, which could be due to lack of health knowledge. However, the font size used also made it difficult for the elderly to read. Hence, easy-to-understand terminology, reliability of the information given and the larger font size are the primary concerns to encourage consumers to use food labeling while shopping for food. Visibility of the nutrient and ingredient listing is important upon purchase or consumption. In some food, this information is not placed on the front but alongside the product. The researcher has identified various techniques to improve the usage of food labels. Improving the graphical presentation, reference information, summary descriptors, and category-specific mean nutrient values are the few of the valid label formats suggested (Baltas, 2001). This report suggests more research on the customer’s ability to interpret the product information with different forms of labeling. It is necessary to educate a different group of people by giving education programs and materials focusing on the requirements of a specific consumer. This is because an older consumer may find it challenging to interpret the information given compare to the younger ones. The fixed spot on the food label also one of the way to help customers, mainly the older adults read the labels for healthy choice of food. It is also important to review the current health education initiatives and identify the needs for nutrition and food label awareness programs. Since, food labels use significantly associated with healthful dietary practices, the researchers and clinicians should include important of nutritional and product labels use in nutrition education programs.

In conclusion, in this study, the model of information procession was employed to develop a framework to provide a sound labelling system to increase food labelling awareness among consumers. In Model of information processing, the information must undergo five stages of processing to impact the behaviour (DeJoy, 1991). The label should be accelerated exposure, seek attention, and easily encode and comprehend and then only in will able to influence the decision making. In this study, by using the model of information processing approach, the five serialised stages of processing have been developed (see Table 1).
Table 1 Model of information processing approach in relevance to Food labelling

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Stages of processing information</th>
<th>Relevance to Food labelling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Exposure</td>
<td>✓ The information must be visible to the consumer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ The nutrient and ingredients labelling are customarily displayed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Attention</td>
<td>✓ The consumer must be attracted and attend both the nutrition and ingredient information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ The design used must be attractive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Encoding</td>
<td>✓ The consumer must encode the information in the label into working memory.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ It is crucial to provide critical nutrients/ingredients information.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Comprehension</td>
<td>✓ The consumer must comprehend the importance of the information presented in the label.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ The appropriate usage of icon and colour coding schemes plays an important role.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Compliance</td>
<td>✓ The information given will have resulted in the appropriate selection and consumption of food</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>✓ The prior stages needed to be completed to influence the behaviour.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Conclusion

The review provided valuable information for future study and development of theoretical and empirical research. Our review indicates that the food labelling use is affected by several factors such as individual characteristics, situation, attitude, and behaviour, product class involvement, nutrition knowledge, motivation factors, and other factors characteristics. However these factors have conflicting effects due to differences and diversity in methodology used, data collected, location, and scope of the studies. The use of food labels varies depending on demographic factors such as gender income age, and education background based on the literature study conducted. Therefore it is suggested to conduct more holistic research on food labelling to framing and improvise the currently practising policy. The collected research data also shows that many consumers pay attention to the food labels, but the presentation of additives on the labels that creates uncertainty among the consumers.

This review also presented that food labelling especially nutrient and ingredient labelling positively influence purchasing behaviour, which has promoted healthier food intake. However, no big-scale study is conducted to identify the effect of food label use on purchasing and consumption behaviour. Study based on the theoretical model on the effect of food labels is needed as most of the study only covers applied research. Since this study reviewed wide variety of methodologies and objective, it
could not be subjected to a formal meta-analysis. The policy maker should also continue to implement mandatory labeling and review the guidance available. This is because although the food labels do not greatly improve diets, compulsory labeling may challenge food manufacturers to improve product nutritional quality. Further research is needed on the impact of knowledge about serving size, and lists of ingredients as this subject is very scarce in the literature. Besides further research on determining if health-related claims affect diet also should be conducted to identify if it is benefiting or detriment the health.

Additionally, future research also should be conducted on people with chronic diseases and low nutrition literacy. It is clear that nutrients are essential for growth and maintain good health. Besides research also needed to motivate the consumers to use nutrient labels as well as identify interventions to increase label use and understandings. In conclusion, improvements in food labelling could make an essential contribution in helping the consumer to make the existing point-of-purchase environment more conducive.
References


### Appendix

**Table 1 Model of information processing approach in relevance to Food labelling**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Stages of processing information</th>
<th>Relevance to Food labelling</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 6.  | Exposure                         | ✓  The information must be visible to the consumer.  
|     |                                  | ✓  The nutrient and ingredients labelling are customarily displayed. |
| 7.  | Attention                        | ✓  The consumer must be attracted and attend both the nutrition and ingredient information.  
|     |                                  | ✓  The design used must be attractive |
| 8.  | Encoding                         | ✓  The consumer must encode the information in the label into working memory.  
|     |                                  | ✓  It is crucial to provide critical nutrients/ingredients information. |
| 9.  | Comprehension                    | ✓  The consumer must comprehend the importance of information presented in the label.  
|     |                                  | ✓  The appropriate usage of icon and color coding schemes plays an important role. |
| 10. | Compliance                       | ✓  The information given will have resulted in the appropriate selection and consumption of food  
|     |                                  | ✓  The prior stages needed to be completed to influence the behaviour. |
WOMEN’S JOURNEY THROUGH THE DEBRIS OF PARTITION OF INDIA:
PATRIARCHAL STRUCTURE AND LEGAL CHALLENGES

V. S. Chhetri

School of Law, University of Petroleum and Energy Studies, Dehradun, India, vsingh@ddn.upes.ac.in

Abstract: Historical events are difficult to date in any precise way for their beginnings and endings are not finite. The Partition of India into two countries, India and Pakistan, is an event that is said to have taken place in August 1947, yet its beginnings go much further back into history. History witnessed the migration of over twelve million people and communal violence to a degree that left over a million dead, more than 75,000 women were abducted and many people were rendered homeless; either on a temporary (ranging from few months to decades) or a permanent basis. Within patriarchal structures, women are often considered as embodiments of the honor of the whole community. Accordingly, in times of ethnic, religious or other violent conflict, they become major targets. To the best of our knowledge there has been no feminist historiography of the partition of India, not even of the compensatory variety. Women historians have written on this cataclysmic event but from within the parameters of the discipline, and still well within the political frame. They are present in some reports and policy documents, and no account of Partition violence for instance, is complete without the numbing details of violence against women. Yet they are invisible. Furthermore, their experience of this historic event has neither been properly examined nor assigned historical value. This paper is about the nature of violence inflicted on women during the Partition of India in 1947. The paper tries to explore women in totality in the context of partition and the legal issues which arose when both the countries tries to take the females of their respective countries back.

Keywords: national honor, patriarchy, female sexuality, legal issues

Introduction

“At the stroke of the midnight hour, when the world sleeps, India will awake to life and freedom. A moment comes, which comes but rarely in history, when we step out from the old to the new, when an age ends, and when the soul of a nation, long suppressed, finds utterance.”

At midnight on August 14 1947, Jawaharlal Nehru, the first prime minister of independent India, gave a famous speech which hailed the country's decades-long, non-violent campaign against British rule. However, it soon dawned on the leaders of both countries that the hope and optimism of that night would quickly turn to the harsh realities of how to handle one of the largest mass migrations in modern history and the ensuing communal violence. Post partition, thousands suddenly found themselves without a home and effectively without a nation. The lines were drawn and many found themselves on the wrong side of the border. Their religious identities, whether one is a Hindu, Muslim or a Sikh, took precedence over their national identity. The notion of belonging was redefined; you belong to your religion and that defines your legitimate location. The seduction of religion was such that millions got drenched in the bloodbath of communal hatred. For those who were (relatively) lucky and found themselves on the right side of the border, there was a radical shift in their understanding of home as well. Those who stayed behind were left in a barren wasteland that no
longer resembled their home. As India and Pakistan celebrate 71 years of independence, we look back at how two nations were formed - and the years of bloodshed that followed.

Within patriarchal structures, women are often believed to be the embodiment of the honour of the whole community to which they belong. Accordingly, in times of ethnic, religious or other violent conflict, they become the major targets as attacking a woman’s body signifies an assault on the family and the community. In any upheaval when sectarian passions are aroused or violence reigns supreme whether it is caste or communal violence or inter-state wars, women often become the worst victims of rival groups. In a situation of civil war, where nearly every man is a soldier fighting for his homeland women come to be seen as a ‘territory’ to be occupied. The sources of my paper are various women-centric studies undertaken by Indian feminist socio-historians such as Kamla Basin, Ritu Menon, and Urvashi Butalia, who have written extensively on partition violence. Basin, Menon, and Butalia (among other scholars) argue that the primary motive behind violence against women was familial, national, and religious honour. Menon and Bhasin claim that approximately eight to ten million had crossed borders with a death toll of 500,000 to 1,000,000 lives. While Butalia writes in The Other Side of Silence: Voices from the Partition of India that twelve million people migrated and that death counts varied between 200,000 to two million people, it is commonly agreed upon that over a million lost their lives during the exodus. Leonard Mosley estimated that about 100,000 young girls were kidnapped by both sides, forcibly converted or sold on the auction blocks. According to another estimate around 75,000 women were abducted or raped on the both sides of the border. Zia-ul-Islam states that in Eastern Punjab nearly 55,000 Muslim women were abducted. The trauma caused by partition is described beautifully by author Ismat Chughtai in the following words:

“Those whose bodies were whole had hearts that were splintered. Families were torn apart . . . The bonds of human relationship were in tatters, and in the end many souls remained behind in Hindustan while their bodies started off for Pakistan.”

When the attempt was made to understand these women in totality, some questions and issues remained in the minds (i) in the battle between land (state) and rule (governance), the body of the woman is subjected to all atrocities to show power (ii) in patriarchal set-ups, women and their chastity is considered to be the pride and honour of the family but in contradiction, in war and conflict situations, violation of her chastity becomes a powerful tool to show victory over the rival community (iii) woman as an Individual and woman as a category had been neglected and rejected in the entire process of partition/ conflict.

There is no dearth of written material on the Partition of India: official records, documents, private papers, agreements and treaties, political histories, analyses, a few reminiscences. A vast amount of newspaper reportage and reams of government information exist on the resettlement and rehabilitation of refugees from Punjab and Bengal; on negotiations between India and Pakistan, on the transfer of power and the division of assets; and there are hundreds of pages of Parliamentary debates on the myriad issues confronting both countries and both governments. Partition narratives detail the consequences of violent effects and counter responses providing a legitimate critique of the Communal equation in South Asia. But a resounding silence from standard historical narratives of the partition of India of the year 1947 surrounds the question of women during and after the partition. It may seem a truism to say this, but it bears remembering that at least half of the millions who were dislocated, killed or uprooted were women. Urvashi Butalia in her critical memoir on partition titled ‘The Other Side of Silence’ metaphorically titles one of its chapters as “History is a
Woman’s Body,” showing how history was played out on women’s bodies during the partition and how women became passive, suffering subjects of history without being able to claim recognition of their suffering and even ‘martyrdom’. The violence that accompanied partition marked women and women's bodies in particular ways: we know of the rape and abduction that happened on a mass scale, of the cutting off of women's breasts, the tattooing of their bodies. We know too that in many places women were killed by their families, in others they took their own lives, and in some they also participated in the violence.  

When the partition was announced, to most women (as to men) it meant something very vague - something which happened at the level of high politics. They did not have an idea of what would comprise Pakistan and what would be retained in Hindustan. However, soon panic followed. Many innocently believed it to be a temporary feature. As communal frenzy engulfed the Punjab, people were forced to abandon their homelands to move into strange, alien places across the border. It was surprising for women to discover that borders created upon the partition were to be permanent borders. In different styles, they would state that they had assumed that they were fleeing to meet a temporary emergency but would one day return to their homes. Their earlier stock of experience had taught them that temporary migrations were a means of ensuring survival but no one abandons the home forever. The partition of India with its permanent division between two sovereign states was a new concept of territory for them, and consequent to this, the migration to a new world with no possibility of return was totally new in their experience.

Women were not the ones who were deciding their fate, their killing or living or migrating. Women faced violence at various levels; communal, at family level and at the macro level. They were being abducted, kidnapped, raped, and killed. They were forced to commit suicide in order to protect the family honor. Furthermore, in the name of recovery they were disowned by their families, their children were deprived of basic rights as they were considered illegal and wrong.

Thus, this ethnic genocide witnessed two kinds of gender-based violence. Firstly, the violence inflicted on women by men of the opposite religious group that involved kidnapping, rape, and mutilation of the genitalia or public humiliation. The supposed aim of this kind of violence was to abase the men of the rival religion to which the women belonged. A second form of violence against women included the violence inflicted on women by their own family members. This could vary from honour killings to the insistence of male kin that their mothers, daughters, or wives commit suicide in order to safeguard the purity and chastity of the community.

Menon and Bhasin writes, “We begin to discern some specific features of "communal" crimes against women: their brutality, their suffering of extreme sexual violence and their collective nature. The range of sexual violation explicit in the above accounts-stripping; parading naked; mutilating and disfiguring; tattooing or branding the breasts and genitalia with triumphal slogans; amputating breasts; knifing open the womb; raping of course; killing fetuses-is shocking not only for its savagery, but for what it tells us about women as objects in male constructs of their own honour.

Women's sexuality symbolized the opposing "Manhood", its desecrations is a matter of such shame and dishonour that it has to be avenged. Yet, with the cruel logic of all such violence, it is women who ultimately are most violently dealt with as a consequence. The agony of witnessing the near and dear ones dying due to malnutrition, sickness and fight fear of losing home, belongings, dignity and identity wrecked women. There have been numerous cases of honour killing where husbands killed their wives, and fathers killed their daughters to prevent their exploitation by other
communities. The women themselves jumped into wells in groups and threw themselves and their girl children in fires to escape abduction and rape by the enemy. In such a conjuncture when the pre-existing social and political divisions were in the course of acquiring new contours and the contending communities that previously shared the same geo-political territory were engaged in fortifying their shares, women in society were subjected to abduction and mass rape due to their metaphoric association with the land. As the “intensely 'private sphere' of women’s sexuality was deployed in this major re-drawing of the public borders and boundaries” during Partition, the bodies of women became privileged sites on whose surface the political programs of both states were brutally inscribed. Writing from a relief center in Noakhali after the riots, Muriel Lester thus observed: Several of them had to watch their husbands being murdered and then be forcibly converted and married to those responsible for their death [sic]. Those women had a deadlock. It was not despair. Nothing so active as that. It was blackness. 

There were rumors about dismembered bodies, trains loaded with heaps of breasts, screams from mosques and temples. And women weren’t only brutalized—they were encouraged to commit suicide, because death was better than being raped by someone of the “wrong” religion. Both communities asked women to kill themselves before they were “sullied”—before their reproductive capacity was given to the enemy. The logic was simple: kill oneself for patriarchy, pro patria. A woman’s body became a site where one group tried to prove its religious supremacy over the other. Jisha Menon in The Performance of Nationalism: India, Pakistan, and the Memory of Partition explains the relevance of the female body in communal conflict. She states: “The female body served as the terrain through which to exchange dramatic acts of violence. The gendered violence of the Partition thus positioned women between symbolic abstraction and embodiment.” Moreover, when one interprets the symbolic meanings behind various violent acts, one can claim that branding a woman’s body with symbols of the other country or religious group implies that the woman has been tainted by the sinful religious Other. Branding becomes a permanent reminder for the woman, whose shame at losing her honour remains forever ingrained on her body. Bapsi Sidhwa has rightly observed that women were the ‘living objects on whose soft bodies victors and losers alike vent their wrath and enact fantastic vendettas, and celebrate victories’.

Each one of the violent acts mentioned above has specific symbolic meaning and physical consequences, and all of them treat women's bodies as the territory to be conquered, claimed or marked by the assailant. Some acts are simultaneous or continuous (they may begin with stripping or/culminate in raping, branding or tattooing); they may take place in public or market places, temples or gurudwaras, the latter two signifying the simultaneous violation of women and sacred space—or privately, but with families as witnesses. Tattooing and branding the body with "Pakistan, Zindabad!" or "Hindustan Zindabad!" not only disfigure the women for entire life; they never allow her (or her family or her community) the possibility of forgetting her humiliation. Anthropologist Veena Das writes that women’s body became as a sign through which men communicated with each other and the political programme of creating two nations of India and Pakistan was inscribed upon the bodies of women.

Difficult choices were forced upon women who were pregnant or had children with their abductors or companions in order to restore them to their families, and to acceptable social purity. They were led to abortions or to giving-up their children, either to the men who had fathered them or to orphanages. Most often, those women who kept their children did not return to their families and lived in ashram-style institutions as wards of the state. Usually, rape and sexual assault were invariably followed by abduction of the victimised women. These abducted women typically
became domestic servants and sex slaves. Many abducted women were sold into prostitution and some, in very rare instances, were married to their abductors and later claimed to be leading happy and respectable lives. Forceful marriages during the partition upheaval were another dimension of the women sufferings. The women were forced to live with a person whom they were not ready to accept. In certain cases, after being raped or molested, women had to accept their ravishers as their husbands. The issue of abducted women was so widespread that the governments of India and Pakistan established the Inter-Dominion Agreement on November 1947 for the recovery of abducted women from both sides of the border. Recovered women and girls were thrown-out of the Hindu-traditional families. They were ill-treated by all people; their parents did not allow them to rejoin their families. They were frustrated and psychologically depressed; it was inevitable to make the choices of suicide, to lead independent life or inevitably, to become prostitutes.

The programmes for recovering and rehabilitating women to their original homes initiated by governments of both sides have always remained the subject of criticism. These programmes furthered the pain of abducted women who had settled into families of other communities and had children, as they did not want to get uprooted again. Despite the appeal of Jawahar Lal Nehru, the Prime Minister of India, to the people of his country to accept back the abducted women as their intent was as pure as of others, family members of many denied to recognise them due to fear of getting defamed in society. This resulted into 13,133 unattached women and children on Indian side, who were provided shelter at 30 homes. The issues of purity, acceptance, pregnancy, honour and shame, fear of rejection, trust, accepting the fate as it was/is, apprehending the fears and insecurities of future were the factors of refusal. There were instances as Kidwai records when Hindu women had been recovered from Pakistani Muslims, their relatives had refused to take them.

Santokh Singh Dhir wrote in his book ‘Oh Din’ about partition, “The blood soaked body of the woman would be lying on the ground... This happened in the country of Guru and Kabir. Who did this? Their own followers. Mohammad Sahib said that it was wrong to raise a hand on the women and children. But his own followers killed the woman and children with glory and raised the slogans. Where is Mohammad Sahib? His followers have overrun him. Not only Mohammad Sahib there are so many great men. But who cares for their words?”

Another aspect of the partition relating to the women was the recovery operation. On September 3, 1947 leaders and representatives of India and Pakistan met and resolved that steps be taken to recover and restore abducted persons. By September 30, 1957 the number of abducted women and children recovered from Pakistan stood at 10,007 and from India at 25,856. But all the women were not fortunate enough to be accepted by their families. Thousands of women were rejected by their husbands and families and they had no option but to live out their lives in ashrams and brothels. A large number of women had either surrendered to their fate or they were pushed by the patriarchy into the vicissitudes of time. There was fear of rejection by their families and the continuing stigma of being abducted and molested. Women had memories of the events of 1947 that they were forced to suppress, stifle or store away but the literature can somehow liberate these stories from hiding. Given the overwhelming stigma still attached to women who were perceived to have been sexually contaminated by men of ‘other’ community during the sectarian violence that accompanied the partition, it was unlikely that they would ever testify about their experience. In the face of this silence it may well be the task of literary historiography to unveil, uncover, liberate from silence and oblivion, these women’s stories. The significance of the narratives of thousands of brutalized women cannot be undermined. What cannot be shared through
reports, documents, diaries and memoirs can only be narrativized. The absences, silences and
different kinds of psychological deaths of women find essential voice in these narratives. Memory
recreates the inherent fears of the mind, and victimhood becomes the soul of the nation. The stories
are endless, the pain is everlasting, as while talking to these women it seems like yesterday only for
them. Pain is personal and it depends upon the loss (human and material) and their traumatic
experiences. All these women were of the strong opinion that their memories should be preserved and
written and recorded or they will die with them. Public libraries could provide a common platform for
the survivors to get together, exchange notes and these could be recorded along with all personal
information for future generations. However, it can be asserted that within the ideological framework,
women during the partition riots were seldom seen as subjects. These women were treated as objects
through which a community’s idea of purity and pride was orchestrated by controlling their sexuality
and bodies. Hence, the aspect of violence against women during partition not only highlights gender
differences in the Indian Subcontinent but can also be seen as one of the primary examples that
deconstructs Jameson’sxxxvii notion that Third World experiences can all be categorized as one. In fact,
even today, the lives of women in South Asia still continue to unfold in a manner very different to
those of South Asian men. Women’s sexuality, as it had been violated by abduction, transgressed
by enforced conversion and marriage and exploited by impermissible cohabitation and
reproduction was at the center of debates around national duty, honor, identity and citizenship in
a secular and democratic India. The figure of the abducted woman became symbolic of crossing
borders, of violating social, cultural and political boundaries. The extent and nature of violence that
women were subjected to when communities conflagrated, highlights not only their particular
vulnerability at such times, but an overarching patriarchal consensus that emerges on how to dispose
of the troublesome question of women's sexuality.

The question of migrants, and their treatment across the border was a critical factor in shaping the
politics of the two new nations. The influx of migrants from across the border was frequently linked
to a critique of the policies of the neighboring government with regard to their minority
population. Such criticism was voiced particularly strongly by leaders in the provinces of India
and Pakistan, which were the destinations for large numbers of migrants. Both Nehru and Liaquat faced attacks from powerful provincial leaders over how the refugee crisis was to be handled, and threatened the stability of their government.xxxviii

A series of treaties, ordinances, agreements, resolutions, bills and acts were passed during 1947-50
covering various aspects of the transfer of power and populations.xxxix After the exchange of
populations came the exchange of women. Having agreed to an apportioning of assets and a division
of the armed forces, civil services and the CID, India and Pakistan entered into an inter-dominion agreement on December 6, 1947, to recover all women and girls who had been abducted in either
country and restore them to their families: Hindu and Sikh women from Pakistan, Muslim women
from India. In four years, 30,000 women were recovered. In April 1948, an Inter-dominion conference
was convened with the purpose of framing an inter-governmental response to the flow of minorities.
The main issue at the conference related to inter dominion travel along the eastern border. The flow of
travelers across the eastern border needed to be acknowledged, incorporated, and if possible, curtailed
by both the governments. In the discussions, H. M. Patel urged that the question not be addressed ‘in
terms of the prestige of either government’, but rather something which needed to be seen as a ‘big,
human problem.’xxx What was more difficult, however, was finding a compromise acceptable to both sides, as to how the problem could be addressed. A bland Communiqué issued at the end of the conference stated “The Conference met and had a fair and frank discussion on the various issues involved in an atmosphere of cordiality and understanding.”xxxii This, however,
betrayed nothing of the detailed, often combustible, and exhaustive perusal of questions related to the flow of minorities. Afterwards it was felt that a more binding agreement was necessary for satisfactory progress. Accordingly, an agreement was reached between India and Pakistan on 11 November 1948 that set out the terms for recovery in each dominion.xxxii Women were certainly affected by destitution, in one way or the other by the events following the Partition, though their experiences varied. Amidst forced migration, violence, abduction, recovery and readjustments, most of them lost their identity, which was subsumed by identities like ‘community’, ‘religion’ and ‘nationality’. In their memory the predominant picture is one of confusion, dislocation and the severing of roots, as they were forced to reckon with the implication of Independence, which to them meant Partition. It was generally assumed that all abducted women were captive victims and wanted nothing more than to be restored to their original families as soon as possible.xxxiii Despite the urgings of some members that some mechanism be devised to ensure that no unwilling woman was forced to return to her country, Nehru declined to do so. He simply gave a verbal assurance that no compulsion or coercion would be used, and added, ‘I have not come across a single case of an adult abducted woman who had been recovered and who was pushed into Pakistan against her will.’xxxiv

"The policy of abduction as a part of the retaliatory programme has given a setback to the basic ideals of a secular state," said Mridula Sarabhai. Recovered women were seen as missing members of a community, not as adult citizens of a country. The State assumed the role of a parent patriarch and relocated the women where they ‘rightfully belonged’. The only response to forcible abduction, it seemed, was forcible recovery. Since such marriages had been declared illegal, the only way to reconstitute the legitimate family was by dismembering the illegal one and removing the women from its offending embrace. Pregnant women were obviously more vulnerable than others. Kamalbehn told us that lists of all the pregnant women would be made and sent to Jalandhar; there, the women would be kept for three months or so, be given a complete ‘medical check-up’ (a euphemism, we soon learnt, for an abortion, illegal at the time) and only then be presented to their relatives, "because" she said, "if they came to know that the woman is pregnant, they would say, let her stay in the camp and have her child."xxxv Regarding the children borne by abducted women, as Veena Das maintains, the state refused to recognise them as legitimate since they were born of ‘wrong’ sexual unions. As a result, as Patel states, the women were separated from their children, and forcefully if they resisted, with the children being recognised as citizens of countries they were born in and staying with their fathers. She also gives the example of a woman who didn’t want to part from her child but had to for fear of not being accepted by her natal family.xxxvi The women were afraid of being rejected by their families, unwilling to leave their children behind--this is what the Indian government required of all children born of Muslim father--and in no frame of mind for another upheaval. In a curious twist, the governments themselves became abductors. The women were given no choice regarding where they wanted to live or with whom; and no right to decide the fate of their children. Worse, the Abducted Persons (Recovery and Restoration) Bill, was enacted, denying them their rights as citizens--it remained in force till 1956. The recovered women themselves although promised a free environment and liberty were by the very terms of the Bill, divested of every single right to legal recourse. Their marriages were considered illegal and their children illegitimate; they could be pulled out of their homes on the strength of a policeman’s opinion that they were abducted; they could be transported out of the country without their consent; confined in camps against their wishes; and as adult women and citizens, be once again exchanged, this time between countries and by officials.xxxvii It is rather unlikely that we will ever know what exactly abduction meant to all those women who experienced it because it is rather unlikely that they will ever talk of it themselves, directly; society still enjoins upon them the silence of the dead around an event that, to it, was shameful and humiliating in its
In conclusion, it can be said that women’s link to nation not only lies in their biological role of birthing citizens of a country or a religious group, but women are also seen as signifiers of religious/cultural ideology and honor where their bodies operate as ethnic/national boundaries. In the aftermath of partition, much like the Indian Subcontinent, gender itself was territorialized, meaning that “[w]omen’s bodies represented both the inner core of patriarchy — couched in the language of honor and prestige — as well as marking boundaries of social and national reproduction.” In spite of the utter confusion, psychological imbalance, deep pain, emotional strains and losses, women “picked up the pieces” of their lives to adjust to new places. Many women, who had never before stepped outside domesticity, now out of sheer exigencies of survival, joined the workforce after the Partition in a scenario when most of them were not adequately skilled or equipped to undertake the arduous task of sustenance (at times single-handedly). They rose up to act as direct sustainers, carving out new avenues of earning and supplementing family income, to cope up with new challenges. Many of them became dependent on state help who set up various transit camps, relief centers, rehabilitation homes, vocational or training centers and cooperative societies for this purpose. Or still others were helped by various voluntary and social organizations, but most significant were women’s own endeavors to resettle themselves.
References


xii Dey, Arunima, 2016, Violence against women during partition of India: Interpreting Women and their bodies in the context of ethnic genocide, ES. Revista de Filología Inglesa37,p104.


xvi Lester, Muriel Indian Annual Register, Vol. II, 1942, p 199.


Dhir, Santokh Singh, 2004, Oh Din, (New Delhi, Aarsi Publication) (First Published, 1973), pp. 52-53.

Both the Governments entered into an Inter Dominion Agreement. On December 6, 1947 on Inter-Dominion Conference was held at Lahore for the implementation of recovery and restoration: Narinder Iqbal, 1947, Communal Violence in the Punjab, p. 231.


Kannabiran, Kalpana and Ranbir Singh, ed., 2008, Challenging The Rules(s) of Law: Colonialism, Criminology and Human Rights in India, (Delhi, Sage) p 281.

Raghavan, Pallavi, 2012, p-64.


xxxvii Ritu menon 283


MOTIVATING FACTORS AND ITS IMPACT TO THE STUDENTS TO FINISH INDUSTRIAL ENGINEERING PROGRAM AT QUEZON CITY POLYTECHNIC UNIVERSITY

A. M. B. Novesteras & N. C. Apusaga

Department of Industrial Engineering, Quezon City Polytechnic University, Philippines

aurabn@gmail.com, ncapusaga@gmail.com

Abstract: Many freshmen prioritize Industrial Engineering as their course. Motivating factors are highly regarded as significant in the success of the students who pursue engineering program. There are students who manage to finish their course because they wanted to become financially established by getting a profitable job. Motivating factors in this study have an impact on academic performance of Industrial Engineering students. Students are highly motivated to study because they wanted to get a better job in future, they wanted to help their family in the future and they wanted to attain personal growth and development. On the other hand, they are moderately motivated to study when their teacher has the mastery of the subject. Highest educational of parents is found to be significant in the academic achievement of child. The researcher recommends that teachers should enhance academic motivations of students; that they should have the mastery of the subject; and most of all, teacher should learn to acknowledge the work of their students fairly and without favoritism. The school should coordinate with other companies offering on-the–job training to provide graduating students the opportunity to practice the lessons in real life situation and to gain valuable skills for future career.

Keywords: motivating factors, academic performance, engineering, family

Introduction

A. M. B. Novesteras & N. C. Apusaga, aurabn@gmail.com, ncapusaga@gmail.com

Academic motivating factors are highly regarded in all forms of education as an important element. Students are motivated to finish their course if they are inspired and for that reason, most teachers exert efforts to find the way to encourage their students to finish their studies. Moreover, the medium of instruction of a teacher used inside the classroom can motivate a student also. Instructional materials used inside the classroom contribute to the development and understanding of students. The more the students understand the topics, the more challenging for the students resulting to arouse their interest. Moreover, teacher factor is far more important. Students are looking forward in some recognition coming from their teacher so that they will be inspired in their studies since teacher has the power to encourage their students to perform well. According to Afzal, “the students speedily perform their task with their best efforts if they are expecting a reward from their teacher” (Afzal, 2010, p.6). This study was supported by Haider, “that students stand out in the class even in short period of time because of reward” (Haider, 2015, p.17).

To be an effective teacher, strategy in teaching is necessary. It would help students to stimulate their interest. The teacher should be confident with his lectures because it reflects how the students are inspired with their lessons. Thus,” letting the students engaged themselves enthusiastically and
proactively in the class, can translate their constructive motivational states into academic progress” (Reeve, 2013,p.3).

On the other hand, Filipinos have a deep regard for education because of their family. Furthermore, there are some related studies “that parental influence plays an important role in the academic performance of young adults” (Turner, et.al, 2009, p.9). Students’ strongly value their familial status which strengthen them to study hard. On the other hand, other study proved that motivations of learners are towards career and economic enhancement (Gonzales, 2011, p.7).

However, there are lots of college students who tend to dropped or failed in their subjects when they experienced pressure. Thus, low academic performance of students should not be taken for granted. This study aims to determine the different motivating factors that influence a student to finish Industrial Engineering Program.

**Objectives of the Study**

The major purpose of this study is to determine the different motivating factors that influence the graduating students of Industrial Engineering in Quezon City Polytechnic University to finish their course. Specifically, this study aimed to determine the impact of motivating factors to finished Industrial Engineering program; the significant differences in the impact of the motivating factors when respondents are group according to their profile and correlates it to the academic performance.

**Description of Respondents**

The respondents of this study are the graduating students of Bachelor of Science in Industrial Engineering of Quezon City Polytechnic University. They are enrolled in Second Semester of School Year 2017-2018. The sample of the study comprised of one hundred and two (102) males and eighty-six (86) females for a total of one hundred eighty-eight (188) respondents. The respondents belong to legal age ranging from nineteen (19) years old and above.

**Methodology**

The researcher secured a permission letter to conduct a study to the OIC Director of Engineering Department of Quezon City Polytechnic University. In this study, a descriptive survey method was employed to determine the significant impact of motivating factors in the academic performance of graduating Industrial Engineering students.

The participants who qualified as respondents of the study must be a graduating student enrolled in Bachelor of Science in Industrial Engineering in 2nd Semester for the School Year 2017-2018. The researcher explained the nature of survey questionnaire and the purpose of the study and its benefits. The respondents were informed that the data will be treated with utmost confidentially whereas the personal identification and data together with their general weighted average will be kept secret.

The data were gathered by means of distributing the questionnaire to the respondents. The instrument utilized in this study was a survey questionnaire that is divided into three (3) parts. The first part of the instrument is the questionnaire that corresponds to the demographic profile which contains the characteristics of the respondents such as age, gender, highest educational attainment of respondents’ parents and monthly income of their parents. The second part of the instrument is the motivating
factor that has an impact in the academic performance of the respondents. The motivating factor is divided into five (5) parts such as the personal factor, instructional factor, teacher factor, family factor and desire for career factor. Academic performances of the graduating Industrial Engineering students were measured by getting the mean average of the General Weighted Average for 2nd Semester of school Year 2017-2018.

The data collected were clarified, tabulated and encode in excel for tally. For the analysis of data, the following statistical tool were utilized; frequency and percentage distribution, weighted mean, t-test, analysis of variance and correlation.

On the scale for measuring the motivating factors, a five point scale were used to interpret the motivations of the respondents; 1 for Poorly Motivated, 2 for Slightly Motivated, 3 for Motivated, 4 for Moderately Motivated, and 5 for Highly Motivated.

**Result and Discussions**

This part discusses and interprets the data collected through the instrument employed by using statistical tools. Primary source of data for this study came from the questionnaire distributed to the respondents that were enrolled in Industrial Engineering for SY 2017-2018.

As shown in Table 1, there are 188 respondents in this study. Male are 54 percent and 46 percent are female. This study shows that not only male has the courage to take engineering courses. Even females have interest in engineering course. Contradicting to the study of Ayub that “there is a gender difference in motivations between male and female in terms of academic motivating factors” (Ayub, 2010, p.5)

In terms of highest educational attainment of respondents’ mother, Table 1 showed that most mothers are High School graduates which is equal 40 percent, mothers who are college graduates is equal to 22 percent. Mothers who are College undergraduates are equal to 19 percent. Mothers who are High School undergraduates and Elementary graduates are both equal to 6 percent. Succeeded by mothers who are Elementary undergraduate which is equivalent to 5 percent. Mothers with undergraduate of master degree, graduate of master degree and undergraduate of doctoral degree got the lowest which is equal to 1 percent.

As seen in Table 1, most of the respondents’ father is a High School graduate, college graduate with a percentage equal to 45 percent and 22 percent respectively, succeeded by fathers who are college undergraduate which is equal 14 percent, there are fathers who are elementary and high school undergraduates with a percentage equal to 7 and 6 percent, elementary graduate is 4 percent. On the other hand, there are fathers who finished Master Degree and Doctorate Degree which both are equal to 1 percent only.

From Table 1, almost half of respondents’ parents have an income ranging from ₱10,000 to ₱20,000 which is equivalent to 40 percent, followed by parents earning an income below ₱10,000 which is equivalent to 28 percent. Parents who have an income ranging from ₱20,001 to ₱30,000 are equivalent to 27 percent. Lastly, are parents having an income of above ₱30,000 which an equivalent percent of 5 percent only. Results showed that respondents’ parents belonged to low income bracket.
Table 1: Demographic Profile of the Respondents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>19 y/o</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20 y/o and above</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>102</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>86</td>
<td>46%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Highest Educational Attainment of Mother</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Doctoral Graduate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctoral undergraduate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters Graduate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters Undergraduate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Graduate</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Undergraduate</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>19%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-School Graduate</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-School Undergraduate</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Graduate</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Undergraduate</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Highest Educational Attainment of Mother</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Doctoral Graduate</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctoral undergraduate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters Graduate</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters Undergraduate</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Graduate</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College Undergraduate</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-School Graduate</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High-School Undergraduate</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Graduate</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Elementary Undergraduate</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Monthly Income of Parents</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BELOW 10,000</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10,001-20,000</td>
<td>76</td>
<td>40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20,001-30000</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30,001 AND ABOVE</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Impact of motivating factors showed that students are highly motivated to study because they wanted to attain personal growth and development (WM=4.71) and they have a positive outlook in life (WM=4.69), whereas, they are moderately motivated to study because they want to explore their knowledge (WM=4.46), they know they can attain good results (WM=4.43) and they have full interest of the subjects (WM=4.40).

In terms of Instructional Factors, respondents are moderately motivated to study because the activities inside the classroom arouses and challenge them (WM=4.42), they have the opportunity to practice (WM=4.39), the instructions used are easy to understand (WM=4.38) and lessons calls their attention (WM=4.38) and lastly, the lessons are related in real life situation (WM=4.34).

In terms of Teacher factors, respondents are moderately motivated to study because the teacher has the mastery of the subject (WM=4.45), their teacher encourage them to appreciate their work (WM=4.44), their teacher expect better from them (WM=4.42), their teacher acknowledge their work (WM=4.40), and last, their teacher is unbiased in giving grades (WM=4.35).

Respondents are highly motivated to study because they like to help family in the future (WM=4.86), parents are expecting they will finish the course (4.82), they do not want to disappoint their parents (WM=4.80), parents support them in their study (WM=4.76), and it is recommended by parents (WM=4.53).

Moreover, respondents want to get a better job in the future (WM=4.87), to gain valuable skills for future career and to enhance job prospects both tied up (WM=4.81), to get qualified in a job (WM=4.80), to prepare for future career (WM=4.78).

Based on the results of the general weighted average, male has rank first with a mean general weighted average of 82.74% followed by female with a mean general weighted average of 82.62%. Both male and female tied up with a qualitative description of average.

Table 2: Significant Differences in Motivating Factors among Respondents when Group According To their Profile

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Factor</th>
<th>Instructional Factors</th>
<th>Teacher Factor</th>
<th>Family Factors</th>
<th>Desire for Career Factor</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>0.074</td>
<td>0.055</td>
<td>0.174</td>
<td>0.198</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>0.333</td>
<td>0.169</td>
<td>0.242</td>
<td>0.005</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest Educational Attainment of Mother</td>
<td>*0.007</td>
<td>0.313</td>
<td>0.765</td>
<td>0.133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest Educational Attainment of Father</td>
<td>*0.042</td>
<td>0.655</td>
<td>0.807</td>
<td>0.807</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Income of Parents</td>
<td>0.761</td>
<td>0.502</td>
<td>0.159</td>
<td>0.662</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Legend: *Significant at P<0.05

As seen in Table 2, the highest educational attainment of mother (p=0.007) and the highest educational attainment of father (p=0.042) have a significant differences. It means that the parents with higher educational achievements have a positive influence in the academic achievement of their
children. This result of this study is similar to the study of Turner et.al that “parents who are highly educated influence their children to perform well” (Turner et.al, 2009, p.9). In terms of instructional factors, there is no significant differences in the impacts of motivations to respondents whatever profile they have and whatever instructional methods or materials are being used in the classroom. “Many or most of engineering students are visual, sensing, inductive and some are active” (Fedler, 2002, p.9). In this manner, there is a need for sufficient instructional materials to meet the expectations of the students. Thus, “to increase the instrumentality the program should create a stronger sense that the project is closely related to what Industrial Engineer’s do in the real world” (Lanigan, 2009, p.67). This study revealed also that there is no significant difference in the impacts of motivations to the respondents in terms of teacher factor. Respondents are motivated to study when teacher acknowledge their work; unbiased in giving grades; has the mastery of the subject; when teacher encourage students to appreciate their own work and when teacher expects better from them.

Table 3: Correlation between the Motivating Factors and Academic Performance of Industrial Engineering Students in Quezon City Polytechnic University

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Motivating Factors</th>
<th>r</th>
<th>Qualitative Description</th>
<th>Decision</th>
<th>Interpretation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal Factor</td>
<td>0.165</td>
<td>Very Low</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructional Factor</td>
<td>0.458</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teacher factors</td>
<td>0.626</td>
<td>Moderate</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Family Factor</td>
<td>0.992</td>
<td>Very High</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desire for Career</td>
<td>0.860</td>
<td>High</td>
<td>Reject</td>
<td>S</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Significant at P<0.0, Legend: ±1.00 Perfect Relationship, ±0.91 - ±0.99 Very High Relationship, ±0.71 - ±0.90 High Relationship, ±0.41 - ±0.70 Moderate Relationship, ±0.21 - ±0.40 Low Relationship, ±0.01 - ±0.20 Negligible Relationship, 0 No Relationship

Table 3 presents the correlation between the motivating factors and academic performance of the respondents. Family factor (r=0.992) and academic performance is proven to have a very high correlation, Desire for Career (r=0.860) has a high correlation with the academic performance, Teacher factor (0.626) and Instructional Factor (0.458), both have a qualitative description of moderate relationship, lastly Personal factor (0.165) has a very low correlation. All of these
motivating factors found to have a significant relationship with the academic performance of the respondents.

**Conclusion**

This study shows that not only male has the courage to take engineering courses. Even females have interest in engineering course. The respondents are highly motivated to finish their course because they want to get a better job in the future, they like to help their family in the future and they want to attain personal growth and development. On the other hand, students are moderately motivated to study because their teacher has a mastery of the subject, the activities given by their professors aroused their interest and challenged them. There is no significant difference in the influence of motivating factors of the respondents in terms instructional factors, teacher factor, family factor and Desire for career factor, on the other hand, there is significant difference in educational attainment of parents. Moreover, family factor has a very high correlation in the academic performance of the respondents.

**Recommendation**

The researchers recommend that teachers should enhance academic motivations regardless of students’ personal profile. Teachers should have the mastery of the subject to stimulate students’ motivations; and most of important of all; the teacher should learn to acknowledge the work of their students fairly and without favoritism. The school should coordinate with other companies offering on-the-job training to provide graduating students the opportunity to practice the lessons in real life situation and to gain valuable skills for future career. The school should coordinate with other companies offering on-the–job training to provide graduating students the opportunity to practice the lessons in real life situation and to gain valuable skills for future career. It is also recommended that universities should provide appropriate orientation for their students about the possibility of career prospects and make students aware of the possibility of developing valuable qualifications and skills required for their desired careers.
References


Lanigan, D., 2009, Increasing student motivation to become a successful Industrial Engineer. Clemson University, 8-2009, dlaniga@clemson.edu.


Radi S. M., 2013, Baccalaureate Nursing Students’ Motivation for Attending University and its Relationship with their Academic Achievement, *International Journal of Education and Research, Vol. 1 No. 7*


Tuladhar, R., 2011, For engaging and motivating Engineering students to induce deep learning and understanding through contextual and multisensory teaching and learning approaches. 2011 Citations for Outstanding Contributions to Student Learning


### Appendix

Appendix A: Questionnaire for “Motivating Factors that Influence the Students to Finish Industrial Engineering Program at Quezon City Polytechnic University

#### Questionnaire for “Motivating Factors that Influence the Students To Finish Industrial Engineering Program at Quezon City Polytechnic University

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Profile</th>
<th>Instructional Factors</th>
<th>Teacher Factors</th>
<th>Family Factors</th>
<th>Desire for Career Factors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>I am motivated to finish my study.....</td>
<td>I am motivated to finish my study.....</td>
<td>I am motivated to finish my study.....</td>
<td>I am motivated to finish my study.....</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year Level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highest Educational Attainment of Parents:</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Father</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monthly Income of Parents</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instruction: Put a check (*) on the rating that you consider appropriate to each question.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highly Motivated</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moderately Motivated</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slightly Motivated</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poorly Motivated</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal Factors</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I am motivated to finish my study.....</td>
<td>5 4 3 2 1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Because I have full interest in the subject</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Because I want to explore my knowledge</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Because I know I can do and I can attain good results</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Because I want to attain personal growth &amp; development</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Because I have a positive outlook in life about learning</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

86
IMPACT OF ELECTRONIC CONTROL (E-CONTROL) ON EMPLOYEES’ PERFORMANCE IN JORDANIAN BANKS

F. M. Qawasmeh & E. F. Qawasmeh

Business Administration Department, Faculty of Economics and Business, Jadara University, Jordan, Drfaridqawasmeh@yahoo.com, Fareed@Jadara.edu.jo

Abstract: The main aim of the study is to explore the relationship between electronic control and efficiency of employees’ performance in Jordanian banks. It also aims to investigate possible obstacles that may face Jordanian banks and hampers the application of efficient control on employees’ performance. The population includes all employees in seven selected major Jordanian banks operating in Jordan. Questionnaires were distributed randomly to 225 employees in the selected banks, 99 of whom returned them fully completed (response rate = 44%). The study found a significant statistical impact of e-control motives, benefits and uses on employees’ performance in Jordanian banks. The study recommends that Jordan banks should take care of e-control systems to reflect the growing nature of banking operations.

Keywords: electronic control, controlling, employees’ performance, jordanian banks, jordan

1. Introduction

The use of computer networks and systems nowadays has widely expanded into numerous fields such as the field of management activities in all types of businesses. Users as well as employees use computers to carry out their daily job tasks, be it routine and non-routine tasks. Planning activities, administrative tasks, budget preparations, report writing are few examples of work activities that need computers and software to accomplish.

Based on the necessity of computers usage in the workplace, electronic control has become very vital and should be applied. Capable human controllers and inspectors as well are urgently needed to carry out electronic control tasks.

According to Jones and George (2003), the application of electronic control, utilization of information technology within the work context intend to improve performance standards, achieve accuracy of results, minimize risk that face both controllers and inspectors without the need to directly interact with the staff, and gain wide range of benefits.

Control is regarded as one key function of management. Through control, we can achieve work objectives in a way that respect agreed-upon work principles and policies. In addition, Laudon and Laudon (2004) claim that control plays an important role in all management levels, be it top, middle, and lower level management levels. In this regard, control is viewed as a tool to check whether work is in accordance with stated plans and regulations, and determine the weaknesses so as to cure it and prevent its reoccurrence.

2. Importance of the Study

The study importance stems from the following points:
**The importance of the subject since it addresses very sensitive subject in the management process.**

**The impact on results that contribute to the development of control systems and guarantee the speed of task accomplishment.**

**The wise selection of the study population, Jordanian banks. Banks are the most accurate economic entities through its transactions that require very efficient control so as to maintain high level of performance and guarantee quality of outcomes by the use of information technology, and avoid direct communication between employees and inspectors.**

**It enables build up dependable data banks to be a solid reference for future purposes.**

### 3. Objectives of the study

- The main aim of the study is to explore the relationship between electronic control and efficiency of employees’ performance in Jordanian banks.
- To investigate possible obstacles that may face Jordanian banks and hampers the application of efficient control on employees’ performance.
- To investigate the need of Jordanian banks for electronic control.
- To investigate top management compliance of electronic control application.

### 4. Problem Statement

The study problem stands out to attempt to be aware of obstacles that hinder the effectiveness of electronic control on employees’ performance in Jordanian banks. The faulty concept of electronic control application might cause inefficiencies that lead to disadvantages of performance. This in return calls for applying new methods and control tools suitable to the line of business and the qualifications of employees. Accordingly, the study problem focuses on the following key question:

**Key Question**: What is the relationship between electronic control and employees’ performance in Jordanian banks?

1. What are the tools and methods of electronic control on employees’ performance in Jordanian banks?
2. How effective is electronic control in enhancing the level of employees’ performance?
3. Do Jordanian banks need electronic control?
4. How absent is electronic control in Arab banks?
5. Is electronic control important according to bank managers’ point of view?

### 5. Study Hypotheses

1. There is a significant statistical impact at the level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) of the motives of using electronic control on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.
2. There is a significant statistical impact at the level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) of the Benefits of E-control on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.
3. There is a significant statistical impact at the level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) of the Uses of E-control on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.
4. There is a significant statistical impact at the level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) of E-control challenges and counter measures on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.

### 6. Study Methodology

This study is set to be descriptive analytical type of study, thus it explains and analyzes concepts relevant to control, performance and relationship between them. And then explores the effect of
electronic control and its role in enhancing efficiency and performance of Jordanian banks’ employees. A questionnaire was developed for this purpose as shown in appendix (1).

7. Theoretical background

Recent and successive development in information technology using computers has affected management and accounting systems in almost all types of companies. (Laudon & Laudon, 2004). Such development, as a result, has deeply affected the style and methodology of internal and external auditing. The personal characteristics of reviewers and auditors have also been affected by such development.

Control is a management tool that guarantees the right flow of work both efficiently and effectively so as to achieve the set objectives. Henry Fayol (1916) defines control as a way of making sure that everything is according to preplan, formal instructions, and agreed upon principles, and the aim of control is to diagnose faults and weak spots, cure them, and prevent them from reoccurring, and control is imposed on things, people and procedures.

In the words of Robbins and Coulter (2016): “Control is the process of monitoring activities to ensure that they are being accomplished as planned and correcting any significant deviations."

Controlling as a function of management is of great value and importance in a business organization to ensure that the actual state of affairs of a business is along the lines of what is expected to be. One of the most obvious benefits of controlling function is that it provides the accurate information which is what is wanted for effective decision making process as well as maintaining effective functioning state of a business. Control is not just limited to determine whether or not the plans are being adhered to, but it also leads to identify the reasons of deviations and to take corrective actions accordingly. (Simons, 1990).

Controlling means validating if the activities occurring are in confirmation with the actual plans prepared and accepted, instructions issued and principles established. The controlling function also helps in the effective and efficient application of enterprise resources in order to accomplish the planned goals. Controlling gauges the deviation of actual performance from the planned performance, establish the causes of such aberrations and helps in adopting corrective actions. (Hill & Mcshane, 2008).

Thus, controlling can be defined as a managerial function to ensure that activities in an organization are performed according to the plans. Controlling also ensures efficient and effective use of organizational resources for achieving the goals. Hence, it is a goal oriented function. (Robbins and Coulter, 2016).

Controlling is thus a very important and integral part of everyday management. It is a process that helps ensure business success and stability and cannot be separated from other functions. This is because the planning effectiveness and all other functions are gauged and understood through the process of controlling.

Controlling is the process of assuring the performance as per standard. (Hill & Mcshane, 2008). It is the comparison and verification process of the actual performance with the standard performance. It also analyzes whether the actions taken are as planned and taking corrective action. (Al-Alaq, 2008).
It is known as the key to management for implementation of plan in actual field. It also prevents and corrects deviation from plans.

E-control is based on using computers in practicing control processes according to computer programs solely designed for this purpose so as to achieve economy of scale in efforts, time, and cost to get to conclusions with least risk and accuracy. (Chalykoff, & Kochan, 1989). The importance of control stems from the following points:

- The absence of efficient control system leads to increased higher costs.
- Efficient control systems encourage superiors to delegate authorities to subordinates.

The use of computers to eliminate problems associated with manual systems in the processing of data, and to take advantage of the advantages achieved by internal control systems such as accuracy and symmetry, the computer is more accurate than humans in the processing of data and the implementation of similar operations in a symmetrical, and does not have the motives of treason or lack of loyalty to the Foundation. (Chalykoff, & Kochan, 1989).

The audit process also plays an important role in complementing other administrative functions, both in terms of the optimal use of the resources available to the establishment, and in terms of trying to determine the efficiency of management. It seeks to achieve the desired objectives. (Simons, 1990).

Controlling is an important function of management which all the managers are required to perform. In order to contribute towards achievement of organizational objectives, a manager is required to exercise effective control over the activities of his subordinates so as to motivate people to achieve their goals. (Flamholtz E. G 1996).

The objectives of the controlling function in an organization stems from the following key objectives and benefits (Abbas, 2003); (Malmi and Brown, 2008): Accomplishing organizational goals, judging accuracy of standards, making efficient use of resources, improving employee motivation, ensuring order and discipline, facilitating coordination in action, guides in achieving goals, simplifies supervision, delegating authority effectively, correcting action, smoothing operation of the organization, minimizing cost, and better planning.

According to (Zoltán Zéman, Roland Gacs, János Lukács, László Hajós, 2013), the controlling tasks are as follows:

- Improving accounting system towards management accounting.
- Planning – strategic planning and operative planning.
- Plan-fact analysis -cost analysis, income analysis, risk analysis, expected future trend analysis.
- Information provision: managerial information system development of reporting system with an appropriate IT support.

8. Previous Research

Several studies were reviewed and summarized in this section.

This study investigates the effects of electronic payment platforms on bank performance. The sample consists of the fourteen [14] deposit money banks listed on the Nigerian Stock Exchange Market. The study period ranged from 2012 to 2017, respectively. This study used the Sortino index, which is a single index performance indicator. Findings of the study include the following points:

1. The point of sale (POS) has an increased effect on the performance of banks on the exchange.
2. An increase in the use of POS machines raises the visibility and coverage of banks.
3. The advent of mobile banking has brought positive effects on bank performance.
4. The Online (Web) medium of electronic payments has increasing effects on bank performance.


The objective of this study is to determine the effect of e-banking on the profitability of commercial banks. The population of the research consists of the 43 commercial banks in operations as at end of 2014 in Kenya. Results from multiple regressions indicate that there is a positive significant relationship between ATM transactions and bank profitability. A unit increase in ATM transactions leads to an increase in ROE (bank profitability) by 1.662 units. The study recommends that commercial banks increase their ATM networks and encourage the use of payment cards at POS terminals.


Using panel cross sectional data of 13 private commercial banks over the period of 2003–2013, this study empirically investigated the impact of e-banking on the performance of Bangladeshi banks measured in terms of Return on Equity, Return on Assets and Net Interest Margin. Results indicate that e-banking contributes positively to banks’ Return on Equity. This study encourages other banks in developing economies who have not adopted e-banking yet to introduce such banking system in order to experience improved profitability as revealed in this study.


This study investigated the profitability performance of Nigerian banks following the full adoption of electronic banking system by utilizing secondary data extracted from the Nigerian Stock Exchange Fact Books and published annual reports of four sampled banks.

The study revealed that the adoption of electronic banking has positively and significantly improved the returns on equity (ROE) of Nigerian banks. On the other hand, e-banking has not significantly improved the returns on assets (ROA) of Nigerian banks. The study recommends that banking industry should adjust to full and effective deployment of information technology due to its sophistication since the technology is irreversible with relative perceived advantage.

The study aims to explore the controlling function of the Syrian central bank on the Islamic banks in Syria in terms of credit and debt data. Syrian International Islamic bank was the target bank of this study. The financial data relates to the bank’s annual report of 2007-2008. The results indicate that the central bank has full control on the Islamic bank in terms of debt and credit using traditional tools of controlling.


This laboratory study aims to assess effects of electronic performance monitoring on individuals working on computers in an office-like environment. Participants (N = 108) worked on a computerized data correction task under six experimental conditions that varied the amount of control over performance monitoring and knowledge concerning specific monitoring events. Results confirmed to relate personal control, satisfaction, and performance. Participants with the ability to delay or prevent electronic performance monitoring indicated higher feelings of personal control and demonstrated superior task performance. Participants with exact knowledge of the occurrence of monitoring expressed lower feelings of personal control than those from whom specific knowledge of monitoring was hidden.

- Alhodaithi (1993). Assessment of Jordanian banks internal control that use computers in their controlling function.

The study findings are as follows:

- There is a weakness in the application procedures of organizational control regarding access to and security of banking data.
- There is a modest control on documentation, development, and control over operations and internal control.
- There is a high level of control application on inputs and outputs.
- Medium care is shown regarding control carried out internally, while care is minimal regarding external control.
- Modest care is shown in regular assessment of internal control whether done internally or externally.

9. Statistical Analysis and discussion

Sample and Population

In order to effectively examine the relationships between e-control and employees’ performance through its four dimensions (motives of using e-control, benefits of e-control, uses of e-control, and e-control challenges and counter measures), we chose seven major banks operating in Irbid district of Jordan as our target population. These banks are: Housing Bank, Arab Bank, Jordan Commercial Bank, Audeh Bank, Islamic Bank, Islamic Safwa Bank, and Jordan Kuwaiti Bank. A sample of (225) elements representing all administrative and academic positions was randomly selected. Only (99) questionnaires were suitable for analysis. The effective response rate was approximately 44%.

Internal Consistency
The reliability of the measurements was evaluated by Cronbach alpha coefficients. The scales of all measures appear to produce internally consistent results; thus these measures are deemed appropriate for further analysis because they express an accepted validity and reliability in this study. Table 1 shows the results for Cronbach alpha coefficients. As indicated in the table, the value ranged between (0.88-0.86) indicating more than acceptable measurement reliability.

*Table (1): Internal Consistency factors using Cronbach Alpha (N=99)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>No of items</th>
<th>Internal Consistency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Motives of using Electronic Control</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of E-control</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uses of E-control</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>0.82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-control challenges and counter measures</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0.86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Overall E-control</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Participants**

Questionnaires were distributed to 225 employees in the selected banks, 99 of whom returned them fully completed (response rate = 44%).

As shown in table (2), (62.6 %) of the respondents are men. The overwhelming majority of respondents are aged 30-less than 40 years (n=99, 44.4%). Table (2) shows the rest of demographic data of respondents.

*Table (2): Demographic Variables: Frequencies and percentages (N=99)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>total</th>
<th>Percent (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>62.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>37.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Age</td>
<td>20-less than 30 yrs.</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>43.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>30-less than 40 yrs.</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>44.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More than 40 yrs.</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>12.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>Diploma</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bachelor</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>70.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Higher education</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experience (yrs.)</td>
<td>1-less than 5 yrs.</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>41.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5-less than 10 yrs.</td>
<td>45</td>
<td>45.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>More than 10 yrs.</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>13.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>99</td>
<td>100.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Hypothesis Testing and Discussion

**First Hypothesis**: There is a significant statistical impact at the level (α≤0.05) of the motives of using electronic control on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.

This hypothesis is tested by extracting means and standard deviations of respondent’s answers to all eleven questions of the motives behind using electronic control. One sample t-test is also being carried out to test the hypothesis. Table (3) shows the results.

*Table (3): Means and Standard Deviations of e-control motives at Jordanian Banks (N=99)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>E-control helps improve work and enhances awareness of performance gaps.</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>E-control helps enhance bank performance.</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>0.83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>The use of e-control limits risks that employees may encounter.</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>E-control positively supports the proper selection of employees so as to have the right person in the right position.</td>
<td>3.89</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>E-control enhances the seriousness of work.</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>1.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>E-control enhances employees’ confidence in the bank’s incentives scheme.</td>
<td>3.77</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>E-control enables employees refer to historical data.</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Flexibility of e-control permits professionals detect gaps in the bank service processes.</td>
<td>3.83</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>E-control saves managers’ and supervisors’ times and efforts.</td>
<td>3.69</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>E-control is regarded more efficient than traditional control.</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>The use of e-control (i.e. code-readers) enhances bank’s performance.</td>
<td>3.77</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table (3), the item “E-control positively supports the proper selection of employees so as to have the right person in the right position” scored highest with (3.89) mean. Next, the item “Flexibility of e-control permits professionals detect gaps in the bank service processes” came in the second rank (3.83). While the item “E-control enhances the seriousness of work” came last (3.65). As a whole e-control motives mean scored (3.74).

*Table (4): Means and Standard Deviations of T-Test of the impact of E-control motives on employees’ performance in Jordanian Universities (N=99)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>Degrees of freedom</th>
<th>Sig. (p-value)</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E-control motives</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>13.47</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Accept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In order to examine the difference between the sample mean of e-control motives with a predefined population mean (3.0)\(^1\), one sample t-test was conducted. The 1-sample t-test compares the mean score found in an observed sample to a hypothetically assumed value. That is, testing a sample mean against a pre-defined theoretical assumed value (3.0). As shown in table (4), the sample mean is (3.74) which is greater than (3.0), and the significance p-value is below (0.05) at 95% confidence intervals, the obtained t-value is (13.47), degrees of freedom is (98), thus hypothesis 1 is accepted.

**Second hypothesis:** There is a significant statistical impact at the level (\(\alpha\leq0.05\)) of the Benefits of E-control on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.

This hypothesis is tested by calculating means and standard deviations of respondent’s answers to all eleven questions of the benefits of e-control. One sample t-test is also being carried out to test the hypothesis. Table (5) shows the results.

*Table (5): Means and Standard Deviations of e-control benefits at Jordanian Banks (N=99)*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>Electronic tools help apply e-control mechanism.</td>
<td>3.60</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>E-control gives reliable feedback that helps configure causes of problems in order to restrict them in the future.</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>E-control helps management distinguish capable employees from lazy ones.</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>1.02</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>E-control helps take suitable actions in favor of neglected employees.</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>1.13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>E-control encourages employees to develop their skills and attain new skills.</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>There is an impact of e-control systems on the bank’s market share.</td>
<td>3.40</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>Top management relies heavily on e-control in taking strategic decisions.</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>E-control is capable of monitoring internal financial transactions accurately.</td>
<td>3.68</td>
<td>0.98</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>E-control reinforces employees’ self-control.</td>
<td>3.66</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>E-control corrects deviations in the right time.</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>1.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>E-control limits manipulations of periodic reports results.</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Benefits of E-control as a whole | 3.61 | 0.61 |

As shown in Table (5), the item that says “E-control helps management distinguish capable employees from lazy ones” scored first (3.75). In the second rank, the item “E-control limits manipulations of periodic reports results (3.74). In the last rank, the item “E-control helps take suitable actions in favor of neglected employees” has a moderate mean value (3.36). The overall mean is (3.61).

---

\(^1\) The hypothesized value of 5-Likert scale equals 3 as calculated in this equation: (1+2+3+4+5)/5=3
**Table (6): Means and Standard Deviations of T-Test of Benefits of the impact of E-control on employees’ performance in Jordanian Universities (N=99)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>Degrees of freedom</th>
<th>Sig. (p-value)</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Benefits of E-control</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>9.95</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Accept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table (6), the t-value is (9.95) and it is statistically significant (p-value is less than 0.05). Thus, the relevant hypothesis is accepted.

**Third Hypothesis:** There is a significant statistical impact at the level ($\alpha \leq 0.05$) of the Uses of E-control on employees’ performance in Jordanian commercial banks. This hypothesis is tested by calculating means and standard deviations of respondent’s answers to all nine questions of the uses of e-control. One sample t-test is used to test the hypothesis. Table (7) shows the results.

**Table (7): Means and Standard Deviations of Uses of E-control at Jordanian Banks (N=99)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>E-control motivates employees to do their best in offering bank services.</td>
<td>3.53</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>E-control helps achieve high levels of service accuracy.</td>
<td>3.65</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>E-control enhances participation in decision making and problem solving</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>E-control allows holding employees accountable of their work and authority.</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>Ongoing control challenges reflect banks willingness to enhance performance standards.</td>
<td>3.73</td>
<td>0.89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>Banks management uses electronic operations and control templates when sending data.</td>
<td>3.48</td>
<td>0.79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>E-control systems allow banks carry out annual performance comparisons.</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>E-control is capable of yielding quick internal process results.</td>
<td>3.62</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>Continuous updating of security systems is normal in our bank.</td>
<td>3.59</td>
<td>0.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Uses of E-control as a whole</strong></td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table (7), the item “Ongoing control challenges reflect banks willingness to enhance performance standards” scored first (3.73). While the item “E-control enhances participation in decision making and problem solving” scored second (3.70). In the last place, the item “Banks management uses electronic operations and control templates when sending data” scored (3.48) mean. The overall mean of the dimension is quite medium (3.61).
Table (8): Means and Standard Deviations of T-Test of the impact of Uses of E-control on employees’ performance in Jordanian Universities (N=99)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>Degrees of freedom</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uses of E-control</td>
<td>3.61</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>10.19</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Accept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table (8), the t-value is (10.19) and it is statistically significant (p-value is less than 0.05). Thus, the relevant hypothesis is accepted.

Fourth Hypothesis: There is a significant statistical impact at the level (α≤0.05) of E-control challenges and counter measures on employees’ performance in Jordan commercial banks.

This hypothesis is tested by calculating means and standard deviations of respondent’s answers to all thirteen questions of the e-control challenges and counter measures. One sample t-test is used to test the hypothesis. Table (9) shows the results.

Table (9): Means and Standard Deviations of E-control challenges and counter measures at Jordanian Banks (N=99)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>E-control banking data backup is carried out on regular basis.</td>
<td>3.42</td>
<td>1.17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>In case of power shortages, the bank provides redundant power supplies to guarantee continuity of operations.</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Our bank uses different e-control systems such as thumb or eye recognition to monitor employee check ins and outs.</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>0.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>E-control reduces managerial costs compared to traditional control requirements (i.e. staff and accessories).</td>
<td>3.70</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Lack of personnel and materials cause deteriorations of e-control application.</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>1.01</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Lack of awareness of e-control objectives and styles is one obstacle of the control function.</td>
<td>3.72</td>
<td>1.07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Individual conflicts and self-interests may cause malfunction of the bank control system.</td>
<td>3.57</td>
<td>0.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Bank managers fully understand the nature of e-control systems.</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>0.91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Mutual Agreement of bank managers regarding e-control objectives has been achieved.</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>0.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Bank overall performance has enhanced compared to last year indicators.</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The bank market share has improved compared to last year indicators.</td>
<td>3.93</td>
<td>0.92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Profit objectives have been achieved.</td>
<td>4.00</td>
<td>0.88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Return on investment is satisfactory in our bank.</td>
<td>3.87</td>
<td>0.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>E-control challenges and counter measures as a whole</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>0.60</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As shown in Table (10), the t-value is (12.21) and it is statistically significant (p-value is less than 0.05). Thus, the relevant hypothesis is accepted.
Table (10): Means and Standard Deviations of T-Test of the impact of E-control challenges and counter measures on employees’ performance in Jordanian Universities (N=99)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimension</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>T Value</th>
<th>Degrees of freedom</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E-control challenges and counter</td>
<td>3.74</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>12.21</td>
<td>98</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td>Accept</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

9. Results

The results of the study are summarized in the following section:

1. There is a significant statistical impact of e-control motives on employees’ performance in Jordanian banks.
2. There is a significant statistical impact of e-control benefits on employees’ performance in Jordanian banks.
3. There is a significant statistical impact of e-control uses on employees’ performance in Jordanian banks.
4. Several challenges and problems may face banks in the application of e-control systems.

10. Recommendations

Based on the study findings, the following recommendations are suggested:

- To take care of e-control systems to reflect the growing nature of banking operations.
- To enhance the use of e-control systems as a tool of monitoring employees in the workplace.
- To do further relevant studies on a wider scale (bigger sample size, and cover more banks in the kingdom of Jordan).
- Jordanian banks should be able to accept the level of risk that they can cope with in electronic banking system, measurable to the bank’s overall strategic and business plans.
- Provide adequate security both physically and electronically to check the incidence of hacking by fraudsters.
- Banks management should from time to time train customers with regard to electronic banking, its benefits, risk exposure, physical and electronic security to avoid financial loss in the hands of hackers.
- Banks should shower more investment in the provision of the POS electronic payment channels, as this will heighten their profit and performance in the short to medium term.
- Jordan commercial banks should also partner with retail outlets like supermarkets and other service providers to increase the use of banking services at point of sale terminals.
11. References


## Appendix (1)
### Questionnaire

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Item</th>
<th>Strongly agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly Disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Motives of using Electronic Control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>E-control helps improve work and enhances awareness of performance gaps.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>E-control helps enhance bank performance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The use of e-control limits risks that employees may encounter.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>E-control positively supports the proper selection of employees so as to have the right person in the right position.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>E-control enhances the seriousness of work.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>E-control enhances employees’ confidence in the bank’s incentives scheme.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>E-control enables employees refer to historical data.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Flexibility of e-control permits professionals detect gaps in the bank service processes.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>E-control saves managers’ and supervisors’ times and efforts.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>E-control is regarded more efficient than traditional control.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>The use of e-control (i.e. code-readers) enhances bank’s performance.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Benefits of E-control</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Electronic tools help apply e-control mechanism.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>E-control gives reliable feedback that helps configure causes of problems in order to restrict them in the future.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>E-control helps management distinguish capable employees from lazy ones.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>E-control helps take suitable actions in favor of neglected employees.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>E-control encourages employees to develop their skills and attain new skills.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>There is an impact of e-control systems on the bank’s market share.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Top management relies heavily on e-control in taking strategic decisions.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>E-control is capable of monitoring internal financial transactions accurately.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>E-control reinforces employees’ self-control.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>E-control corrects deviations in the right time.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>E-control limits manipulations of periodic reports results.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>E-control motivates employees to do their best in offering bank services.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>E-control helps achieve high levels of service accuracy.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>E-control enhances participation in decision making and problem solving</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>E-control allows holding employees accountable of their work and authority.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Ongoing control challenges reflect banks willingness to enhance performance standards.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Banks management uses electronic operations and control templates when sending data.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>E-control systems allow banks carry out annual performance comparisons.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>E-control is capable of yielding quick internal process results.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Continuous updating of security systems is normal in our bank.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>E-control challenges and counter measures</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>In case of power shortages, the bank provides redundant power supplies to guarantee continuity of operations.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Our bank uses different e-control systems such as thumb or eye recognition to monitor employee check ins and outs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>E-control reduces managerial costs compared to traditional control requirements (i.e. staff and accessories).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Lack of personnel and materials cause deteriorations of e-control application.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15
Lack of awareness of e-control objectives and styles is one obstacle of the control function.

Individual conflicts and self-interests may cause malfunction of the bank control system.

Bank managers fully understand the nature of e-control systems.

Mutual Agreement of bank managers regarding e-control objectives has been achieved.

Bank overall performance has enhanced compared to last year indicators.

The bank market share has improved compared to last year indicators.

Profit objectives have been achieved.

Return on investment is satisfactory in our bank.
THE WORLD CAFÉ IN CREATING A CULTURE OF MARKETING AT A PRIVATE INSTITUTION OF HIGHER LEARNING: A CASE STUDY

Carol Sutcliffe

Helderberg College of Higher Education,

sutcliffeC@hbc.ac.za
THE WORLD CAFÉ IN CREATING A CULTURE OF MARKETING AT A PRIVATE INSTITUTION OF HIGHER LEARNING: A CASE STUDY

Abstract: As a contemporary approach to bringing about positive change, the World Café model was applied to a group of 45 staff members at a private institution of higher learning in January 2019, as part of a staff development colloquium. The goal of the intervention was to create a culture of marketing among the staff and students, with a view to improving the financial sustainability of the institution. The aim of this case study was to investigate how and to what extent the World Café session contributed towards the development of a marketing culture among staff participants. Whereas research on the World Café model suggests it is a good approach to build collaborative management, this study evaluated the effectiveness of the World Café model in developing a sense of responsibility among participants for the implementation of organizational change. With very few empirical studies having been done on the use of the World Café model, a goal of this study was to produce a robust empirical study on the topic. In this case study, primary data from a focus group discussion with 12 staff members, representative of all departments and faculties involved in the original World Café session, as well as a second set of primary data from seven personal/electronic interviews, were collected five months following the WC session. The data were categorized according to the 13 themes that emerged when the staff responses at the World Café session were analyzed. The results are discussed according to these 13 themes, representing all aspects of the operations at the selected institution. The data collected suggests that the World Café intervention served to ignite a culture of marketing among staff and students. These results could encourage other private institutions of higher learning and non-profit organizations to use the World Café model to bring about positive organizational and social change.

Keywords: marketing culture; the World Café (TWC) design principles; TWC method; conversational leadership

Introduction

Two decades of research have investigated the concept of the World Café (TWC) in bringing about meaningful conversations, with a view to positive change. For example, The United Nations International Children’s Emergency Fund (UNICEF) has adopted this model in dealing with international conferences when implementing or seeking innovative, safe solutions to the plight of disadvantaged children in over 190 countries (Arivananthan, 2015). Garfield (2018) confirms that a key example of effectively managing and processing knowledge is the World Café Model. This model has been employed by companies across the globe and serves as an eloquent workshop method for involving all internal and external stakeholders in valuable conversations about the company itself. The model accommodates groups from as small as twelve to two thousand (User Participation, 2019).

Bradbury (2015) deals with the use of the World Café in various action research settings. The World Café Model of conversational leadership is a model which harvests the collective intelligence or wisdom of all employees by way of providing a relaxed conversation context for answering questions that matter to everybody involved. This model engages the participation of all, in bringing about lasting solutions to organizational and broader social challenges (Harley & Brown, 2009).

There is a need in the broader corporate world for management which is participative with regard to engaging the collective intelligence of all employees. Indeed, modern-day employees demand a voice and democratic treatment on all levels of organizational life (Angelopulo & Barker, 2013). There is a need for leaders who are able to facilitate intelligent conversations among all staff members (Brown &
Isaacs, 2005). There is a need to capitalize on and manage the knowledge, skills and experience which each employee brings to the table (Angelopulo & Barker 2013). According to Klev and Levin (2016), most meetings tend to simply pacify many of the individuals present. The World Café is a simple method which somehow energizes larger groups of people. It brings people from different parts of an organization together in a fresh way, and teaches them new communication skills, by virtue of the unique way it is arranged.

The World Café model offers a powerful approach to managers, which if utilized correctly, could make a culture of marketing much easier to adopt. Research applications of the World Café method, meet many of the needs expressed above, leading to the effective functioning and sustainability of the organization (Bradbury, 2015).

In reviewing the literature, the existing research on The World Café, starting from the first work in 2001 (a doctoral thesis by Juanita Brown) to date (2019), was evaluated with a view to addressing the question of how the World Café model might be employed to promote a culture of marketing at a private institution of higher learning, using a qualitative approach. Clear guidelines were generated as to how an educational institution may be transformed into an environment where the majority of staff participate in promoting the institution in one way or another, by way of applying the TWC model. This model has been shown by researchers such as Brown and Isaacs (2005) and Brown and Hurley (2009) to be effective in bringing about positive organizational change by way of conversational leadership. “What we are discovering”, according to Brown and Isaacs (2005, p 2), “is that the talking – the network of conversations – actually catalyzes action.”

Significantly, if this qualitative evaluation of the extent to which staff perceive and experience the World Café model as an effective method of developing a culture of marketing is positive, the model could be applied in a similar way at other educational institutions or even non-profit organizations, with a view to enhancing their staff participation in various areas of operation, thereby helping to ensure their financial sustainability, as well as improve staff morale in general.

**Literature Review**

The literature review investigated how the World Café Method has been used effectively in case studies and action research projects, to bring about sustained organizational change. The groundbreaking classic work on the World Café (Living Knowledge Through Conversations That Matter) was performed by Juanita Brown in her doctoral dissertation in 2001. This work, although it does not state it in these terms, shows clearly how the World Café method may be used to encourage a more participative approach in organizations.

A major contribution of Brown’s (2001) research findings is that it demonstrates the ability of the World Café method to support conversational, collaborative learning and leadership in large groups of up to 1 200 persons. According to Faris (2014), a World Café session in Tel Aviv on 10 September, 2011, attracted over 2000 participants to discuss Israel’s future.

The research findings suggest a second unique contribution of the World Café method - its capacity to make more visible the role of conversation as an essential process for organizational change. Viewing organizations as dynamic and living networks of conversation, provides creative opportunities to come up with innovative strategies, bring about organizational learning, and develop leaders through the sharing of collective intelligence (Brown, 2001).

As one of the few examples referring directly to how principles of the World Café Method may be employed in achieving a culture of marketing, McDonald’s founder posed the big question: “How can we assure a consistent hamburger for people who are traveling on the road?” Simply by asking that searching question, the company took the company to its dominant market position (Brown, Isaacs & Margulies (1999). The books and articles mentioned below make clear links to other successful applications of the World Café method.

Bradbury (2015) makes reference to how the World Café Method improves participation in organizations, communities, educational institutions, hospitals, etc. (Bradbury, 2015).

Fullarton and Palermo (2008) demonstrated clearly that TWC is superior to Large Group Facilitation as an evaluation tool in an educational context. This study shows how the World Café model could be useful to manage complexity within organizations by way of a participative approach.

Klev and Levin (2016) emphasize that participative learning and developmental processes are critical in bringing about organizational change. These authors suggest a style of learning and development that results in a self-sustaining developmental process, which is an integral part of the daily life of the organization. In accordance with the World Café method, this process develops options for action in order to achieve goals, followed by collective reflection on the results achieved. Reflection on one’s own practice can contribute to significant improvements, but may also contribute to new practices and new understanding. Thus, the World Café method could potentially be used successfully in creating a culture of marketing at a private institution of higher learning, if adequate collective reflection is given to the results.

An example of a study which emphasizes the participatory and collaborative nature of the TWC conversational leadership model, is reported by Kotze, Seedat, and Kramer (2013, p. 494) who reported: “The [World Café] conversations were considered to have created a participative environment in which community members and external stakeholders could discuss potential solutions to identified problems, thereby laying a foundation for future action. Additionally, the conversations were interpreted as promotive of relationship-building and collaboration opportunities…”.

The preliminary literature review gives evidence of the researchability of the problem, notably how The World Café model may be employed to bring about greater participation of staff in promoting a particular private institution of higher learning, thereby transforming the organization and making it financially sustainable.

Research Problem

The research problem may be phrased in this way: How may the World Café model, as a comprehensive modern management tool, be employed in creating a culture of marketing at a private institution of higher learning?

Sub-problems

The research problem may be broken down into the following sub-problems:

How do the participants in the study understand the term “a culture of marketing”? After a World Café session on the topic of creating a culture of marketing, what has management done to bring about this goal at the selected institution? What evidence have participants seen as to a culture of marketing having been created on the campus as a result of the World Café session held in January? What commitments have participants in the study made to generate a culture of marketing at the institution in
the future? What best-practice guidelines may be derived from the study, for creating a culture of marketing at a private higher institution of learning?

Research Design

Research approach

A qualitative approach was used, since this is a descriptive case study, based on an interpretative paradigm. Because limited research has been performed on the World Café Model, this leaves much room for descriptive investigation and analysis of a qualitative nature.

A cross-sectional approach was employed, as secondary and primary data were collected within a time-frame of six months, during January and June, 2019, respectively.

Unit of analysis and sampling

The unit of analysis is a focus group of 12 staff members, which comprises a purposive sample, since the participants were selected on the basis of their interest in the study and/or their involvement in marketing the institution. They were intentionally recruited to represent all of the departments and faculties (du Plooy, 2017). The 12-member focus group was fully representative of all of the departments and faculties involved in the original World Café session, and largely representative of the race groups and genders which were involved, thus:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Admin-</th>
<th>Cafeteria</th>
<th>Arts</th>
<th>Business</th>
<th>Theology</th>
<th>IT Department</th>
<th>Library</th>
<th>Maintenance</th>
<th>Management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Race group representation (with the two personal interviews and five electronic interviews taken into account): eight Europeans; two Indians; seven Coloureds; two Blacks.

Gender representation: eleven males; eight females.

Sampling saturation was reached when no more individuals responded to the call for electronic interviews to be completed.

Method of data collection

As an application of the World Café method, the session held as part of a staff development colloquium in January, is described below:
Groups of four to six gathered in the cafeteria, which had been recreated into a Café atmosphere with brightly coloured table cloths, flowers, eats and drinks and soft music. A large piece of poster paper and coloured pens and crayons were provided on each table. The purpose of the procedure was explained, and The World Café design principles and method briefly described. The staff were given two questions to address in their “conversation rounds”:

1. Describe what you would like to see at this institution for students to enrol
2. In which ways could you help prospective students make this institution their varsity of choice?

The coordinator asked the participants to respond to these questions by writing, drawing or making designs on the poster paper. Each group moved to another table after a 15 minute-session, of which there were three in total. With each move, the “table host” was left behind to explain to the new group what had been done by the previous group. During the last “conversation round”, each group returned to their original table to regroup and sum up their responses to the questions. Then a feedback (“harvest”) session was conducted, in which the table hosts presented their posters to the whole group and gave a short account of their answers to the two questions, and stuck up their posters for all to see (https://theworldcafe.com).

Finally, the coordinator handed out sticky papers and asked the participants to write down personal commitments as to how they would contribute towards creating a culture of marketing, and stick them on the flip charts available. The drawings, diagrammes and notes which the participants had put down on their “table-cloths”, as well as the personal commitments were then collected and carefully typed up by the researcher. Certain themes became apparent, based on the repeated patterns which emerged. See Analysis of Findings.

The researcher observed the implementation of the World Café model at the staff development session in January 2019. She faithfully collected the responses and commitments of the participants, and organized them to share with management. She has retained these artifacts, as well as photographs of the event as evidence, which will serve as secondary data for the study. Primary data were collected using a follow-up focus group with selected staff who participated in the January World Café session. The case study focus group where centred on what occurred at the World Café session. Categories were created by grouping similar responses together. These categories doubled as themes for a thematic analysis. In addition, informal observations of the researcher before, during and after TWC session were noted.

Data collection instruments and technologies

The questions which were discussed by the focus group may be found under Main Findings, below. The full Focus Group Moderator Guide is available on request.

A voice recorder was used to record the entire focus group session, as well as the two personal interviews. The focus group session was also videographed by a professional videographer (files available on request). Transcriptions of the focus group discussion, as well as the personal and electronic interviews, are also available on request.

Analysis of findings

Two-phase process of analysis was employed: In the first phase the key themes were derived based on the data contained in the artefacts generated through TWC. These were used to guide questions for further exploration in the focus group discussions, which were then analysed in the second phase to build a deeper understanding of the original themes.

Codes have been assigned to the categories, for ease of interpretation:
Table 1  Categories and Codes for Thematic Analysis of Data

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORIES</th>
<th>CODES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>MARK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public relations</td>
<td>PR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recruitment</td>
<td>REC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Customer service</td>
<td>CS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Registration</td>
<td>REG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>FIN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Campus life</td>
<td>CL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cafeteria</td>
<td>CAF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academia</td>
<td>ACAD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programmes</td>
<td>PROG</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spirituality</td>
<td>SPIR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sport</td>
<td>SPOR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Commitment</td>
<td>COMMIT</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Synthesis of data

The data from TWC session and from the follow-up focus group were summarised, then categorized and coded, using the above categories and codes. The final step was to interpret the data by way of a thematic analysis, using the above categories (themes). The results were synthesised in the form of a list of best practice guidelines for the application of TWC in bringing about a culture of marketing at a private institution of higher learning, at the end of Main Findings, below.

Ethical considerations and limitations

The proposal for this study was approved by the Research Coordinating Committee of the institution involved (document available on request). Since the researcher works at the institution involved in the study and is also an active member of the marketing committee, she was particularly aware that her desire to promote a culture of marketing could colour her perceptions and influence her interpretations so as to present the institution in a favourable light, and possibly exaggerate her findings in a subtle way.

To ensure reflexivity, the researcher continually monitored the research process according to accepted protocols, and engaged the oversight of an expert researcher at regular intervals. The researcher also remained conscious of her own impact on the research results, and intentionally guarded against subjective interpretation of the data.

Credibility of the study is assured by the fact that the study was piloted beforehand and that the findings are made public in an objective manner, avoiding bias and one-sidedness, by reporting the findings as accurately as possible, and by making sure interpretations are as close to the emic perspective of the participants as possible (through empathy and member checks). The researcher assures the reader that there is no misrepresentation of facts, concealment or distortion of the truth, or fabrication.

Trustworthiness was ensured by using triangulation of data collection methods (focus group, interviews and observation), and by making sure that the data was rendered truthfully and interpreted accurately in accordance with the data collection and analysis procedures specified. Thereby, confidence may be had in the findings (du Plooy, 2017). The secondary data was scrutinised by the full senate, who acted as a critical analytical team to ensure the trustworthiness of the data collected at the World Café session.

Informed consent was gained from all of the subjects who participated in the focus group to be conducted in June 2019, for the collection of the primary data (document available on request). The participants were assured that they would remain anonymous and that the greatest care would be taken not to implicate them in any references which will be made in the published report. They were each given a number, which they stated each time they spoke, to anonymize the data. If names were mentioned by the participants, the transcription rendered the name as [any colleague].

To establish inter-coder validity, a second researcher was employed to make sure that the data was correctly coded, according to the selected categories and codes.
Empirical evidence by way of quotations are included in the discussion, and photographs demonstrating the design principles in action are included in Appendix 1, to substantiate the analytic findings.

For future studies, it may be advisable to gain the informed consent of all of the participants in the World Café intervention before the case study begins, so that the data collected during the intervention may be used as primary (as opposed to secondary) data, along with the data collected during the focus group and interviews.

Aim and Objectives

The overall aim of this study was to investigate, by way of a case study, how the World Café model may be employed to promote a culture of marketing at a private institution of higher learning.

The specific objectives of the study were to perform a rigorous review of published literature; to find references to the successful application of the World Café model in bringing about positive change in organizations; to use the secondary data collected from a World Café session with the staff of a private institution of higher learning, together with the primary data collected from a follow-up focus vehicle; to establish how TWC session contributed towards a culture of marketing; to establish whether the World Café application worked and what about the process was effective in helping to achieve a culture of marketing at the selected institution, and to develop best practice guidelines based on published research and the results of the study, for bringing about a marketing culture, in service of proactive organizational change and the financial sustainability of an institution of higher learning.

Main Findings

The study found that an application of the World Café model did indeed make an impact in terms of generating a culture of marketing among the staff at a private higher institution of learning. Furthermore, staff were prepared to commit to the recommendations they had made themselves and take ownership of sustaining a culture of marketing in the organization.

Note that the findings are organized according to the sub-problems, which largely replicate the questions which the participants answered. Exact quotations are given in support of the findings.

- How do the participants in the study understand the term “a culture of marketing”?

There is a general understanding among the participants that a culture of marketing means a sharing of the marketing function among all of the staff. For example: “Culture of marketing means that the institution as a whole should be involved in the marketing of HCHE. It means that marketing is not
the sole responsibility of the marketing department, but students, staff, lecturers should be involved in the marketing of the institution”.

This particular understanding of a culture of marketing as every staff member being “aware of the importance of marketing and playing their part”, and “where every member is responsible in varying capacities for the successful marketing of the College” could arguably stem from the briefing which the facilitator gave before the World Café session. Nonetheless, it is evident from the quotations above and those in the transcriptions, that the participants are largely in agreement that they are all responsible in some way for marketing the institution.

- After the World Café session on the topic of creating a culture of marketing, what has management done to achieve this goal?

The staff are in agreement that much has already been done by management since TWC session, to promote a culture of marketing. More than one participant mentioned the financial incentives which have been given to staff and students to recruit for the College: [Management] “made incentives available for staff who successfully assisted in increasing enrolment, i.e. R1500 per student”. “As with the incentives given to students to market the College, when there are new students they get 20% discount.”

Four respondents mentioned the new road as a major effort by management to achieve its marketing goal. According to one focus group participant: “Now the inauguration of the road was not just a new road. It was a massive PR effort. It’s the first time I’ve seen something of that scale at the College”. Further examples of managements actions mentioned by participants included:

“Voting Day booth. New road (donation) on TV Sports channel. Arts Faculty branded shirts. Branded items at assembly for students. Visit other churches on 17 August 2019”. “New programmes applied for. Financial information on other sources of funding have been given to students in need. Employment of a working marketing force. Publicity through the initiative of the Irvin Khoza Road on YouTube. Involvement of new staff members to go and promote the College.”.

- What evidence have you seen as to a culture of marketing having been created on the campus as a result of the World Café session held here in January?

The responses of the participants give ample evidence of a culture of marketing developing on the campus. For example: “Appointment of project managers, increased optimism among faculty, more focused activities to aid marketing objectives”. “[P]eople are now aware of the role that they must play despite their busy schedules and they have understood that this is important. I see a little degree more of involvement of more participation in marketing, especially Faculty of Arts – they have really come on board and other staff members in non-teaching departments are also beginning to come on board. They are certainly willing to go out and recruit and I feel that we have made significant progress”. “All the different faculties now have Facebook pages. I’m even doing one for the canteen so everybody has a chance now to do some sort of digital marketing …. So I think that is also very sustainable and a great initiative that the faculties are taking to market themselves rather than rely on Helderberg to market them as a whole”.

- Give specific examples of how you have been personally involved in bringing about a culture of marketing at this institution.

In the words of four participants: “The website of the College needed updating, I along with the committee for website development are actively involved in its development to international standards”. “In my own data collection process for my PhD, I’ve spoken at a number of different schools when promoting my own research to learners at high schools”. “I sent brochures via Facebook and WhatsApp
to promote the business faculty”. “Wherever I go, if I have an opportunity to stay back and be at that church to promote Helderberg, I will ensure that what we discuss there is being implemented and supported with finances”.

- Give specific examples of how other staff members or students have been involved in bringing about a culture of marketing at this institution.

Participants cited many examples of involvement by other staff members and students, for example: “Passive marketing of the College by wearing branded shirts bearing our logo thus showing pride and a willingness to market in whatever capacity they can”. “Hectic recruitment takes place from August onwards. So we will see implementation of those plans from August onwards. “Staff and students have actually been in my office quite a bit …. Staff and students I think are doing a really great job at this moment when it comes to taking initiative with marketing”. “Yes, the road, the gym, the football field, the conversion of the room in the Theology building, the aud’s that were all upgraded. These are actually remarkable things that are happening ….”. “Attending and actively promoting College at camp meetings and … youth conventions”.

- In the future, how do you plan to follow up on the commitments you made at the World Café session, in building a marketing culture at this institution?

The considerable number of heartfelt commitments made by the staff were the most encouraging aspect of the study. For example: “I plan to market the soon to be created Helderberg International Language Center of Influence to international markets in order to evangelize and promote the College and thus create an international presence”. “What I pasted up on the board at the end of the session was to refrain from any negative talk directed towards the institution when in company. Basically working on the principle of rather building up, than breaking down”. “Word of mouth. The Health Expo for Theology students next year. That is one thing that I will be involved in. And Education Day 17 August 2019”. “Run the pizza oven project”. “I would love to be the brand ambassador for Helderberg College in my personal capacity. Be willing and available and sometimes volunteer to go and promote the College. Wear branded clothing in public spaces. Enter a race for HCHE (maximum 15 km). This is something I have purposed in my heart to do”.

- Which best-practice guidelines may be derived from the study with respect to how a culture of marketing might be created by way of the World Café model?

1. Management should realize the importance of supporting the marketing efforts of the staff by leading the way from the start and providing the necessary financial means.
2. Management must communicate regularly with the staff with regard to its marketing plans.
3. Request staff to make personal commitments to take ownership of the changes which they would like to see.
4. Train staff to recruit or perform promotional functions.
5. Make marketing material available to staff.
6. Hold follow-up World Café sessions to consolidate what has been achieved, in which management and staff take a reflective stance.
7. Management should ensure that it puts into practice the suggestions of the participants.
8. Make it a priority to address the needs of the students (the customers). Otherwise all marketing efforts are doomed to failure.

9. Provide exciting and memorable experiences. This will encourage the students (and staff) to post positive content on social media platforms.

10. Use the Facebook feedback features in order to capitalise on a social media footprint for marketing purposes.

**Discussion**

The study has demonstrated how a marketing culture may be brought about by way of The World Café model, and generated 12 best-practice principles. Using this unique conversation leadership approach and the collective intelligence of all employees, rich data were collected from staff representing all departments and faculties. Clearly the World Café session made a tangible and visible difference, as evidenced by the many personal accounts of growth and change, and specific examples of improvement mentioned by the participants. The most heart-warming result of the study was the overwhelming number of commitments the staff made to help build a culture of marketing at the institution. These commitments were freely given at the initial World Café session, as well as at the focus group and interviews. The level of participation may be described as highly cooperative. Moreover, the vast majority of staff were prepared to take responsibility for creating a culture of marketing at the institution. In general, the researcher observed that an improved staff morale and positive attitude among staff was evidenced by a number of commitments to become brand ambassadors for the institution, and to take care to speak only positively of the institution in future.

These results may be explained against the background of TWC model which emphasizes the powerful sense of commitment which occurs when a safe space is created for everyone’s contributions to be acknowledged and appreciated (Brown & Isaacs in Seng, Kleiner, Roberts, Ross & Smith, 1994).

As long as these results are measured in terms of follow-up sessions and evaluation of Facebook page statistics, and as long as management abides by its commitments to support staff members to fulfill their personal commitments and encourage staff participation – and most importantly – reflect on and follow up on the results – the culture of marketing at this institution could be sustainable. In the words of Hurley and Brown (2009, p.6), “Research and best practices in every sector are demonstrating that successful outcomes and measurable results are more likely when we bring the voices of all key stakeholders to bear on critical issues using face-to-face … technologies carefully chosen to foster effective solutions.” The World Café model is just such a “face-to-face technology”.

The World Café is only one of a plethora of similar collaborative approaches (such as Appreciative Inquiry, Open Space, Scenario Planning and Future Search), which stimulate interactive conversations within organizations of many kinds (Hurley & Brown, 2009). The literature gives evidence that the conversational leadership approach expressed in the World Café model, may be used effectively to assist non-profit organizations, which are struggling with ways to gain the participation of employees in promoting the organization, thereby making it financially sustainable.
References


Arivananthan, M., 2015, WORLD CAFÉ: Dynamic iteration on key discussion questions.


Faris, L., 2014, The World Café: we are wiser together. An interview with Amy Lenzo, Director of World Café Learning Programs. The Collaborative Services Blog.


**Appendix 1: Figures**

![Coordinator observing World Café session. Design principles in action: set the context; create hospitable space.](image)
Figure 2 Participants engaging at World Café session. Design principles in action: explore questions that matter; encourage everyone’s contributions.

Figure 3 Participants listening intently to each other at World Café session. Design principles in action: listen together for insights; connect diverse perspectives.
Figure 4 Feedback session (the "harvest") at World Café session. Design principle in action: share collective discoveries.